

DIVERSITIES WITHIN POST-WAR PHILIPPINE PROTESTANTISM

Floyd T. Cunningham, Ph.D.

INTRODUCTION

Today Philippine Protestantism reflects a kaleidoscope of various denominations. The founders of Protestantism in the country around the turn of the century did not plan it to be that way. They hoped for one united church. They established comity arrangements that stood for 50 years. But harmony in the pre-war period was not as strong as it was perceived to be, and gave way to a flood of new denominations as well as sectarian rivalries after the Second World War.⁵⁵

It is tempting but dangerous to divide this kaleidoscope of Protestant groups into two parties.⁵⁶ Just as in the United States, there are two large blocks of Protestants. Certain denominations are affiliated with the World Council of Churches-oriented National Council of Christian Churches of the Philippines, and others with the Philippine Council of Evangelical Churches, which has ties to the World Evangelical Fellowship. Just as within American Protestantism, denominations affiliated with either of these ecumenical bodies were richly diverse in tradition and theology. Missouri Synod Lutherans, the Salvation Army and Independent Methodists have affiliated with both groups. Seventh Day Adventists, one of the largest Protestant groups in the Philippines, joins with NCCP-affiliated denominations in its theological education. The Christian and Missionary

⁵⁵ R. Pierce Beaver, *Ecumenical Beginnings in the Protestant World Mission: A History of Comity* (New York: Thomas Nelson, 1962), 136-140.

⁵⁶ *Reforming the Center: American Protestantism 1900 to the Present*, eds. Douglas Jacobsen and William V. Trollinger, Jr. (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1998). See especially the .Introduction., 1-14, and David E. Harrell, Jr., .Bipolar Protestantism: The Straight and Narrow Ways., 15-30. Compare Timothy L. Smith, .The Evangelical Kaleidoscope and the Call to Christian Unity, *Christian Scholar.s Review* 15 (1986): 125-140.

Alliance, one of the first groups to enter the Philippines after the Spanish American War, abided by comity arrangements early in the century, but affiliates with the PCEC. Many Protestants, including Southern Baptists and some Fundamentalists, stand apart from either organization. In addition, there are large and growing local bodies with few historic ties to other denominations.

Between the NCCP and PCEC churches there are many commonalities. Almost all have historical roots in American denominations. Within both groups there are both conservative evangelistic impulses and strong social concerns. Why, then, do the denominations affiliated with these groups stand separately? The answer lies in the roots of the denominations and their history in the Philippines.

PROTESTANT UNITY BEFORE THE WAR

The ecumenical goals that motivated many Protestants in the early part of the century were predicated upon a sense of common mission. When cooperation occurred, it was often accompanied by dissent among those who emphasized denominational distinctives. Other dissenters in the early part of the century objected to the polity of the mission-led denominations and to the leadership of Americans. It soon became apparent that both doctrines and polity would keep Protestants apart. Dissent to the goals of unity in the early part of the century foreshadowed the post-war groups, which often themselves had begun through schisms in other denominations.

Protestantism began with a great deal of unity as well as optimism. In early April 1901, three Presbyterian missionaries in the Philippines invited members of other denominations to a conference to discuss the possibility of comity arrangements. Representatives included those from the Methodist Episcopal Church, the Evangelical United Brethren Church, the (Northern) Baptist Church, the Christian and Missionary Alliance, the Free Methodist Church, the British and Foreign Bible Society, and the American Bible Society, as well as the Presbyterian Church. The group advised ways by

which each denomination might direct policies and methods so as eventually to produce one united Protestant church.⁵⁷

An Evangelical Union was formed April 26, 1901. It recommended that local Protestant churches call themselves “The Evangelical Church” (with the denomination name in parenthesis below it), a term that, at the time, was synonymous with “Protestant.” The Union established regional boundaries for the Methodist, Presbyterian and EUB missions, giving the Methodists the provinces between Manila and the Gulf of Lingayen: Bulacan, Pampanga, Tarlac, Zambales, Nueva Ecija, and Pangasinan. The EUB was assigned the provinces of La Union, and Ilocos Norte and Sur. The Presbyterians received the provinces of Rizal, Cavite, Laguna, Batangas, Camarines North and South, Albay and Sorsogon on Luzon, and the islands of Panay and Negros. At an August 1901 meeting the Baptists and Disciples of Christ were assigned areas. The Baptists were to divide Panay and Negros with the Presbyterians. Though the Disciples of Christ refused to bind themselves to comity, they worked by agreement in the vicinity of Vigan in northern Luzon, and in an area south of Manila.

The Evangelical Union redrew boundaries in a January 1902 meeting. Methodists received additional area in the Cagayan Valley (Nueva Vizcaya, Isabela and Cagayan provinces), and the EUB was assigned Bontoc, Lepanto and Abra provinces. Benguet was to be divided between the Methodists and the EUB. In 1903 the Methodists were reassigned Abra Province, and the EUB took Ambuyan. By this time the Baptists claimed all of Panay as well as Negros Occidental, and the islands of Romblon and Palawan. Together Baptists and Presbyterians supported a hospital in Iloilo. The Presbyterians established themselves in Samar, Leyte, and Cebu as well

⁵⁷ Kenton Clymer, *Protestant Missionaries in the Philippines, 1898-1916: An Inquiry into the American Colonial Mentality* (Urbana: U. of Illinois Press, 1986), 7. The Free Methodists were represented by two Free Methodist public school teachers, Mr. and Mrs. Herbert Damon. They were soon transferred to India, and the denomination did not return to the Philippines until after the Second World War, when, again, it sought to work by comity arrangements. See Ruby Schlosser and Gertrude Groesbeck, eds., *Lighting the Philippine Frontier* (Winona Lake, IN: Woman.s Missionary Society, Free Methodist Church, 1956), 23.

as in parts of Panay and Negros. The Congregationalists, meanwhile, were assigned Mindanao and worked in the eastern portion. Though the Christian and Missionary Alliance never joined the Evangelical Union, it cooperated with comity arrangements that placed it in western Mindanao.⁵⁸

While evangelizing in different localities, Protestants spoke quite unanimously on a variety of moral and social issues in the early part of the twentieth century. On many issues, they opposed American colonial policies. For instance, missionaries objected when the government proposed the legalized importation of opium into the Philippines. Protestants proposed to eliminate prostitution, dance halls, intemperance, work and recreation on Sunday, usury, obscene postcards and gambling. Many Protestants joined the “Moral Progress League” formed by Methodists in 1906 to put pressure on the government on these and other moral issues.⁵⁹

Although Protestants agreed, of course, with the separation of church and state, and found this to their advantage, they came out of a historical background in which Protestants were attempting to mold and manage American culture. Protestants considered themselves guardians or custodians of American standards of decency and in the United States were increasingly successful in introducing laws, such as those pertaining to the buying and selling of liquor, that would compel conformity to their morals. They were optimistic that society was redeemable, that it could be made

⁵⁸ Enrique C. Sobrepena, *That They May be One* (Manila: United Church of Christ in the Philippines, n.d.), 13-14; Beaver, *Ecumenical Beginnings*, 137; Peter G. Gowing, *Islands Under the Cross: The Story of the Church in the Philippines* (Manila: National Council of Churches in the Philippines, 1967), 127-128; Schumacher, ed., *Readings in Philippine Church History*, 313-314; Clymer, *Protestant Missionaries in the Philippines*, 33-36, 42; Anne C. Kwantes, *Presbyterian Missionaries in the Philippines: Conduits of Social Change (1899-1910)* (Quezon City: New Day, 1989), 51-57; T. Valentino Sitoy, Jr., *Several Springs, One Stream: The United Church of Christ in the Philippines*, vol. 1: *Heritage and Origins (1898-1948)* (Quezon City: United Church of Christ in the Philippines, 1992), 321-327.

⁵⁹ Frank C. Laubach, *The People of the Philippines: Their Religious Progress and Preparation for Spiritual Leadership in the Far East* (New York: George H. Doran, 1925), 398-402; E. K. Higdon, *Why Protestantism in the Philippines?* (N.p., [1937]), 17-18; Clymer, *Protestant Missionaries*, 167-171.

more like the Kingdom of God. They carried that optimism with them to the Philippines, where, they hoped, with the right colonial administration, Protestant values might even be more easily imposed than in the United States.⁶⁰

There were some successes. Justo Lukban, a Methodist, served as Mayor of Manila from 1917 to 1920. He was a medical doctor, trained at the University of Santo Tomas, and had served in both the Malolos Congress and the National Assembly. He helped in the formation of the Nacionalista Party, which championed independence. As mayor of Manila, Lukban was, according to one Presbyterian, “Cromwellian.” He abolished dance halls in the city limits. Once Lukban rounded up and deported all of the prostitutes in Manila, sending them to Davao, where, he was assured, there were men willing and waiting to marry them.⁶¹ The Evangelical Union set up a Prohibition Committee. Protestants regretted in this instance that the US Constitution did not follow the flag, and that alcohol in the Philippines was able to be manufactured and sold even after the 18th Amendment made it illegal to do so in the United States after 1919. The missionaries criticized

⁶⁰ In addition to Clymer, *Protestant Missionaries*, 19-21, see Mariano C. Apilado, *Revolutionary Spirituality: A Study of the Protestant Role in the American Colonial Rule of the Philippines, 1898-1928* (Quezon City: New Day, 1999), 61-77. See Aaron I. Abell, *The Urban Impact on American Protestantism, 1865-1900* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard U. Press, 1943), 185, 193, 246, 251, which demonstrates how Protestants in the United States related to immigrants during the years prior to missionaries coming to the Philippines; and, on reform tactics taken by Protestants during the 1890s, see James R. Gusfield, *Symbolic Crusade: Status Politics and the American Temperance Movement* (Urbana, IL: U. of Illinois Press, 1963), 87-110, and Paul Boyer, *Urban Masses and Moral Order in America, 1820-1920* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard U. Press, 1978), 162-187. On broader American attempts to control Filipino behavior see Glenn A. May, *Social Engineering in the Philippines: the Aims, Execution, and Impact of American Colonial Policy, 1900-1913* (Reprint, Quezon City: New Day, 1984).

⁶¹The Philippine Presbyterian 14 (January-April 1923), 4-5; *The Philippine Presbyterian* 15 (July 1924), 2; Laubach, *The People of the Philippines*, 406-409. During the Revolution, Lukban's brother, Vicente, was one of the last generals to surrender to the Americans. See Stuart C. Miller, *Benevolent Assimilation: The American Conquest of the Philippines, 1899-1903* (New Haven: Yale U. Press, 1982), 221-222.

their fellow Americans for liquor consumption, and the bad examples they made.⁶²

The Women's Christian Temperance Union also was active in the Philippines. Its first president was Josefa Abiertas, a University of the Philippines law graduate, but she died in 1922 after serving only two years. The presidency was taken up by Maria Valdez, dean of women at UP. Protestant leaders such as Jorge Bocobo and Camilo Osias supported education campaigns against alcohol. Protestant legislators attempted without success to pass a Prohibition amendment like the one in the United States.⁶³

Protestants by example as well as action placed women in positions of responsibility, and women missionaries both modeled and promoted careers opened to women in such fields as medicine, nursing, and social work, as well as teaching.⁶⁴

The Protestant view toward cockpits and prize fighting was that both were motivated by a lust for blood, and both promoted gambling. Protestants' ire was directed at the Carnival Association, chaired by W. Cameron Forbes himself. The Association existed to promote cockfights in Manila. "What a mockery," said the a Presbyterian writer in reference to gambling in 1917, "for such a people to be crying for political freedom, lacking as they do moral independence!" Protestants were horrified that in some localities the only day cockfighting was permitted was on Sundays, and they accused Roman Catholic priests of owning the cockpits. To prove a point, in one Methodist revival, the evangelist ate a fighting cock. One village in Mindanao rejected a Protestant public school teacher, knowing that they would have to give up their cockpits, gambling, and work on Sunday. In regards to prize fighting, once more the Americans had only to

⁶²*The Philippine Presbyterian* 10 (April 1919), 2.

⁶³Homer C. Stuntz, *The Philippines and the Far East* (Cincinnati: Jennings and Pye, 1904), 353, 479; *The Philippine Presbyterian* 10 (April 1919), 2; Richard E. Welch, Jr. *Response to Imperialism: The United States and the Philippine-American War, 1899-1902* (Chapel Hill: U. of North Carolina, 1979), 98-99.

⁶⁴Flora Ylagan, *In the Philippine Islands* (N.p., n.d.), 140-149.

blame themselves. Protestants won a few concessions on gambling, such as racetrack betting being limited to only ten days per year.⁶⁵

Dance halls presented a moral issue because, to Protestant minds, they promoted prostitution. Protestants condemned public schools for promoting modern dance. By 1927 a bill on the Philippine House floor—endorsed by the Evangelical Union—called for the “closing of all dance halls where girls get paid for treading the light fantastic.”⁶⁶

Missionaries realized that Americans were much to blame for the increase of venereal disease in the Philippines, and were humiliated by the actions of American soldiers. They were outraged when, at least briefly during the early occupation, the Army Medical Corps attempted to reduce the disease by licensing two brothels in Manila. When some later proposed creating a “red light” district in Manila, Protestants were irate. But they were also chagrined to know that only since the coming of the Americans had prostitution become prevalent in the Philippines. Protestants realized that there must be a deeper, more moral and economic solution to the problem.⁶⁷

These issues were both personal and social, as the Protestants saw it. One man had been a “wayward husband,” an irresponsible father, a drunkard, gambler and adulterer. Once, while drunk, he attended a

⁶⁵*The Philippine Presbyterian* 4 (October 1917), 1; *The One Hundred and Thirteenth Annual Report of the American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions* (Boston: the Board, [1922]), 163; Laubach, *The People of the Philippines*, 402-405; Stanley High, *A Waking World: Christianity Among the Non-White Race* (New York: Abingdon, 1928), 127, 134; Richard Deats, *The Story of Methodism in the Philippines* (Manila: Union Theological Seminary, 1964), 54; Clymer, *Protestant Missionaries*, 170-171.

⁶⁶Lewis E. Gleeck, Jr., *The American Half-Century (1898-1946)* (Manila: Historical Conservation Society, 1984), 289.

⁶⁷Laubach, *The People of the Philippines*, 406-409; *The Philippine Presbyterian* 14 (January-April 1923), 4; *The Philippine Presbyterian* 15 (July 1924), 2; Welch, *Response to Imperialism*, 99. During the Revolution, Lukban's brother, Vicente, was one of the last generals to surrender to the Americans. See Stuart C. Miller, *Benevolent Assimilation.: The American Conquest of the Philippines, 1899-1903* (New Haven: Yale U. Press, 1982), 221-222.

Protestant street meeting, and when a Methodist missionary extended the “invitation” at the close of the service he was one of the first to the front. Truly changed, he abandoned his common-law wives, gave up fighting cocks, wine and other vices. “You see,” he would say to his former gambling partners, “not one of you have been able to send your children to school beyond the second grade. It is because you have been wasting your money in women, alcoholic drinks and gambling dens.” As a result of Protestant efforts, as this man’s grandson put it, “wrecked lives have been restored, broken homes have been repaired, enemies have been reconciled.”⁶⁸

Protestants also championed the rights of factory workers to a decent living, and criticized the exploitation of child labor. They wailed against political corruption also, the buying and selling of votes.⁶⁹

While Protestants stood together on a number of social issues, steps toward organic union proceeded slowly. Presbyterian and Congregationalist missionaries met in Lanao, Mindanao, in 1921, and recommended merger between the two denominations. The Presbyterians and Congregationalists hoped that they might draw up articles of faith broad enough to allow for the eventual merger of other groups, and decided upon the doctrinal stand of Union Theological Seminary in Manila, which was itself based on that of Union Theological Seminary in Nanking, China. It had four major points: (1) that the Old and New Testaments were the “inspired Word of God”; (2) that Jesus Christ is the divine Son of God, and offered atonement for sin by faith in his vicarious death; (3) that the Holy Spirit is both divine and personal; and, (4) that the Church has spiritual, but not political authority.⁷⁰ American denominations, especially the Presbyterians, were heatedly debating issues of biblical authority, and some missionaries criticized the Philippines statement for being too “fundamentalist.”⁷¹ While merger talks

⁶⁸Victor Vinluan, .The Changing Americans,. *The Philippine Christian Advance* 15 (October 1963), 7-9.

⁶⁹ Laubach, *The People of the Philippines*, 10-411.

⁷⁰ Charles Hamilton, .The Movement Toward Church Union in the Philippines,. *The Philippine Presbyterian* 14 (October 1924), 34.

⁷¹Charles Hamilton, .Church Union Opposed,. *The Philippine Presbyterian* 16 (April 1925), 6.

continued, the Presbyterians invited the Congregationalists to cooperate with them at Silliman Institute in Dumaguete, Negros Oriental.⁷²

By 1924 all four of the presbyteries of the Presbyterian Synod of the Philippines had voted for union with the Congregationalists. There was hope that the Evangelical United Brethren might also join the union. The United Church of Manila, organized in 1924, was a joint project between EUB and Congregationalists. A General Committee on Church Union met in Manila in August 1924. By that time, the EUB had taken action had approved union.⁷³

Methodists in the United States issued a statement in 1925 that if denominational bonds seemed to be hindering the work of the Kingdom anywhere around the world they should be removed. But Methodists in the Philippines balked at union. The Methodist Church was the largest denomination in the Philippines, more than twice the size of the Presbyterian Church, the next largest denomination. Filipinos in other denominations accused the Methodists for seeming to want to “dictate” the terms of union.⁷⁴

To Methodists, the time was not right for union. Methodists feared that union would necessitate the church giving up its freedom and autonomy, and that the united church would be dominated by “ultra-conservatives.” Methodists felt that a united church would not be advantageous for the spread of the gospel, and that enough of a sense of spiritual commonality existed among the churches. Methodists noted that church union was being promoted by missionaries rather than by Filipinos,

⁷² Charles Hamilton, .The Movement Toward Church Union., 32-33.

⁷³Hamilton, .The Movement Toward Church Union., 33-36; Enrique Sobrepna, *That They May Be One*, 44-48. See also Sitoy, *Several Springs*, 1: 336-348.

⁷⁴ Archie L. Ryan, *Religious Education in the Philippines: A Study of the Organization and Activities of the Philippine Islands Sunday School Union, Now the Philippine Council of Religious Education* (Manila: Methodist Publishing House, 1930), 54; Dionisio D. Alejandro, *From Darkness to Light: A Brief Chronicle of the Beginnings and Spread of Methodism in the Philippines* (N.p.: Philippines Central Conference Board of Communications and Publications, the United Methodist Church, 1974), 149-151; Apilado, *Revolutionary Spirituality*, 247-248.

and preferred to strengthen the Evangelical Union than forge a united church.⁷⁵

Charles Hamilton, the General Secretary of the Evangelical Union, rebutted the Methodists' view that the doctrinal statement that had been agreed upon was "ultra-conservative." It was as minimal as possible, Hamilton argued, and was the same statement that the Methodists had agreed upon in order to work together with other denominations at UTS. Hamilton expressed satisfaction (premature, as it turned out) that the Modernist/Fundamentalist controversy raging in the United States and other countries had not reached the Philippines. Hamilton wished that the Methodists were standing in the forefront of the march toward union, as it had already gone the greatest distance toward self-support. But with or without the Methodists, church union, Hamilton vowed, would go forward.⁷⁶

Without the Methodists, the United Evangelical Church of the Philippines was organized in March 1929. It was a union of Presbyterian, EUB and Congregationalist denominations along with the United Church of Manila. The final doctrinal basis of union was the Nanking Agreement rather than the UTS statement. Since it included EUB in northern Luzon, Presbyterians in southern Luzon and the Visayas and Congregationalists in Mindanao, the UEC was spread throughout the country. Enrique Sobrepena, a young leader in the EUB.⁷⁷

Sobrepena, from Caba, La Union, was the most important Protestant leader in the pre-and postwar era. After study in the United States, in 1926 Sobrepena became pastor of the United Church in Manila,

⁷⁵ Hamilton, "Church Union Opposed," 4-5; Sobrepena, *That They May Be One*, 40, 42, 53; Apilado, "Revolution, Colonialism, and Mission," 446-448.

⁷⁶ Hamilton, "Church Union Opposed," 4-10. For the context see Joel Carpenter, "Introduction," *Modernism and Foreign Missions: Two Fundamentalist Protests*, ed. Joel Carpenter (New York: Garland, 1988).

⁷⁷ Proculo Rodriguez, "The Mindanao Conference of the United Evangelical Church in the Philippine Islands," *The Philippine Presbyterian* 26 (April-June 1934), 8, 18-20; George Wright, "The General Assembly of the United Evangelical Church in the Philippines," *The Philippine Presbyterian* 27 (September 1935), 6-7. See Sobrepena, *That They May Be One*, 48-50; Sitoy, *Several Spings*, 1: 369-381.

a congregation that he pastored until 1953. Under his leadership, the membership of this local church increased to 2,000. Sobrepena was reelected Moderator of the United Evangelical Church in succeeding General Assemblies. He resigned in 1938 in order to become Executive Secretary of the newly formed Philippine Federation of Evangelical Churches.⁷⁸

Unlike the Evangelical Union, which it replaced, the Philippine Federation of Evangelical Churches was led by Filipinos. Its first president was Jorge Bocobo, noted legal scholar and President of the University of the Philippines. The Federation, which included the United Evangelical Church, the Methodist Church, the Disciples of Christ and the Baptists, promoted union, comity and cooperation.⁷⁹

A lesser union occurred in 1932, when 11 small denominations formed the United Evangelical Church of Christ, more commonly called La Iglesia Evangelical Unida de Cristo, or, simply, UNIDA. These small denominations were for the most part schisms from the larger American-dominated churches. Los Cristianos Filipinos, for instance, had split from the Presbyterians in 1913, in order to be led by Filipinos. Victoriano Mariano was UNIDA's first bishop. Both Sobrepena and Presbyterian missionary James Rodgers (whose remarks had triggered the Presbyterian schism years before) attended the union assembly. At the beginning there were 12,500 members in the new denomination.⁸⁰

By the 1930s the Protestants were establishing rural cooperatives and credit unions. They found their rural members in constant debt, generation after generation. Merchants and landlord extended credit, but at rates impossible for the poverty-stricken to meet. The poor stayed in a kind

⁷⁸ Enrique Sobrepena, .The Power of the Evangel., *The Philippine Christian Advance* 12 (February 1960), 4-9, 23. See various articles in Fern B. Grant, Domini Torrevillas-Suarez, and Leon O. Ty, eds., *Enrique Sobrepena* (Caloocean City: Shang Kuan Press, 1975), especially David A. Sobrepena, .Christian with a Passion for Social Concerns., 87.

⁷⁹ Sitoy, *Several Springs*, 1: 397-398.

⁸⁰ James Rodgers, .Church Union in the Philippines., *The Philippine Presbyterian* 24 (March 1932), 9-11; Richard L. Deats, *Nationalism and Christianity in the Philippines* (Dallas: Southern Methodist U. Press, 1967), 109; Gowing, *Islands Under the Cross*, 161; Sitoy, *Several Springs*, 1: 388-389.

of serfdom on large plantations and haciendas. Those farmers who owned their own small plots of land were indebted to middlemen. The cooperatives and credit unions prevented discontent among farmers who might otherwise have found communism attractive.⁸¹

PROTESTANT DISUNITY BEFORE THE WAR

Within and between the older Protestants, consensus broke down long before the arrival of aggressive denominations following World War Two. Divisions within denominations such as the Northern Baptist and Disciples of Christ were closely related to controversies in the two churches in the United States.

The Disciples of Christ were the most divisive group in the Evangelical Union. The reasons for these difficulties relates to the Disciples' belief that the clear teaching of the Bible and pattern of the early church dictated baptism of adults by immersion for remission of sins. Any other type of baptism (including infant baptism, or baptism by sprinkling or pouring) was invalid. To them, baptism by immersion was essential for salvation and necessary for both church membership and communion. They could not cooperate congenially with either the Presbyterians or Methodists, both of whom practiced infant baptism. The Disciples considered this to be Romanist and contrary to the New Testament. The Disciples refused communion, given weekly, to those who had been baptized in this way.⁸²

As early as 1904 Methodists in northern Luzon complained that the Disciples were convincing their members to be baptized by immersion. In 1916 the Methodist Board advised its missionaries to avoid conflict with the Disciples of Christ, since, as Bishop W. F. Oldham said, there must not be

⁸¹D. Galia, .Cooperatives.The Way of Recovery,. *Ang Manugbantala* 37 (December 1937), 2-4; D. Galia, .History of the Cooperative in Dumaguete,. *Ang Manugbantala* 38 (January 1938), 15; E.K. and I.W. Higdon, *From Carabao to Clipper* (New York: Friendship, 1941), 41-49.

⁸² L. Shelton Woods, .Early American Missionaries in Ilocos,. *Philippine Studies* 45 (Third Quarter 1997), 315.

allowed “a continual irritation between two sets of Christians; both of whom proffers to be guided by Biblical ideals, and to be equally concerned in the spread of the Redeemer’s Kingdom.”⁸³ In 1923 Methodists agreed not to compete in the same areas, and withdrew from Abra Province and Ilocos Sur north of Vigan. The Disciples re-baptized former Methodists who became Disciples because of re-drawn boundaries and, in spite of the agreement, remained in Methodist territories in the provinces of Ilocos Sur, Viscaya, Isabela and Cagaya.⁸⁴

The Disciples also ran into conflict with Presbyterians who also were at work among Tagalogs around Laguna de Bay. In 1918 Leslie Wolfe, the Disciples missionary overseeing about 25 churches in the area, and R. A. Doan, for the Presbyterians, worked out an agreement by which the Disciples agreed to confine themselves to an area between Laguna de Bay and Cristobal and Banahaw mountains.⁸⁵

But Wolfe, a medical doctor, who, with his wife Carrie, had served in the Philippines since 1907, was committed to the Restoration Movement within his church. Despite his own agreements with the Presbyterians regarding the division of the area around Laguna de Bay, Wolfe was not

⁸³ Quoted in Mariano C. Apilado, .*Revolution, Colonialism, and Mission: A Study of the Role of Protestant Churches in the United States. Role in the Philippines.*, Ph.D. dissertation, Vanderbilt University, 1976, 354.

⁸⁴ F. V. Stipp, .*Philippine Islands.*, in *Organizations Represented in International Convention of Disciples of Christ: Survey of Service* (St. Louis: Christian Board of Education, 1928), 435; Stephen J. Corey, *Fifty Years of Attack and Controversy: The Consequences Among Disciples of Christ* (St. Louis: Christian Board of Publication, 1953), 113-114; Deats, *The Story of Methodism in the Philippines*, 64; J. Tremayne Coplestone, *History of Methodist Missions*, vol. IV: *Twentieth-Century Perspectives: The Methodist Episcopal Church, 1896 - 1939* (New York: Board of Global Ministries, United Methodist Church, 1973), 237; Mark Maxey, *History of the Philippine Mission: Churches of Christ and Christian Churches* (San Clemente, CA: Go Ye Books, 1973), 41, 232-268; Alejandro, *From Darkness to Light*, 121, 141; Apilado, .*Revolution, Colonialism, and Mission.*, 349-356; Clymer, *Protestant Missionaries*, 54-60; Woods, .*Early American Missionaries.*, *Philippine Studies*, 315.

⁸⁵ Leslie Wolfe to R. A. Doan, July 13, 1918, in Corey, *Fifty Years of Attack and Controversy*, 110- 111. See Clymer, *Protestant Missionaries*, 54-60.

happy that the Disciples sent students to Union Theological Seminary, and pressed Disciples pastors and missionaries to require those coming into the Disciples of Christ from various denominations to be re-baptized. The Tagalog Convention of the Disciples of Christ, under Wolfe's leadership, resolved against "open" membership (which would have allowed those from other denominations to become members without undergoing baptism by immersion). "We stand," Wolfe said, "for the baptism of the New Testament."⁸⁶

Recriminations between Wolfe and various missionaries, including those of his own denomination, were public and bitter. Eventually Disciples missionaries requested their society to remove the Wolfes from the Philippines.⁸⁷

In 1926 the Disciples of Christ sent an investigating committee from the United States. The committee lamented the way the missionaries had handled the situation with Wolfe, and agreed with Wolfe's point that baptism by immersion was necessary for church membership, but strongly criticized Wolfe for alienating both national workers and other missionaries. The Wolfes were told to come home.⁸⁸

But they refused. The denomination's Standard supported the Wolfes. Out of the broader controversy within the denomination came the "Christian Restoration Association of America," which professed "loyalty to the Word." This faction raised and maintained financial support for the Wolfes. The Wolfe controversy was a catalyst toward the creation, the next

⁸⁶ Maxey, *History of the Philippine Mission*, 145-146.

⁸⁷ David Filbeck, *The First Fifty Years: A Brief History of the Direct-Support Missionary Movement* (Joplin, MO: College Press, 1980), 89-90.

⁸⁸ Corey, *Fifty Years of Attack and Controversy*, 106; Dwight E. Stevenson, *Christianity in the Philippines: A Report on the Only Christian Nation in the Orient* (Lexington, KY: College of the Bible, 1955), 38; Maxey, *History of the Philippine Mission*, 30-47; Filbeck, *The First Fifty Years*, 87.

year, of the Christian Convention. Congregations that chose to affiliate with this Convention called themselves “Church of Christ.”⁸⁹

Following patterns in the United States, the congregations that aligned themselves with Wolfe and the Restoration Movement called themselves Churches of Christ. Wolfe and his Filipino associates were convinced that they should have no relations with “denominationalists,” and that any sort of comity arrangement would compromise the gospel and curtail the work of the church. L. M. Bana, for instance, called comity and open membership “deplorable” and complimented Wolfe for upholding the “primitive teachings of the New Testament Church.”⁹⁰ Churches of Christ grew faster than Disciples of Christ churches.⁹¹

The Baptists had similar problems among themselves and with other denominations. Relations with the Presbyterians in the Visayas were strained. Agreements between the two groups in April 1903 gave the Baptists the entire province of Negros Occidental. In a supplemental comity agreement in 1925, the Baptists gave up Samar to the Presbyterians and the Presbyterians left Panay to the Baptists—except that the Presbyterian congregations in existence could choose to remain Presbyterian. These arrangements stipulated that when formerly Presbyterian members transferred to Baptist churches they would not need to be re-baptized. But Baptists held views regarding the necessity of the baptism of adult believers by immersion that prevented their abiding by this.⁹²

⁸⁹ Corey, *Fifty Years of Attack and Controversy*, 107-108, 116, 135; Filbeck, *The First Fifty Years*, 90, 98-100; James B. North, *Union in Truth: An Interpretive History of the Restoration Movement* (Cincinnati: Standard Publishing, 1994), 316-317, 332. The seeds of the division were much deeper, and extended from the nineteenth century.

⁹⁰ Filbeck, *The First Fifty Years*, 90.

⁹¹ Stevenson, *Christianity in the Philippines*, 38; Maxey, *History of the Philippine Mission*, 198, 203-204, 297f. See Sobrepena, *That They May Be One*, 31-32; Apilado, *Revolution, Colonialism, and Mission*, 379-386.

⁹² Clymer, *Protestant Missionaries*, 48; Sitoy, *Several Springs*, 1: 381-386.

Meanwhile, there began to be divisions affected by the Fundamentalist and Modernist debate within the Northern Baptist Church in America. Raphael Thomas, a medical missionary serving in the hospital in Iloilo, became dissatisfied with comity arrangements and interdenominational projects. In 1927, while on furlough in the United States, Thomas laid plans to start his own mission. He found financial backing, especially from the daughters of deceased hymn writer William H. Doane, and helped to establish the Association of Baptists for Evangelism in the Orient. Returning to the Philippines, with several single women missionaries also dissatisfied with the Northern Baptist mission, Thomas started the Doane Evangelistic Institute in Iloilo in 1928.⁹³

On the opposite end of the liturgical spectrum from the Baptists were the Episcopalians. Although some Episcopalian priests who had come with the American troops were evangelical, later Episcopal missionaries were “high church.” They refused to enter into comity arrangements with the other Protestant groups in the Philippines because they did not believe that any of them should proselytize Roman Catholics. The Episcopalians maintained statues of Mary and other saints. They worked only in areas of the Philippines that were non-Christian: among Moslems and tribal people in Mindanao, Chinese in Manila, and tribal people in the mountains of Northern Luzon.⁹⁴

⁹³ Sobrepena, *That They May Be One*, 32-33, 74; Jesse E. Posey, .A Historical Study of Baptist Missions in the Philippines 1900-1967., ThD dissertation, New Orleans Baptist Theological Seminary, 1968, 62-66, 69. In 1939 the organization expanded to Peru and changed its name to the Association of Baptists for World Evangelism (ABWE).

⁹⁴ John A. Stauton, *An Open Letter to the Rt. Rev. F.R. Graves, D.D., Bishop of Shanghai and Bishop in Charge of the Missionary District of the Philippine Islands* (Sagada: Igorot, 1919), 5; Vincent H. Gowen, *Philippine Kaleidoscope: An Illustrated Story of the Church's Mission* (New York: National Council Protestant Episcopal Church, n.d.), 45; Apilado, .Revolution, Colonialism, and Mission., 157-158; William H. Scott, ..An Engineer.s Dream..John Staunton and the Mission of St. Mary the Virgin, Sagada., in *Studies in Philippine Church History*, ed. Anderson, 343; Mark D. Norbeck, .False Start: The First Three Years of Episcopal Missionary Endeavor in the Philippine Islands, 1898-1901., *Anglican and Episcopal History* 62 (June 1993): 215-236.

The Methodist Church suffered schisms not over theology, but over issues of governance. Within ten years of his helping to found the Methodist Church in the Philippines, Nicholas Zamora wearied with the slow pace of nationalization and indigenization. He considered the Methodist missionaries “smug young men ... who place their national prejudices above the teachings of Jesus Christ. By word and action they have for years belittled our capabilities even to the extent of repeatedly asserting to our faces that the Filipinos are not fitted to conduct their own churches.”⁹⁵ Some members of the Methodist church in Tondo formed in 1903 the Katotohanan [Truth] Society to promote evangelism, and sponsored its own evangelists. The Society formed its own credo: “While God has given other nations the right to serve and administer the religious life of their people, the Filipinos were also endowed by the divine Providence with the same gift.”⁹⁶

In 1908 the General Conference of the Methodist Episcopal Church authorized the organization of a Philippine Annual Conference.⁹⁷ In effect, this meant that the Philippines remained under the American church. The same General Conference failed to allow local Filipino pastors the right to officiate at wedding ceremonies. Meanwhile, missionaries criticized Zamora for charging fees too high for conducting marriage ceremonies (which he was allowed to do because he was ordained).

It finally became too much. In February 1909, at the Methodist Church in Tondo, Zamora announced the formation of La Iglesia Evangelica Metodista en las Islas Filipinas (IEMELIF). The church appealed to Filipinos’ patriotism and to their latent anti-American feeling, and drew

⁹⁵ Quoted in Clymer, *Protestant Missionaries*, 114.

⁹⁶ Richard L. Deats, “Nicolas Zamora: Religious Nationalist,” in *Studies in Philippine Church History*, ed. Gerald H. Anderson (Ithaca: Cornell U. Press, 1969), 333. See also N.C. Dizon in *The Methodist Quarter-Centennial Celebration*, 10-11; Ruben F. Trinidad, *A Monument to Religious Nationalism: History and Polity of the IEMELIF Church* (Quezon City: Evangelical Methodist Church in the Philippines, 1999), 100-135.

⁹⁷ Alejandro, *From Darkness to Light*, 87-88.

about 1,500 members away from the Methodist church. Zamora issued a letter in March 1909, that “We do not have ill feeling nor hatred toward the Americans and their colleagues. We only want to be independent.”⁹⁸ But missionaries believed that the schism was carried out in bitterness.⁹⁹

The IEMELIF retained relations with other Protestant groups and, though it did not agree to comity, later it joined the Philippine Federation of Evangelical Churches.

A second major split occurred in the Methodist Church in 1933. About three years before, a prominent minister had been charged with adultery. At the 1932 Philippine Annual Conference, a committee found the minister guilty and recommended his expulsion from the ministry. But the minister, as was his right, since the Philippine Conference was not an independent or national conference, appealed the decision to the Appellant Committee of the General Conference in America. This Committee decided that it did not have enough evidence against the minister, so it acquitted him—thereby overturning the decision of the Philippine Conference. This brought to everyone’s attention the subordinate position of the Philippine church. Bishop Herbert Welch, at the 1933 Annual Conference, declared the matter closed, and reinstated the minister.¹⁰⁰

As a result, a group led by Samuel Stagg, pastor of the influential Central Student Church, and including five other missionaries and 27 ordained Filipino ministers led by Cipriano Navarro, left the church. All but 41 members of Central Student Church left their newly dedicated gothic cathedral. This group formed the Philippine Methodist Church, with Navarro as bishop. The church financially supported the Staggs and the other missionaries who joined it. Stagg and his former members formed the

⁹⁸ Quoted in Deats, *The Story of Methodism*, 44. See also Golden Jubilee Executive Committee, *Aklat Pang-Alaala sa Ika-50 Anibersario ng Iglesia Evangelica Metodista en las Islas Filipinas, 1909-1959* (Manila: n.p., 1959), 30-31.

⁹⁹ Apilado, “Revolution, Colonialism, and Mission,” 258-259; Clymer, *Protestant Missionaries*, 125-126. Compare Alejandro, *From Darkness to Light*, 97-100.

¹⁰⁰ Alejandro, *From Darkness to Light*, 158-161.

Cosmopolitan Church, which became the leading congregation of the new denomination. In 1948 the Philippine Methodist Church was a constituent part of the formation of the United Church of Christ in the Philippines.¹⁰¹

The most successful non-Federation denomination was the Seventh-day Adventist. The Seventh-day Adventists arrived within a decade of the American take-over of the Philippines. Their approach in the Philippines was in keeping with SDA theology that emphasized that Saturday must be kept as the Sabbath, Christ's imminent return, and dietary restrictions. SDA members abstained not only from alcohol and tobacco, as did other Protestants of the day, but from tea and coffee, and lived on a vegetarian diet. SDA members associated worship on Sunday with Roman Catholic practices, and believed that Protestants had only gone part way in their rejection of Catholicism. They considered other Protestants "unbelievers" for failing to accept the message of the Third Angel, whom they identified with the writings of "Prophetess" Ellen White, and, as unbelievers, other Protestants were not going to be saved. They went directly to Protestants as subjects of evangelism, and did not attempt to work within comity arrangements. SDA evangelists and colporteurs ranged throughout the Philippines. In comparison to other missions, Seventh-day Adventists never stationed many missionaries in the Philippines.¹⁰²

¹⁰¹ Sobrepena, *That They May Be One*, 30-31; Deats, *The Story of Methodism*, 69-72; Deats, *Nationalism and Christianity*, 143; Coppleston, *History of Methodist Missions*, 4: 1169-1174; Apilado, "Revolution, Colonialism, and Mission," 415-416. Welch referred to the 1933 Annual Conference in the Philippines as "the three most unhappy weeks of my life," in *As I Recall My Past Century* (New York: Abingdon, 1962), 112. See also Mary Webb, *Not My Will: A Christian Martyr in the Philippines* (Pasig City: Anvil, 1997), 157-174, and Jovito R. Salonga, s. Forward. to the same, v-x.

¹⁰² Matilda E. Andross, *Story of the Advent Message* (Washington, DC: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1926), 342-343; M. Ellsworth Olsen, *A History of the Origin and Progress of Seventh-Day Adventists*, 3rd ed. (Washington, DC: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1932), 683-685; Don F. Neufeld, ed., *Seventh-Day Adventist Encyclopedia* (Washington, DC: Review and Herald Publishing, 1966), 988; P. Gerard Damsteegt, *Foundations of the Seventh-Day Adventist Message and Mission* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1977), 187; pp. 204, 221-226, 233, 242-244, 283, 292, 295-296; Hermann L. Reyes, *Breaking Through: Why the Seventh-Day Adventist Church*

Targeting other Protestants for conversion, SDA missionaries in 1906-1907 sent literature pertaining to SDA beliefs to 800 American teachers in the Philippines. L. V. Finster, who arrived in 1908, and who served as SDA Field Superintendent, began Bible studies among Filipino Protestant pastors. He persuaded several, including Guillermo Dionicio, a Methodist, of the truthfulness of SDA claims. The first SDA church, arising out of these Bible studies, was organized in March 1911. The first SDA church in Pangasinan was largely the result of a split in the EUB church in Artacho, Sison.¹⁰³

In 1913 the SDA mission board sent \$10,000 for a printing press. It was an excellent investment. In 1914 the SDA printed and bound three million pages of literature, some of it in local dialects. The material was of high quality. Missionaries conducted colporteur and Bible institutes, teaching book salesmanship, and accompanied Filipinos into the field on their first sales attempts. The colporteurs were carefully instructed to be well dressed, clean, and prosperous-looking. The colporteurs needed to know well the contents of the books they sold, and to make convincing appeals as to their truthfulness. Those who purchased the books also were likely to read them. Perhaps 85 percent of the members of the church were won through colporteurs. Between 1922 and 1938, \$935,659 worth of books was sold. The income from the books financially supported not only the colporteurs themselves, but also the expansion of the church, and enabled it quickly to be self-supporting.¹⁰⁴

Has Grown to be the Largest Protestant Church in the Philippines (Quezon City: Kaunlaran, 1981), 121; Clymer, *Protestant Missionaries*, 60-61.

¹⁰³ Neufeld, ed., *Seventh-Day Adventist Encyclopedia*, 990; Reyes, *Breaking Through*, 92-93, 99-107, 126, 154; Clymer, *Protestant Missionaries*, 188. See also Francisco D. Gayoba, 'The Beginnings of Seventh-day Adventist Work (1905-1911)', in Kwantes, ed., *Chapters in Philippine Church History*, 182-202.

¹⁰⁴ A. G. Daniells, 'Some Pressing Needs in the Philippine Islands', *The Adventist Review and Sabbath Herald [ARSH]* 92 (July 1, 1915), 9-11; Robert Stewart, 'Colporteur Work on Cebu, Philippine Islands', *ARSH* 92 (July 8, 1915), 21-22; Stewart, 'From the Philippines', *ARSH* 92 (September 9, 1915), 17; Daniells, 'Our

Apart from the denominations that established themselves in the first few years after American occupation, and splits within them, Filipinos initiated the other Protestant denominations that began before the war. They desired to establish churches like the ones in which they had been converted in America, paid no attention to denominational boundaries, and, like the SDA, found many of their first members from older denominations.

The Assemblies of God was among several denominations that were the result of Filipinos converted in the United States. Initially there was no missionary presence. Instead, Filipinos leaders began the work using their own initiative and contacts. Crispulo Garsulao returned to his province of Antique about 1928, planted a church in Cadolonan, San Regenio, and opened a short-lived Bible school in his hometown of Saibalom. Another “balikbayan” was Pedro Collado, who returned to the Philippines in 1935 and began preaching in his home area around Bagumbayan, Nueva Ecija. Then he moved to Antique to care for the work that Garsulao, who died in 1935, had started. From there Collado moved to Mindanao, where some of his followers had migrated. Finally, he settled in Baga, Ala Valley Project. Benito Acena returned to the Philippines in 1935, after being ordained in California, and soon established Pentecostal churches in La Paz, Laoag, Ilocus Norte; Lisud, Sarrat; in Bangay, Dingras. Rosendo Alcantara had joined Bethel Temple in Los Angeles and had held meetings among Filipinos in both California and Hawaii before returning to the Philippines. He worked among Ilocanos in the north and pastored in Bangay. Eugenio Suede returned to his home area, Iloilo, in 1936. At first he worked with the

Publishing Work in the Philippines,. *ARSH* 94 (March 22, 1917), 12; Daniells, .Our Publishing Work in the Philippines,. *ARSH* 94 (April 15, 1917), 12-14; W. B. Riffel, .East Visayan Mission,. *ARSH* 111 (October 11, 1934), 19; E.N. Lugenbeal, .Laymen Active in the Philippines,. *ARSH* 117 (September 26, 1940), 22; George A. Campbell, .Our Publishing Work in the Philippine Islands,. *ARSH* 122 (August 9, 1945), 19; Neufeld, ed., *Seventh-Day Adventist Encyclopedia*, 989; Reyes, *Breaking Through*, 119, 194, 224.

Baptists. Then he started an Assemblies of God church at Jaguimit, Iloilo.¹⁰⁵

Rodrigo Esperanza was Methodist before going to the United States in 1928, but attended an Assemblies of God Bible College and joined the Assemblies of God in 1938. At first he ministered in California, working among the Filipino Assemblies of the Firstborn, the Foursquare Church, and the Church of God. He entreated the AG headquarters in Springfield, Missouri, to open work in the Philippines. With its official backing, he arrived in Manila in 1939. Esperanza immediately began work in his home, Rosaio, Pozorrubio, Pangasinan. Esperanza began contacting the other Filipino Pentecostal pastors who had already spread the Pentecostal message throughout the Philippines. Because these Pentecostals believed that the baptism with the Holy Spirit evidenced by speaking in tongues was a blessing that all Christians should seek, they sought and found converts from other Protestant denominations as well as Roman Catholicism, and paid no attention to comity arrangements and the loose structure of the denomination allowed local leaders to initiate work in new areas. But in order for the denomination to be registered in the Philippines at the time, the Filipino workers found, it needed to be represented by a missionary.¹⁰⁶

For that reason, the denomination sent Leland Johnson, who arrived in December 1939. He and Esperanza gathered workers for a conference that was held in San Nicolas, Villasis, Pangasinan, in March 1940. It launched the Philippines District Council of the Assemblies of God. The three ordained ministers among the group ordained six others. Johnson became District Superintendent and Esperanza District Secretary.¹⁰⁷

¹⁰⁵ Trinidad C. Esperanza, 'The Assemblies of God in the Philippines,' MRE thesis, Fuller Theological Seminary, 1965, 19-29. The thesis is abridged in Trinidad E[speranza] Seleký, 'Six Filipinos and One American: Pioneers of the Assemblies of God in the Philippines,' *Asian Journal of Pentecostal Studies* 4 (January 2001), 119-129.

¹⁰⁶ Esperanza, 'The Assemblies of God,' 27-30.

¹⁰⁷ Esperanza, 'The Assemblies of God,' 30-32; *Protestant Churches and Missions in the Philippines*, vol. 2, ed. Merlyn Guillermo (N.p.: World Vision Philippines, 1983), 307-309.

During the war, the Assemblies of God held a Convention in Pozorrubio, Pangasinan, in December 1943. Enrique Sobrepena and other leaders of the United Evangelical Church attended and urged the Assemblies of God to join the UEC. But the Convention voted not to join.¹⁰⁸

Another Pentecostal denomination that similarly built upon leaders who returned from the United States before the war was the Foursquare Church. Vicente Defante had been saved at the Angelus Temple in Los Angeles, and was a cook for Aime McPherson, the founder of the denomination. In 1931 the church sent Defante as a missionary to the Philippines. He worked in Iloilo, and in 1937 erected a church, which he pastored until 1963. Another Foursquare member who returned, David Abrojena, built a church at Cabittanran, Ilocos Norte. Another saved in the Angelus Temple, George Ilawan, pioneered a church in Malagasang, Cavite. Grace Williams, though she was not a missionary, planted a Pentecostal church in Laoag in the late 1930s. Her work was taken up by Francisco Pascual, who established other Foursquare churches in the Laoag area. Like the Assemblies of God, the Foursquare Church paid no heed to comity, found converts from other denominations, and was strategically placed for growth.¹⁰⁹

Similarly, the Pilgrim Holiness Church, a denomination in the Wesleyan Holiness tradition arrived in the Philippines as a result of work among Filipinos in Alta Loma, California. Miguel Zambrano was the first to return, in 1932. He began holding services and revivals around his home barrio, San Francisco, Sudipen, La Union. A church was organized there within a short time. Some of the PHC members had formerly been members of the EUB. C. T. Bolayog arrived in January 1934, and preached in San Francisco (through an interpreter, since Bolayog was Visayan). Paul W. Thomas, Secretary of the denomination's Foreign Missions toured the Philippines in 1934 and appointed Bolayog as the leader of the work. The

¹⁰⁸ Esperanza, .The Assemblies of God., 36.

¹⁰⁹ James Montgomery, *New Testament Fire in the Philippines* (Manila: Church Growth Research in the Philippines, 1972), 46-51; *Protestant Churches and Missions in the Philippines*, vol. 2, 155-158.

Evangelical United Brethren were not happy that the Pilgrim Holiness Church was being established in their territory.¹¹⁰

Pilgrim Holiness missionaries Rev. and Mrs. R. K. Storey arrived in 1937, and started a church and a Bible school in Cabanatuan, Nueva Ecija. The Storeys were interred during the war in Santo Tomas. During that time, under pressure from the Japanese, the Pilgrim Holiness Church united with the Fundamental Baptist Church. Along with the barrios in which they were situated, six Pilgrim Holiness churches were burned during the war. Yet pastors such as Antonio Campos continued to conduct revivals and establish churches.¹¹¹

Another holiness group that entered before the war was the Salvation Army. There had been a Salvation Army representative and worker with the American soldiers in 1898. John Milsaps regarded himself (though he was not) as a chaplain. During that time he opened a “Soldiers and Sailors Reading Room” in Manila, and regularly held Salvation Army services. But he stayed for only 20 months.

The true work of the Salvation Army among Filipinos began in Hawaii, and, like other groups, spread to the Philippines when some of the converts returned home. A Salvation Army post was established at Malandog, Antique, in August 1933, through the work of Gregorio Abelardo, Roque Alfaro and the Manalot family. Other Salvation Army-affiliated Filipinos returned to Ilocano areas in 1934 and to Cebuano areas in 1936.

The Salvation Army in the Philippines was under British rather than American jurisdiction. The first official missionaries, Alfred and Agnes Lindvall, arrived in 1937. Swedish-born, they had served the Army for 36 years in South America. The Lindvalls centered their work in Ermita and

¹¹⁰ Paul Westphal Thomas and Paul William Thomas, .The Philippine Islands., in *The Days of Our Pilgrimage: The History of the Pilgrim Holiness Church*, eds. Melvin Dieter and Lee Haines (Marion, IN: The Wesley Press, 1976), 195-196; Paul W. Thomas, .The Philippines., in *Reformers and Revivalists: The History of the Wesleyan Church*, ed. Wayne E. Caldwell (Indianapolis: Wesley Press, 1992), 526-527; Robert A. Bickert, .Perception and Response to Receptivity: The History and Growth of the Wesleyan Church in the Philippines, 1932-1994., D.Miss. dissertation, Asbury Theological Seminary, 1996, 189, 195.

¹¹¹ Thomas, .The Philippines., 527-530.

established four “halls” in various parts of Manila. By 1941 the SA had 18 corps, 32 outposts and 27 officers. During the war the Salvation Army staff, including the Lindvalls, and the training college they had established moved to Baguio.¹¹²

FEDERATION CHURCHES DURING THE POST-WAR YEARS

The post-war years saw an increased breakdown in comity. This was due to further divisions within the Protestant establishment and the entrance of new Protestant groups. One of the justifications of post-war evangelicals was that the older denominations, in their estimation, had, like their American counterparts, lost essential elements of the gospel.

United Evangelical Church, Methodist and Baptist churches dominated Philippine Protestantism the immediate post-war years, just as their counterparts did in America. Leaders in these Protestant groups saw sectarianism as regressive. In both the Philippines and America, prominent Protestants were well educated, and in both the constituency represented a cross-section of the population. In the Philippines a middle-class elite and several prominent politicians had been educated in Protestant colleges such as Silliman in Dumaguete and Central Philippine in Iloilo. But, as in the United States, the older Protestants’ complacency was shaken by aggressive denominations that did not cooperate with the Federation. These churches grew at faster rates than the older ones.¹¹³

¹¹² Salvation Army in the Philippines, . *The Philippine Christian Advance* 14 (June 1962), 11-13; Frederick Coumts, *The Better Fight: The History of the Salvation Army*, vol. 6, 1914-1946 (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1973), 138-140, 216; Robert Saunders, *Sinimulan Ng Panginoon (Pioneered by God): History of the Salvation Army in the Philippines* (Manila: Salvation Army, 1979), 16-23; Edward H. McKinley, *Marching to Glory: The History of the Salvation Army in the United States: The First Hundred Years, 1880-1980* (Atlanta: Salvation Army, 1980), 68-69. See also Robert F. Saunders, .Heart to God, Hand to Man: The Salvation Army. Beginnings and the War-time Years., in *Chapters in Philippine Church History*, ed. Anne Kwantes (Manila: OMF, 2001), 314-332.

¹¹³ Winburn T. Thomas, .Characteristics of Philippine Protestantism., *Philippine Christian Advance* 3 (September 1951), 7, 15. For the American situation of well established churches see Mark Silk, .The Rise of the .New Evangelicalism.: Shock and Adjustment., in *Between the Times: The Travail of the Protestant Establishment in America, 1900-1960*, ed. William R. Hutchison (Cambridge: Cambridge U. Press, 1989), 278-299; Robert Wuthnow, *The Restructuring of American Religion: Society and Faith Since World War II* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton U. Press, 1989); and Leonard I.

Whereas the older denominations had taken great strides toward achieving the old missions' philosophy of self-government, self-support and self-propagation, the newer Protestant groups entered with missionaries, money and strategies sufficient to recruit and build new constituencies.¹¹⁴

In May 1948, less than two years after the Philippines gained independence from the United States, the Philippine Federation of Evangelical Churches was re-formed. It included the Methodist and Baptist churches, and others that did not join the UCCP. Over the next 15 years the Federation advanced Protestant principles that, as Executive Secretary Juan Nabong put it in 1949, stood uncompromised with either Roman Catholicism or Communism.¹¹⁵

In the same month, the United Evangelical Church, the Philippine Methodist Church, the Iglesia Evangelica Unida de Cristo, the Ilocano Convention of the Disciples of Christ, and several independent congregations united to form the United Church of Christ in the Philippines. In spite of the continued presence of missionaries in leadership (the general officers of the UCCP included two Americans, Stephan Smith as General Secretary, and Hugh Bousman as General Evangelist), the UCCP aimed to participate in nation building. Enrique Sobrepena served both as Bishop for Luzon and as Presiding Bishop. The UCCP's Department of Christian Education oversaw 25 schools.¹¹⁶

Sweet, 'The Modernization of Protestant Religion in America,' in *Altered Landscapes: Christianity in America, 1935-1985*, ed. David Lotz (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1989), 19-41.

¹¹⁴ Benjamin Guansing, 'Developments in the Philippines,' *The Philippine Faith and Life* 1 (1950), 25-26.

¹¹⁵ Juan Nabong, 'For a Protestant Philippines,' *Philippine Christian Advance* 1 (November 1949), 2. See Juan Nabong, 'Reply to the Christian Century,' *The Philippine Christian Advance* 3 (October 1951), 2-3; Nabong, 'Christ, the Philippines and Reparations,' *The Philippine Christian Advance* 6 (April 1954), 3; Enrique Sobrepena, *That They May Be One*, 72-73.

¹¹⁶ Sobrepena, *That They May Be One*, 84-97, 103f; Deats, *Nationalism and Christianity*, 109-114; Gowing, *Islands Under the Cross*, 196-198; Sitoy, *Several Springs*, 1: 485-502. Sobrepena served as Bishop 1948-1960, and General Secretary of the UCCP 1960-1964. See Norwood B. Tye, *Journeying with the United Church of Christ in the Philippines: A History* (Quezon City: United Church of Christ in the Philippines, 1994), 246-247.

The UCCP maintained the connection between evangelism and social concern. In 1952, the UCCP established the UCCP National Federation of Credit Unions to aid farmers. Also in 1952 the UCCP issued a “Resolution Condemning Gambling and Liquor.” In the same year, at Sobrepena’s instigation, a 10-year relation began between the UCCP and Orient (later Philippine) Crusades. Orient Crusades entered the Philippines agreeing to work in cooperation with UCCP leaders, to prepare converts for membership in the UCCP, and to avoid “controversial doctrinal issues.” It focused on mass evangelism and witness to students, and used film showings (such as “King of Kings”) to make contacts. Interested seekers availed of Bible correspondence courses. With Orient Crusades cooperation, Sobrepena held mass evangelistic campaigns—notably in Laoag City in November 1955.¹¹⁷

In 1956 the UCCP commissioned Donald McGavran and Earl Cressy to conduct an in-depth study of the church. There were 99 missionaries working with the UCCP at the time of the report. Of these, 96 were involved in various sorts of educational or student work. McGavran (whose denominational affiliation was the Disciples of Christ) urged missionaries to become more involved in evangelism. How could they teach practical ministry skills to their students unless they themselves were involved in local churches? He called for missionaries who would battle for the faith, proclaim the Good News, and get to know the common people, speaking to them in local dialects. The UCCP, McGavran believed, was oriented toward the urban elite, when, in reality, the church really needed rural workers. He found no grand design for reaching the barrios.¹¹⁸

New missionaries, McGavran feared, brought “loose and tolerant” attitudes toward Roman Catholicism.¹¹⁹ Only privately did UCCP pastors express their doubts about Roman Catholics, McGavran found. In public,

¹¹⁷ Juan Santos, “Crusading for Christ in Laoag,” *The Philippine Christian Advance and Rural Fellowship Bulletin* 8 (January 1956), 20; Tye, *Journeying*, 116-117; T. Valentino Sitoy, Jr., *Several Springs, One Stream: The United Church of Christ in the Philippines*, vol. 2: *The Formative Decade (1948-1958)* (Quezon City: United Church of Christ in the Philippines, 1997), 878-880; Melanio La Guardia Aoanan, *Ecumenical and Prophetic: The Witness of the United Church of Christ in the Philippines* (Quezon City: Claretian, 1998), 94, 102.

¹¹⁸ Donald A. McGavran, *Church Growth in the United Church of Christ in the Philippines*, vol. 1: *Multiplying Churches in the Philippines* (N.p., [1958]), 23, 27, 29-32, 34-36, 43, 60-61, 64, 66, 69, 73, 78, 81-82, 113-114.

¹¹⁹ McGavran, *Church Growth*, 74.

they remained uncritical. McGavran felt that this did not held church growth. With such attitudes, pastors did not sufficiently challenge or mobilize the laity to evangelize. Members had forgotten why they were Protestants. It was important, McGavran believed, that if they were to bring others to Christ, Protestants must be convinced that Roman Catholicism was not biblical Christianity, that it was unable to offer salvation. As most Protestant missionaries had before the war, and out of his own denominational background, McGavran advised that converts who had been baptized as Roman Catholics be re-baptized.

Earl Cressy issued his own report of the church, which, like McGavran's, described the UCCP as a church in decline. He found several causes for this, including the migration of members, and their joining other denominations, but also attributed the loss to a lack of pastoral care. Unlike McGavran, Cressy suggested that the continued growth of key urban churches and outreach to intellectuals was imperative.¹²⁰

In the midst of this critical and dismal report, the UCCP added 17,000 members between 1957 and 1959. But the number of full-time workers in the same years increased only by six!¹²¹

In Mindanao the UCCP attempted to maintain cordial relationships with Moslems. The seeds were in Frank Laubach's work decades before, and centered around Dansalan Junior College in Marawi City. By the early 1960s the school was under the direction of Rufino de los Santos, himself a former Muslim. Protestants here attempted to be interpreters of Filipino culture to the Moslems, and interpreters of Islamic culture to the broader Filipino society. Both Moslems and Protestants commiserated in the marginality of their position in the predominantly Roman Catholic Filipino ethos and culture. Yet, as in Laubach's day, there were few converts from Islam.¹²²

¹²⁰ Earl H. Cressy, *Survey of Church Growth in the United Church of Christ in the Philippines and the Convention of Philippine Baptist Churches*, part two, *Strengthening the Urban Church: Developing More and Stronger Urban Churches* (Manila: United Church of Christ in the Philippines, 1957), 13, 24-28, 40-42, 46, 58f. Compare Sitoy's treatment of the McGavran-Cressy report in *Several Springs*, 2: 888-890.

¹²¹ *The Philippine Christian Advance* 14 (February 1962), 42. See also Arthur L. Carson, *A Study of Evangelical Church Workers in the Philippines* (New York: National Council of Churches, n.d.), 23.

¹²² *One Hundred Fiftieth Annual Report, American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions: 1960* (N.p., [1960]), 62; Peter Gowing, *Mosque and Moro: A Study of Muslims in the Philippines* (Manila: Philippine Federation of Christian Churches,

Elsewhere as well, the UCCP increasingly became involved in social issues. The Ikalahan Church Multiplication project in Santa Fe, Nueva Vizcaya, started in 1957 by UCCP missionary Delbert Rice to evangelize the Kalahan people, typified the hoped-for synthesis of evangelism and social action. Rice emphasized the indigenization of both leadership patterns and music, believing that music, especially, would “provide a basis for [the] genuine Filipinization of the Christian church in this nation.”¹²³ In the 1970s Rice fought to secure for the Ikalahan people titles to their own property.¹²⁴

In 1958 the UCCP began sending pastor-observers to the Resident Labor Training School of the Asian Labor Education Center in order to find out how to bring the message of Christ to workers in their places of work. The UCCP worked toward the election of labor-sympathetic politicians and hoped to influence national labor policy. The 1960 UCCP General Assembly suggested that the church must address the problems resulting in and from congested urban areas. It urged such government policies as the decentralization of industrial areas, and the development of low-income housing projects, vocational training and cottage-industry programs. The ministers and the laity both must be trained and prepared for obedience to Christ in the economic and political spheres of life as well as the religious, the Assembly admonished. It also encouraged the “free responsible and

1964), 99-100; Gowing, .Of Different Minds: Christian and Muslim Ways of Looking at their Relations in the Philippines., *International Review of Mission* 67 (January 1978), 74-85; *All God.s Children: United Church Board for World Ministries, 164th Annual Report.1974* (New York: United Church Board for World Ministries, [1974]), 92.

¹²³ Delbert Rice, .Developing an Indigenous Hymnody., *Practical Anthropology* 17 (September-October 1970), 112; and see pp. 97-113. See also Rice, .Anthropology in Development and Integration: The Kalahan Experience., *Philippine Sociological Review* 26 (April 1978), 127-134.

¹²⁴ Tye, *Journeying*, 304-305. See Rice, .Evangelism and Decision-Making Processes., *Practical Anthropology* 16 (November-December 1969), 264-273; L.P. Verora, *Unreached Peoples .82: Reaching the Igorots* (Makati: World Vision, 1982), 166-171.

democratic trade union movement.”¹²⁵ In the 1960s the UCCP began training pastors in labor organizing, and encouraged to get members involved in human rights issues.¹²⁶ “All acts of reconciliation among [human beings], races, and social and economic groups advance Christ’s healing,” Sobrepena said at the opening of the East Asia Christian Conference in Singapore in 1963, and “all efforts of improve living conditions serve the least of God’s children.”¹²⁷

Though Sobrepena believed that the church must retain its concern for the evangelization of the Philippines as its “primary, crucial and continuing” task,¹²⁸ other Protestants saw the UCCP moving toward increasing preoccupation with social issues. In 1962 the UCCP reexamined its policy of re-baptizing Roman Catholic converts. The UCCP severed relations with Philippine Crusades in the early 1960s when certain of its missionaries led converts and even UCCP members toward more conservative denominations.¹²⁹

In spite of the efforts to maintain both sides of the gospel, assessments made by Robert Skivington, Leonard Tuggy and Ralph Toliver around 1970 were as dismal as McGavran’s had been 15 years earlier. As

¹²⁵ The Church Views Its Social Responsibility: A Statement of Social Concern, *The Philippine Christian Advance* 12 (July 1960), 16-19, 55, 57. See Lydia Mapile, .Social Concern for Christian Education in the UCCP: An Investigative Study in Relation to Pazmino.s Five-Task Model,. Ed.D. dissertation, Asia Graduate School of Theology, 1996, 97-98, and, in general, Chapter 4, .The Social Agenda of the UCCP: 1948-1969,. 88-137.

¹²⁶ Longino V. Daamo, .A Pastor Looks at Trade Unionism in the Philippines,. *The Philippine Christian Advance* 15 (November 1963), 21; Lucy Komisar, .Protestant Churches in the Philippines,. *Christianity and Crisis* 46 (July 16, 1986), 205.

¹²⁷ Enrique Sobrepena, .Church and Mission,. in *Selected Philippine Sermons* (Manila: National Council of Churches in the Philippines, 1967), 43-44. See Sitoy, *Several Springs*, 2: 980-983, 990-998.

¹²⁸ Sobrepena, .Can the Philippines be Evangelized in Our Time?. *The Philippine Christian Advance* 13 (November 1961), 25-26; Otilio Gorospe, .Church Builder and Pastor,. in *Enrique Sobrepena*, eds. Grant, Torrevillas-Suarez, and Tyson, 34.

¹²⁹ Tye, *Journeying*, 209; Sitoy, *Several Springs*, 2: 880-881.

they saw it, the UCCP was making social action the primary activity of the church. They believed that the ecumenical drive of the UCCP was preventing it from evangelizing Roman Catholics. This perception of the UCCP's reticence to evangelize Roman Catholics gave evangelicals reason for entering areas where the UCCP was already firmly established. The views of Skivington, Tuggy and Toliver reflected in part their own prejudices, as Tuggy was involved in beginning the work of the Conservative Baptist denomination in the country, and Skivington for starting the work of the same denomination in Mindanao. But their views typified the opinions of evangelicals about the UCCP.¹³⁰

Among the groups that stayed outside the UCCP, but part of the Federation, was the Convention Baptists. Serious talks about joining the UCCP stalled on the issues of local church autonomy and the episcopacy. Some may have feared the secession of more congregations to ABWE or similar conservative Baptist denominations, if there were merger.¹³¹

The Convention Baptists, still receiving support from the American Baptist Convention, remained centered in the areas of the Philippines that had been theirs by comity, especially around Iloilo, Bacolod and Capiz. In 1950 the Baptists initiated a 10-year plan with the goals of deepening spiritual life, doubling the number of both churches and members, providing Bible studies for each member, and sending missionaries. They reentered Antique Province. Between 1953 and 1957 the number of Convention Baptist churches doubled. Most of the growth was in the rural and mountainous region of Negros Occidental. The 10-year goals were nearly accomplished. However, in 1960 only 40 percent of the Baptist churches had pastors.¹³²

¹³⁰ A. Leonard Tuggy and Ralph Toliver, *Seeing the Church in the Philippines* (Manila: OMF, 1972), 29-33; Robert Skivington, *Mission to Mindanao: A Study in the Principles of Church Planting Strategy for the Philippines* (Quezon City: Conservative Baptist Publications, 1977), 181; 313.

¹³¹ Tye, *Journeying*, 39; Sitoy, *Several Springs*, 2: 631.

¹³² *Year Book of the American Baptist Convention, 1950* (Philadelphia: Judson Press, [1950]), 253- 254, 576; *Yearbook of the American Baptist Convention, 1960* (Philadelphia: American Baptist Publication Society, [1960]), 186; Posey, .A History Study of Baptist Missions in the Philippines,. 107-108; Tuggy and Toliver, *Seeing the Church*, 43, 48-50; Nestor D. Bunda, *A Mission History of the Philippine Baptist Churches 1898-1998 from a Philippine Perspective* (Aachen: Verlag an der Lottbek im Besitz des

Baptist Greg Tingson Tingson became a popular evangelist. Tingson had met Billy Graham in 1947 through Youth for Christ, and became Vice President for the Orient in the Billy Graham organization. He held evangelistic meetings in Hong Kong, Japan, Taiwan and Korea, as well as revivals and Crusade for Christ rallies in various parts of the Philippines. For instance, in late 1956 Tingson held weeklong rallies at Central Philippine University, with 350 students and faculty members making “decisions.” Tingson served also as pastor of the Baptist Center Church in Iloilo and conducted a radio program in the city that had a wide impact. Tingson induced various Protestant groups to cooperate. He helped to form the Asian Evangelists Commission in 1964, and Capitol Christian Leadership in 1968.¹³³

The Methodists also stayed outside the UCCP, but part of the Federation. Methodists debated for decades whether to remain tied to American Methodism, to become an independent national church, or to join the UCCP. Some Methodists resented the fact that the UCCP had divided the entire country into four episcopal jurisdictions in 1948. It seemed to many Methodists, including Bishop Jose Valencia, that this constituted a breach in the 1901 comity arrangements and infringed upon Methodist territory. The UCCP, in turn, accused the Methodists of going into towns where there were already UCCP churches in order to plant new congregations, especially in Mindanao. At a meeting at Union Theological Seminary in late 1949 UCCP and Methodist representatives declared comity

Verlags Mainz, 1999), 215-220.

¹³³ Ben F. de Leon, .Reaching the Unserved Through the Air Waves., *The Philippine Christian Advance* 9 (January 1957), 8-9, 12; Greg Tingson, .Evangelistic Opportunities in Asia., *The Philippine Christian Advance* 10 (December 1958), 11; *The Philippine Christian Advance* 11 (May 1959), 28, 36; Ciriaco Ganchorre, .Iloilo City Ministers form Evangelical Fellowship., *The Philippine Christian Advance* 11 (October 1959), 29-31; Greg Tingson, *Mission and Obsession: A Collection of Essays, Addresses and Messages* (Quezon City: Asian Christian Outreach, 1982), 5-8, and Willy Marquez, .Gred Tingson: A Pragmatic, Caring Friend., in the same volume, 9-18; *Protestant Churches*, ed. Guillermo, 469.

agreements inoperative. The Methodists officially dissolved the comity agreements at its 1952 General Conference.¹³⁴

Among other reasons, Philippine politics kept the denominations apart. To Methodists, who retained ties to the American church, the UCCP represented an extreme nationalism. In reality, the geographic boundaries that had promoted cooperation early in the century divided Protestantism along ethnic lines. Methodists tended to support the rule of Ferdinand Marcos, an Ilocano. Marcos spoke at a gathering of Methodists on the eve of their 1968 Conference, where he recalled attending the Methodist Epworth League as a young man. He was glad, he said, to have the Methodists as a “partner in government.”¹³⁵ Retiring Bishop Jose Valencia told Marcos that the Methodist Church supported him in the task of nation building, and in his program of social justice and land reform. In other remarks, Bishop Cornelio Ferrer welcomed the changes Marcos promised in his “New Society.”¹³⁶

Though some Methodists argued for autonomy from the American church, others possessed, as Richard Deats put it, a “sense of intimate kinship with the Wesleyan spiritual heritage.”¹³⁷ One benefit from remaining attached to American Methodism was financial. The Methodist Church, including its Woman’s Division, averaged over \$310,000 per year in

¹³⁴ Enrique Sobrepena, “The State of the Church,” *The Philippine Christian Advance* 5 (June 1953), 5-6, 10, from a paper presented to the executive committee of the PFCC in May, 1953; Deats, *The Story of Methodism*, 103, 112-117.

¹³⁵ Valencia, *Under God’s Umbrella*, 125-129. See Sitoy’s extensive treatment of the relations between the UCCP and the Methodists in *Several Springs*, 2: 647-668.

¹³⁶ *The Filipino Methodist Magazine* 3 (April 1967), 14; Restituto Basa, “Meet the New Director of Public Schools,” *The Filipino Methodist Magazine* 3 (May-June 1967), 17; Cornelio Ferrer, “Rural Pulpit,” *Gulf Express* (September 21, 1975), 5; Cornelio Ferrer, “A Tree is Known by its Fruit,” *Gulf Express* (December 7, 1975), 5; *Tugon* 4 (January 1984), 16-29. See also Oscar S. Suarez, *Protestantism and Authoritarian Politics: The Politics of Repression and the Future of Ecumenical Witness in the Philippines* (Quezon City: New Day, 1999), 73-78, and the same author’s “Philippine Protestantism: An Appreciative but Critical Reflection,” in *Rice in the Storm: Faith in Struggle in the Philippines*, eds. Rebecca C. Asedillo and B. David Williams (New York: Friendship, 1989), 45-55. See also Jovito R. Salonga, *A Journey of Struggle and Hope* (Quezon City: University of the Philippines, 2001), 226-228.

¹³⁷ Deats, *Christianity and Nationalism*, 150. See also Gregorio Bailen, “Retain Our Present Church Structure with Modification and More Autonomy,” *The Filipino Methodist Magazine* 3 (August 1967), 6-7.

contributions to the Philippines in the 1950s and early 1960s. So, instead of uniting with other Protestants or becoming autonomous, Philippine Methodists maintained their ties to the American Methodist Conference.¹³⁸

Like their American counterparts, Methodists began to give up on the revival methods. They were embarrassed by the ways that other post-war Protestants were using them. Former Bishop D. D. Alejandro, though educated in the holiness tradition, complained in 1951, in reference to the newer Protestant groups entering the country: “Praying at the top of one’s voice and shouting hysterically all the time does not necessarily indicate the coming down of the Third Person of the Trinity in all His power and glory. And why speak of Pentecostal experience when what most of the people needed was not sanctifying but regenerating grace?” Methodists needed, Alejandro said, an approach more dignified than the “camp-meeting” style. Evangelists may come in for short periods, “shout and rent,” but fail to preach the gospel.¹³⁹

Nonetheless, in 1953 missionary C. L. Spottswood held an aggressive campaign in the Knox Memorial Church along Taft Avenue, the leading congregation of the Methodist denomination. He showed a film preceding his services, and also used the kneeling rail and at the end of every night’s service. It was filled with those surrendering or re-consecrating their lives.¹⁴⁰

More permanent means of reaching out were Methodist Youth and Student Centers at various locations, beginning with one in Sampaloc, Manila. Located amid universities, the Student Centers provided for

¹³⁸ Division of Foreign Missions, National Council of Churches of Christ in the USA, *Report[s] of the Division of Foreign Missions* (New York: Division of Foreign Missions, National Council of Churches in the USA, 1952-1962); Dionisio Alejandro, ‘The Holy Spirit in Christian Experience,’ in *Selected Philippine Sermons*, 68-82; Cornelio Ferrer, ‘The Backslider,’ *Gulf Express* (October 5, 1975), 5. See Deats, *Nationalism and Christianity*, 130-131; Jose L. Valencia, *Under God’s Umbrella: An Autobiography* (Quezon City: New Day, 1978), 98-105.

¹³⁹ D.D. Alejandro, ‘Evangelism: Its Methods,’ *The Philippine Faith and Life* 2 (1951), 12, 13. Cf. Samuel G. Catli, editorial, *Philippine Christian Advance* 4 (March 1952), 1.

¹⁴⁰ *The Philippine Christian Advance* 5 (December 1953), 10; Valencia, *Under God’s Umbrella*, 88-92.

recreational, educational, cultural and spiritual development and included a library, social hall, chapel, auditorium, classrooms and space for clubs.¹⁴¹

Methodism spread by following its members to various parts of the country, especially to Mindanao. The government, in an attempt to curtail the influence of Moslems on the island, and to deal with over-population and unrest in Central Luzon, encouraged resettlement in Mindanao. As a result, thousands of Ilocanos from Central Luzon moved to Mindanao. Those who were Methodists took their loyalties with them. The homogeneity of the church provided a place where uprooted Ilocano Protestants felt at home in an otherwise new and threatening land. But this close knittedness limited growth among other inhabitants. The church established the Mount Apo Christian Workers' School, and a Student Center facing Mindanao Institute of Technology in Kabacan, Cotabato. A Methodist Rural Center began in the same town in 1954, with the motto: "Christ for All of Life." It bred pigs, raised poultry, provided advice to farmers, showed educational films, and conducted lectures and demonstrations. It utilized the help and services of the government's Bureau of Agriculture.¹⁴²

The Methodist Church's social concern related to the rural conditions it faced in Central Luzon and Mindanao. Methodist ministers in the 1950s, even those pastoring in cities, were expected to know both how to win souls and to give advice on the best methods of farm cultivation. The church set up a Rural Life Institute in Nueva Ecija that provided lectures and demonstrations on health and sanitation, fruit-tree growing, pig raising, gardening, and nutrition. The church also set up a similar center in San Mateo, Isabela Province, and conducted health programs and clinics in the Cagayan Valley and several other places.¹⁴³

¹⁴¹ Deats, *The Story of Methodism*, 86-88; Vlencia, *Under God's Umbrella*, 110.

¹⁴² Victor Vinluan, "The Role of the Methodist Church in the Rural Life Movement in the Philippines." (STM thesis, Wesley Theological Seminary, 1960), 42-46. See also Francisco Galvez, "Methodist Work in Mindanao," *The Philippine Christian Advance* 12 (February 1960), 13-15; Curran L. Spottswood, *Beyond Cotabato* (Westwood, NJ: Fleming H. Revell, 1961), 15, 18, 49f, 86, 149-160, 181-182; Deats, *The Story of Methodism*, 103, 112-117; Tuggy and Toliver, *Seeing the Church*, 36-37.

¹⁴³ Vinluan, "Rural," 79-86; Deats, *The Story of Methodism*, 37-38, 104-105. For the post-war social situation in central Luzon see Benedict J. Kerkvliet, *The Huk Rebellion: A Study of Peasant Revolt in the Philippines* (Reprint, Quezon City: New Day, 1979), chapters 5 and 6.

There were a few internal divisions in the Methodist Church. The Methodists had been strong and prominent in Taytay, Rizal, for many years and had attracted various prominent citizens and town leaders to the faith before the war. A popular pastor, David Candelaria, led the congregation for over a decade during and after the war and planted churches in nearby towns. His brother Ruben served as District Superintendent for Greater Manila. In 1955 an American Pentecostal preacher held a revival in the Taytay church and encouraged members to be “filled with the Holy Spirit.” Both Candelaria brothers supported the new emphasis. As a result, the Conference forced Ruben Candelaria to resign as DS, and David Candelaria was forced out of his pastorate. However, he decided to stay in Taytay and with followers organized, in April 1956, the Taytay Methodist Community Church. He remained as pastor of this congregation until his retirement in 1973.¹⁴⁴

It is difficult to assess the strength of Methodism. The church almost doubled in the number of its congregations between 1948 and 1968, from 358 to 684. One report indicated that in 1949 the membership stood at 87,657, and that in 1960 it was 117,232, while another indicated a decline from 74,000 members in 1960 to 73,000 in 1970. Still another report was of as few as 60,041 members in 1968. Some Methodists attributed the decline to ecumenism.¹⁴⁵

Like the larger Methodist body, the IEMELIF remained outside of the UCCP, but part of the Federation. The church had reached its peak membership in 1925, when it stood at 25,000. No one could replace the charismatic founder of the church in leadership. Lazaro Trinidad, who served as bishop from 1953 to 1972, attempted, more than his predecessors, to reach out to other denominations.¹⁴⁶

¹⁴⁴ *Protestant Churches*, vol. 2, ed. Guillermo, 451-454.

¹⁴⁵ Compare Deats, *The Story of Methodism*, 103, 112-117; Tuggy and Toliver, *Seeing the Church*, 24-25, 34; James H. Montgomery and Donald A. McGavran, *The Discipling of a Nation* (Santa Clara, CA: Global Church Growth Bulletin, 1980), 72. See Eduardo Cajinat, paper read at the June, 1975, NCCP Convention, Manila, quoted in Reyes, *Breaking Through*, 177.

¹⁴⁶ Eduardo Gregorio, .The Reverend Marcelino C. Gutierrez at the Helm of the IEMELIF, . *The Philippine Christian Advance* 4 (April 1952), 5; *The Philippine Christian Advance* 4 (October 1952), 11; *The Philippine Christian Advance* 5 (February 1953), 9; *The Philippine Christian Advance* 5 (October 1953), 12; Ilustre Guloy, .The IEMELIF Cathedral, . *The Philippine Ecumenical Review* 1 (November 1964), 3; Montgomery and McGavran, *Discipling a Nation*, 117-119; *Ang Disiplina ng Iglesia*

The Philippine Federation of Evangelical Churches remained evangelical. Its motto in the late 1950s was “Each One Win One.”¹⁴⁷ The PFCC itself, as well as member denominations, helped to support a Billy Graham Crusade in Rizal Memorial Stadium in February 1956. Attending the rally were heads of various churches, including de los Reyes of the Iglesia Filipina Independiente.¹⁴⁸

Protestants remained in conflict with culture during these years over such vices as drinking, gambling and cockfighting, and town fiestas. Part of the problem with Roman Catholicism, Protestants said, was that in spite of 300 years of Christian dominance immorality, criminality, racketeering, smuggling, influence peddling, the misuse of public money and bribery were rampant throughout the country. Just as pre-war Protestants, their descendents in the post-war era knew that they could not run away from the evils of society, or do nothing to rectify the sufferings and miseries of the poor. Protestants waged a political campaign that helped convince President Elpidio Quirino in 1950 to veto a bill that would have allowed night clubs, cabarets, and dance halls to be built and to operate within 500 meters of a church. In places where they could, such as Cabanatuan, Nueva Ecija, where the Methodists were building a university in the 1950s, civic and religious leaders joined forces to minimize juvenile delinquency by outlawing “cabarets” altogether.¹⁴⁹

Evangelical Metodista en las Islas Filipinas (N.p., 1988), ii-v, 4-6.

¹⁴⁷ NCCC, *Ninth Annual Report*, 14.

¹⁴⁸ Artemio Guillermo, ‘Thousands Decide for Christ at Graham Rally,’ *The Philippine Christian Advance* 8 (April 1956), 14-15.

¹⁴⁹ Panlasigui, *The Psychology of Worship*, 82-83; Juan Nabong, ‘President Vetoes Cabaret Bill,’ *The Philippine Christian Advance* 2 (July 1950), 8, 24; ‘Cabarets Outlawed in Cabanatuan,’ *The Philippine Christian Advance* 11 (January 1959), 29; Jocano, ‘Conversion and the Patterning of Christian Experience,’ in *Acculturation in the Philippines*, eds. Gowing and Scott, 56-58.

Drinking alcohol remained a prominent Protestant issue through the early 1960s. Some, such as Jose Yap, wanted the government to come out openly against the manufacture, sale and drinking of alcohol. If we believe that drink is not good for our students, he said in 1954, we should have courage to advocate complete prohibition. Just because Prohibition had failed in the United States was no cause for pessimism that it also would fail in the Philippines. Protestant churches continued to emphasize the evils of alcohol upon national morality. Alcohol, wrote Maria Garcia in 1961, was a “homewrecker.” A husband who drank forgot his family and spent his earnings on liquor. Garcia urged education about alcohol, and support for public officials who took a stand against it, and public protests.¹⁵⁰

PFCC leaders Garcia and Nabong wrote to the mayor of Manila to protest the persistence of cock-fighting in the city, and its effects on students. In 1955 leaders also spoke against the Philippine Charity Sweepstakes, and in 1963 the PFCC opposed a bill that gave the Philippine Entertainment Association a 50-year franchise for gambling casinos in Pasay City and Corrigedor Island. The trend toward the legalization of gambling, Protestants warned, seriously weakened the moral stamina of the people.¹⁵¹

Even one so sophisticated as Jorge Bocobo complained in 1958 that the introduction of American customs such as women’s bobbed hair and wearing of slacks “killed the traditional womanliness and reserve of past

¹⁵⁰ Jose Yap, .Education and Intoxicating Drink., *The Philippine Christian Advance* 6 (November 1954), 3; Maria D. Garcia, .The Role of Women Against Alcoholism., *The Philippine Christian Advance* 13 (July 1961), 31-33. See also Cornelio Ferrer, .Fifty Reasons Why I Choose Not to Drink Liquor., *The Philippine Christian Advance* 11 (March 1959), 36-38; Samuel G. Catli, .Needed.More Temperance Education., *The Philippine Christian Advance* 12 (October 1960), 13, 25.

¹⁵¹ .PFCC Protests Cockfighting in Manila., *The Philippine Christian Advance* 4 (July 1952), 8; Jose Yap, editorial, *The Philippine Christian Advance and Rural Fellowship Bulletin* (January 1955), 36; Jose Yap, .Letter Sent to Congress., *The Philippine Christian Advance* 15 (June 1963), 38.

generations of Filipino women.” He also complained about the prevalence of comic books and poker.¹⁵²

Protestants warned about the dangers of cigarette smoking. In 1959 a young man was prohibited from the Methodist ministry because he smoked. Cornelio Ferrer, who was involved in the Rural Life Movement, lamented government subsidies to the tobacco companies, which, he believed, took away land that should be used for planting rice.¹⁵³

At the same time, the Federation encouraged the push toward rural life and ministries. It organized a summer school in agriculture for ministerial students and, perhaps more significantly, organized 87 credit unions among farmers. These credit unions helped tenant farmers and migrants to establish themselves on government land settlement projects and to purchase seeds.¹⁵⁴

The Philippine Federation of Christian Churches’ Rural Department, led by Cornelio Ferrer, sponsored institutes on national, regional and local levels to promote research on farming, and cooperation with local and national organizations. Rural Centers were bases for church extension work, centers for rural leadership training, and the demonstration of simple research-based farming. The first two Rural Centers were established in San Mateo, Isabela, and Kidapawan, Cotabato. Proper farming was related to theology. Superstitions and the conservatism of rural people hindered the development of good farms. They often believed that a poor harvest was due to the failure to win the good graces of spirits, or to their inability to pay

¹⁵² Jorge Bocobo, .Foreigners in Our Country., *The Philippine Christian Advance* 10 (November 1958), 4-7, 21.

¹⁵³ David Santiago, .Keeping Our Body Holy., *The Philippine Christian Advance* 11 (February 1959), 9-10; .Tobacco and Public Welfare., *The Philippine Christian Advance* 10 (December 1958), 36; Lean Delfin and Eugene A. Hessel, .Is It Unchristian to Smoke?. *The Philippine Christian Advance* 14 (February 1962), 52-54; Cornelio Ferrer, .Willful Blindness., *The Philippine Christian Advance* 15 (June 1963), 3, 43.

¹⁵⁴ Vinluan, .Rural., 55.

sufficient homage to the Virgin Mary, or to joint in a pilgrimage to a shrine. So the rural programs were conjoined with evangelism.¹⁵⁵

An area of common effort among several Federation-affiliated churches was theological education. The program at Union emphasized preparation for rural ministries. In 1962 Union moved to a new campus, away from its location on Taft Avenue in downtown Manila, to a 97-hectare campus in rural Dasmarinas, Cavite. This reflected leaders' belief that the future of Protestant work in the Philippines rested in the countryside.¹⁵⁶

Union and several other schools came under the guidance of the Theological Education Fund, which was sponsored by the World Council of Churches. The aim of the Fund was to “emancipate” ministerial training from American missions, and to encourage indigenous thought and systems. The Fund helped to establish the Inter-Seminary Urban-Industrial Institute, the Clinical Pastoral Education Institute, the Institute for Mass Communications, and the Christian Institute for Ethnic Studies in Asia. The Fund succeeded, in its own estimation, in providing students the opportunity of trading their “bourgeois” identity for a closer understanding of the poor.¹⁵⁷

¹⁵⁵ Victor C. Vinluan, .The Role of the Methodist Church in the Rural Life Movement in the Philippines., STM thesis, Wesley Theological Seminary, 1960, 23, 90-96.

¹⁵⁶ Albert Sanders, *The Evangelical Ministry in the Philippines and Its Future* ([Manila]: National Council of Churches in the Philippines, 1964), 13-19, 31f, 59-60, 63-64, 70; Vinluan, .Rural., 59; *The Philippine Christian Advance* 3 (November 1951), 16; Walter N. Roberts, Philip del Rosario and Jose F. Dabuet. *Survey Report on Theological Education in the Philippines* (Quezon: Philippine Federation of Christian Churches, n.d. [1962]), 79-93; Deats, *The Story of Methodism*, 73-77; Division of Foreign Missions, National Council of Churches of Christ in the USA, *Fourteenth Annual Report, 1963* (New York: National Council of Churches, 1963), 10; Cornelio Ferrer, *Pastor to the Rural Philippines: An Autobiography* (Quezon City: New Day, 1974), 35-40.

¹⁵⁷ Christine Linenemann-Perrin, *Training for a Relevant Ministry: A Study of the Work of the Theological Education Fund* (Madras: Christian Literature Society, 1981), 145-160.

Protestants in the Philippines in the 1950s and early 1960s understood that Protestantism was inherently democratic, and that communism was an “evil ideology,” as Ilustre Guloy put it. The Federation issued anti-communist literature. Yet, as early as 1950 the Philippine Federation was being labeled by some Protestants as communist-infiltrated. In fact the charges, made by an American Protestant minister, led to an investigation of the Federation by the National Bureau of Investigation in the early 1950s. The government concluded that the attack on the Federation had no basis and commended the PFCC for its constructive aid to democracy. (The same kinds of charges were being made in the United States against the National Council of Churches and the World Council of Churches). As a result of the incident, the Federation pled with mission boards only to send missionaries who were ecumenically sensitive, not “faith” missionaries who were, in Guloy’s words, “masquerading as servants of Christ and specializing in sowing seeds of dissension in the church.”¹⁵⁸

The incident worsened relations between Protestants within the Federation and conservative denominations and para-church organizations that remained outside it.

OUTSIDE THE FEDERATION

Among the denominations that remained outside the Federation was the Iglesia Filipina Independiente (Philippine Independent Church). In August 1901, at the early stage of comity arrangements, Gregorio Aglipay approached the Evangelical Union about possible cooperation. Formerly a Roman Catholic priest and chaplain to the revolutionary government, Aglipay was the church’s founder (along with Isabelo de los Reyes, Sr.) and Supreme Bishop. But the missionaries refused to cooperate with him because of what they perceived to be the IFI’s insufficient Protestant orientation. They told him that if his church was to be Protestant the Bible must be clearly authoritative, the clergy must be allowed to marry, and “Mariolatry” must be abolished. Another issue was that IFI ministers had kept mistresses, gambled and engaged in cockfighting when still Roman

¹⁵⁸ Ilustre Z. Guloy, “Spreading Righteousness Over the Land,” *The Philippine Christian Advance* 15 (August 1963), 17-18.

Catholic priests. Missionaries felt, nonetheless, that the IFI had helped Protestantism by diverting for the moment the fury of the Roman Catholic Church from them, and for tearing tens of thousands of Filipinos away from Rome. Despite its shortcomings, missionaries were confident that many in the IFI heard the Word truly preached and were saved.¹⁵⁹

Rebuffed by these Protestants, in 1904 Aglipay attempted to establish ties with the Protestant Episcopal Church. Aglipay approached Episcopal Bishop Charles Brent with the idea of the PEC's either recognizing his episcopal standing or re-consecrating him as Bishop.. Brent greatly disliked Aglipay and wanted no war with the Roman Catholics. Brent felt that his recognition of the IFI would create the impression that the Episcopal Church aimed to discredit or to weaken the Roman Catholic Church, and refused.¹⁶⁰

Having been turned away by both evangelical and Episcopal Protestants, Aglipay and de los Reyes, turned to Unitarianism. By the time Aglipay died in 1940 there were two opposing factions in the church. The 1940 election for "Obispo Maximo" pitted Santiago Fonacier, who was Unitarian in his beliefs, against Bishop Servando Castro, a Trinitarian. With his election, Fonacier agreed to incorporate some Trinitarian doctrines into the church, such as using a Trinitarian formula at baptisms.¹⁶¹

¹⁵⁹ Stuntz, *The Philippines and the Far East*, 489-494; Mary D. Clifford, .Iglesia Filipina Independiente: The Revolutionary Church., in *Studies in Philippine Church History*, ed. Anderson, 234; Apilado, .Revolution, Colonialism and Mission., 170.

¹⁶⁰ Lewis B. Whittemore, *Struggle for Freedom: History of the Philippine Independent Church* (Greenwich, CT: Seabury, 1961), 137-141; Deats, *Nationalism and Christianity*, 72-75; Clymer, *Protestant Missionaries*, 120-123.

¹⁶¹ Pedro S. Achutegui and Miguel A. Bernad, *Documents Relative to the Religious Revolution in the Philippines: The Life and Church of Gregorio Aglipay*, second ed., revised ([Manila]: Ateneo de Manila U. Press, 1968), 2: 14-19. For the American Unitarian Association connection see Louis Cornish, *The Philippines Calling* (Philadelphia: Dorrance, 1942).

When his term expired, and even after the war was over, Fonacier, in violation of the church's constitution, did not call for a church convention and went on consecrating bishops. He expelled two bishops, including the President of the Supreme Council of Bishops, Manuel Aguilar, in 1945 for insubordination. Aguilar called for a Supreme Council meeting in January 1946, but Fonacier did not recognize its legitimacy. Yet seven of the church's 15 bishops attended the rump Council and voted to depose Fonacier. The significantly larger Trinitarian faction centered their actions against Fonacier upon his violations of church law. The issue came under the purview of the Philippine Supreme Court and it took until 1955 to settle the case.¹⁶²

The anti-Fonacier wing was Trinitarian and among its leaders was Bishop Isabelo de los Reyes, Jr., who had become Bishop of Manila in 1925. Soon after that he began administering the sacraments in the name of the Trinity, which was not the practice of the older leaders. His daily contacts with the masses kept his faith on historic theological grounds. The Trinitarian faction elected de los Reyes Supreme Bishop. In 1947 this faction issued a new "Declaration of the Faith and Articles of Religion." Its intent to bring the church "into the stream of historic Christianity and be universally acknowledged as a true branch of the Catholic Church," and to "eradicate such errors of judgment and doctrine as crept into its life and official documents in times past."¹⁶³

On the crucial issue of the Trinity the Declaration confessed Jesus Christ as "very and eternal God, of one substance with the Father, and the

¹⁶² Achutegui and Bernad, *Religious Revolution*, 2: 24-25.

¹⁶³ *Sixty-Sixth Foundation Anniversary: Philippine Independent Church* (Manila: National Cathedral Commission, Philippine Independent Church, 1968), 16. See Isabelo De los Reyes, Jr. "The Iglesia Filipina Independiente," *Historical Magazine of the Protestant Episcopal Church* 17 (June 1948): 134; Whittemore, *Struggle for Freedom*, 166-176; Achutegui and Bernad, *Religious Revolution*, 2: 27-46; Clifford, "Iglesia Filipina Independiente," 251-252. Cf. Donald McGavran, "The Independent Church in the Philippines: The Story of a Spiritual Quest," *Encounter* 19 (Summer 1958), 312-314.

Persons of the Trinity as of one “substance, power and eternity.” It affirmed the Apostles’ and Nicene creeds.¹⁶⁴

In 1947 the Protestant Episcopal Church bishops in the United States decided favorably toward the consecration of Trinitarian faction IFI bishops. Three Protestant Episcopal bishops conducted the service in Manila in April 1948. They consecrated three IFI bishops were consecrated, including de los Reyes. IFI bishops thus gained, in their eyes and in the eyes of the worldwide Anglican communion, the legitimacy of apostolic succession. The PEC and IFI allowed for IFI ministers to be educated at the PEC’s St. Andrew’s Theological Seminary in Quezon City. Though the IFI understood itself as “catholic, reformed and autonomous,” it began to revise its liturgy to more fully conform to Anglican usage.¹⁶⁵

At the time of the concordat the IFI baptized 100,000 and confirmed 50,000 persons annually, yet was a church in decline. Its overall membership had remained constant. While in 1918, the IFI represented 15 percent of the Filipino population, in 1970 it represented only four percent. Relative decline was especially apparent in Manila.¹⁶⁶

Even stronger ties with the Episcopal Church were established with the “Concordat of Full Communion,” which was approved by the Protestant Episcopal Convention in the United States in 1961. The Concordat stated that each of the two denominations would recognize the catholicity and autonomy of the other, that “each believes the other to hold all the essentials of the Christian faith.”¹⁶⁷ With the Concordat went sizable grants of money from the PEC for IFI buildings, school construction, lay and clergy training programs, and even retirement benefits for IFI priests.

¹⁶⁴ *Sixty-Sixth Foundation Anniversary*, 15-17.

¹⁶⁵ De los Reyes, Jr., .The Iglesia Filipina Independiente., 134-137; Whittemore, *Struggle for Freedom*, 179-180; De los Reyes, Jr., .Interdenominational Understanding., *The Philippine Christian Advance* 8 (October 1956), 8-10, 30; *The Philippine Christian Advance* 10 (October 1958), 19; Deats, *Nationalism and Christianity*, 85. See also John R. Whitney, .Philippine National Religion and the Philippine Independent Church., *Anglican Theological Review* 53 (April 1971), 98; H. Ellsworth Chandlee, .The Liturgy of the Philippine Independent Church., in Anderson, ed., *Studies in Philippine Church History*, 266-275.

¹⁶⁶ Daniel F. Doepfers, Changing Patterns of Aglipayan Adherence in the Philippines, 1918-1970., *Philippine Studies* 25 (1977), 270-271.

¹⁶⁷ Cornelius Ferrer, .First Church Concordat in the Philippines., *The Philippine Christian Advance* 13 (December 1961), 14.

Soon there were more IFI than Episcopal students at St. Andrews. In 1965 the IFI had 38 bishops, 424 priests and 1.4 million members (five percent of the population of the Philippines at the time), compared to the PEC's three bishops, 95 priests (of whom one-third were foreign), and 62,000 members.¹⁶⁸

Meanwhile, de los Reyes had become friends with Enrique Sobrepena, both Ilocanos. Through Sobrepena, the IFI benefited from Orient (later Philippine) Crusades, which provided the denomination with two million copies of the Gospel of John. De los Reyes encouraged interested IFI members to enroll in the Orient Crusades' correspondence courses.¹⁶⁹

The social and political contexts that had given the IFI its reason to be at the turn of the century no longer existed and, as John Whitney observed, the IFI moved from being an "ethnic" to an "ecumenic" religion. While still celebrating its Filipino-ness, it now also celebrated Christian ecumenicity. In 1958 the IFI joined the World Council of Churches.¹⁷⁰

While the IFI was becoming more world-minded, the Philippine Episcopal Church was becoming more Filipino. In 1959 Benito Cabanban, pastor of the Holy Trinity Church in Zamboanga, became Suffragan Bishop, assisting Bishop Ogilby.¹⁷¹

Along with the Presbyterian Church, the Philippine Episcopal Church was one of the two denominations most heavily financing work in the

¹⁶⁸ Walter Roberts, Philip del Rosario and Jose Dabnet, *Survey Report on Theological Education in the Philippines* (Quezon City: Philippine Federation of Christian Churches, [1962]), 65-73; Gerald Anderson and Peter Gowing, 'The Philippines, Bulwark of the Church in Asia', in *Christ and Crisis in Southeast Asia*, ed. Gerald Anderson (New York: Friendship, 1968), 147; Whitney, 'Philippine National Religion', 98; Christine Linenemann-Perrin, *Training for a Relevant Ministry: A Study of the Work of the Theological Education Fund* (Madras: Christian Literature Society, 1981), 162; Artemio Zabala, 'Towards Understanding Our Quest for Unity and the Nature of the Unity We Seek', *Asia Journal of Theology* 4 (April 1990), 186-189.

¹⁶⁹ Sitoy, *Several Streams*, 2: 879.

¹⁷⁰ Gowing, *Islands Under the Cross*, 201-210; Donald V. Brand, 'The Philippine Independent Church: A Social Movement'. PhD dissertation, Cornell University, 1980, 1-2, 118-121; Whitney, 'Philippine National Religion', 90-92, 100-102.

¹⁷¹ Artemio Guillermo, 'First Filipino Episcopal Bishop Consecrated', *The Philippine Christian Advance* 11 (April 1959), 37.

Philippines in the 1950s and 1960s. In the 1950s its expenditures in the Philippines averaged over \$342,000 per year. After the Concordat, Episcopalians added about \$100,000 dollars more per year to this amount, and by 1990 the amount had risen to one million dollars per year.¹⁷²

THE NATIONAL COUNCIL OF CHURCHES IN THE PHILIPPINES

Some desired for the Federation to be more inclusive. One way would have been to change the Federation's charter, but the desire was to incorporate Christian bodies that would not have come together under a federation system. The Federation had been entrusted and empowered with duties and prerogatives, but a council would be a place of consultation, a meeting-place where mutual agreements and plans of action could be worked out. Enrique Sobrepena, the mastermind behind many of the earlier ecumenical moves, who then was serving as Chairman of the East Asia Christian Conference, called for a consultation of churches in the Philippines, sponsored not by the PFCC but by the EACC. After four consultations, in which both IFI and PEC leaders were prominent, an inaugural convention was held November 7-9, 1963.¹⁷³

The Convention elected de los Reyes as Chairman, and three vice chairmen: Fidel Galang (Methodist), Lyman Obilby (Episcopal), and Enrique Sobrepena (UCCP). Jose Yap (Baptist) served as administrative secretary, and George Castro (IEMILEF) as secretary. The "Basis of Membership" described the NCCP as "a fellowship of churches which confess the Lord Jesus Christ as God and Savior according to the Scriptures and therefore seek to fulfill together their common calling to the glory of the one God, Father, Son and Holy Spirit." Joining the NCCP were the UCCP, the Convention Baptist Church, the Methodist Church, the IEMELIF, the Church [Disciples] of Christ, UNIDA, the IFI and the PEC.

¹⁷² Division of Foreign Missions, National Council of Churches of Christ in the USA, *Report[s] of the Division of Foreign Missions* (New York: Division of Foreign Missions, National Council of Churches in the USA, 1952-1962); *The Philippine Inquirer* (July 16, 1993).

¹⁷³ Faustino Quiocho, "Birth of NCC in the Philippines," *The Philippine Christian Advance* 14 (October 1962), 19-21; *The Philippine Christian Advance* 15 (December 1963), 39-40.

At the time of its organization, the NCCP claimed to represent 2.25 million Filipinos, over half of whom were members of the IFI.¹⁷⁴

At the time of the founding of the National Council of Churches of the Philippines the picture still seemed bright for the Protestant establishment. It could measure well its impact in government, the professions, and business. The colleges under the auspices of the Protestants reflected the “reforming and liberalizing spirit of Protestantism,”¹⁷⁵ and Protestants were active in promoting social services such as cooperatives and credit unions, and, to the ire of Roman Catholics, birth control. The older Protestantism was emerging, it seemed to learned observers, as the religion of the middle class.¹⁷⁶

De los Reyes, finding himself now in the center of Protestant leadership, and very far from the IFI of his father, heralded the “dawn of Christian unity in the Philippines.” He expressed hope that the NCCP would raise the “standards of life and beliefs of our people and help reduce the record of crime and moral lapse that is ours.” But he also hoped that the Roman Catholic Church might join the NCCP in order to make “larger numbers of true men and true women, strong in the knowledge of how to pray, how to live and how to die.”¹⁷⁷

The organization of the NCCP both reflected and brought about a change of attitude within Protestants toward Roman Catholicism and evangelism. Neither the IFI nor the PEC possessed the evangelistic, moral and strident anti-Roman Catholic heritage that had remained among the other older denominations in the 1950s. Both were “high church” in their

¹⁷⁴ Agustin Masa, .The National Council of Churches in the Philippines,. The Philippine Christian Advance 14 (July 1962), 4-7; *The Philippine Christian Advance* 14 (September 1962), 4-7, 19; *The Philippine Christian Advance* 16 (February 1964), 7, 12; Ilustre Guloy, .National Council of Churches,. *The Philippine Christian Advance* 16 (March 1964), 4-6; Gowing, *Islands Under the Cross*, 200.

¹⁷⁵ Gowing, *Islands Under the Cross*, 192.

¹⁷⁶ Gowing, *Islands Under the Cross*, 184-193. See also Sitoy, *Several Springs*, 2: 568-570.

¹⁷⁷ *The Philippine Ecumenical Review* 1 (October 1964), 3.

liturgy and, like Roman Catholics, venerated Mary and other saints. They did not take strong stands against smoking and drinking. Their admittance into the Council altered the groups that were part of the NCCP. Groups that previously had criticized Roman Catholic “idolatry” or who had spoken out against smoking and drinking, for instance, could no longer do so in the company of fellow members of the NCCP if they intended to maintain smooth relationships. The issue of smoking became delicate among Protestants.¹⁷⁸

The addition of the PEC and IFI contributed to growing toleration among Council-related Protestants toward many aspects of the dominant Roman Catholic society. But it became unlikely that Protestant groups that conceived their main task to be evangelizing Roman Catholics would join the NCCP.

Among the few groups that joined the NCCP in the years following the war were the Salvation Army and the Lutheran Church (Missouri Synod).

Like other groups both within the NCCP and outside of it, the Salvation Army was involved in various compassionate ministries. Like groups that remained outside the NCCP, the Salvation Army was conservative in theology and in prohibiting smoking and drinking. After the war, the Philippine Salvation Army was placed under US jurisdiction and there was an almost complete change in missionary personnel. The training college reopened in 1947. The accountability of the Salvation Army in the Philippines shifted to the international headquarters in London in 1955. The Salvation Army erected a new headquarters building in Ermita in 1956. Three Filipinos were sent to London for training. Upon return, one, B. L. Daguio, took over the Salvation Army’s training program. The Salvation Army was engaged in evangelistic work, but also established a missing

¹⁷⁸ Juan Nabong, .Killing Our Prophets., *The Filipino Methodist Magazine* 1 (March 1966), 5, 18.

persons bureau, a medical work specializing in hair-lip cases, and a variety of other social services.¹⁷⁹

The Lutheran Church joined the NCCP in November 1969. The Lutherans had entered the Philippines at almost the exact time that the country gained its independence in July 1946 with the idea of revitalizing Roman Catholicism. For 20 years, Lutherans refrained from cooperating with other Protestants, whom they felt had a “hazy” concept of the Law and Gospel, and who told Filipinos wrongly that they needed to be good in order to be saved. Like other members of the NCCP, the Lutheran Church was liturgical and tolerated smoking and drinking. Yet, like other newer denominations, it was theologically conservative and drew many of its early leaders from the ranks of the older churches.¹⁸⁰

Alvaro Cariño, a Filipino who had graduated from Concordia Seminary, arrived in July 1946, and another missionary, Herman Mayers arrived later the same year. The strategy was to begin work in the cities, and to use the cities as bases of outreach into rural areas. Mayers took the southern part, and Cariño took the northern part of Manila. In December 1946, Bethel Lutheran Church was dedicated by Cariño in northern Manila. A Tagalog service began in 1948 under Guillermo Dionisio, a former Methodist. Dionisio had studied at Union, and had pastored for 30 years. Many of his former members in the Methodist Church became Lutheran.¹⁸¹

In 1949 Lutheran services began in La Trinidad, near Baguio, in the home of a former UCCP pastor, Simon Bilagot, who urged the Lutherans to expand into the Mountain Province. Bilagot himself was instrumental in the mountain area work. Lutherans established work in the Kankanaey area of Guinzadan, Bauko, in 1950. In 1951 the work expanded to Abatan and Loo, Buguias, Mountain Province. Work in the mountains included literacy

¹⁷⁹ .Salvation Army in the Philippines., *The Philippine Christian Advance* 14 (June 1962), 14-15; *Protestant Churches*, vol. 2, ed. Guillermo, 367-375.

¹⁸⁰ Herbert Kretzmann, .Lutheranism in the Philippines, 1952-1966., STM thesis, Concordia Seminary, St. Louis, 1966, 41, 308, 319-320, 326, 334-337.

¹⁸¹ Kretzmann, .Lutheranism., 51-58, 62-66, 97; David Londenberg, *A Look at the Lutherans: A Philippine Case Study* (Baguio: D.L.L. Publications, 1976), 14.

programs and Lutherans established a hospital in Abatan. Clinics operated in the area from this base.¹⁸²

Missionaries established work in Mindanao at Cagayan de Oro and Davao in late 1949. The church in Cotabato City began in 1960 in the home of a group that had split from the Grace Bible Church, which itself had split from the local CMA church. By 1965 there were 11 Lutheran congregations and 1,200 members in Mindanao.¹⁸³

The church inaugurated Lutheran Theological Seminary in Manila in June 1955. It moved to Baguio in 1961 with new instructors. Enrollment remained small.¹⁸⁴

In 1956 the church organized itself as the Philippine Lutheran Church, with three districts. It was controlled by a Board of Directors, which included three clergymen and three laypersons, one from each of the districts. In 1962 the Conference declared itself ready, able and eager to assume authority in administration over its own affairs, without subjection to the Mission, and after 1963 it elected its own President.¹⁸⁵

Lutheran work began in various other locations outside of Manila, including Ilagan, Isabela, in 1960. However, the work was hurt when Wesleyan Methodists purchased property for their Isabela headquarters adjacent to the Lutherans. In Northern Cagayan Valley, the Lutherans fared better. Feliciano Inay, an IFI priest, began reading Lutheran literature and teachings. In 1961 he and 130 members from his congregation were received by the Lutherans, and Inay established a congregation in Ballesteros. Inay attended the Lutheran Seminary and was re-ordained in the Lutheran church. At least 11 churches in the Cagayan area were attributed

¹⁸² Kretzmann, .Lutheranism., 72-76, 149-150, 214-215, 268, 279, 284-287, 301.

¹⁸³ Kretzmann, .Lutheranism., 165-186.

¹⁸⁴ Kretzmann, .Lutheranism., 216-228, 346.

¹⁸⁵ Kretzmann, .Lutheranism., 267-278.

to his ministry or influence with family members. He carefully spent time with each of these churches and interviewed each prospective church member. He required of members the completion of a three-year course of study, which included mastery of Martin Luther's Catechism. Other transfers to the Lutheran Church in the northeastern part of the province included Ricardo Advincula, from the Peniel Church of the Voice of China and Asia, who pastored four congregations.¹⁸⁶

Lutheran leaders assessed the church's task in 1969 as proclaiming God's message to sinful men and women, strengthening and training those whom God has called to serve, and demonstrating in acts of love God's own love for all. Their particular role in the Philippines was to perpetuate the Reformation heritage, and to seek to bridge the gap between Roman Catholics and Protestants while keeping a separate identity, and cooperate with others. It was their responsibility to witness to the unbaptized, and to nurture the baptized. They maintained a concern for physical and mental as well as spiritual needs.¹⁸⁷

The decision to join the NCCP in 1969 was not taken lightly. The stated reasons the church joined were that: (1) The church needed involvement with other denominations in order to demonstrate an already existing sense of unity with them. (2) Joining was a natural expression of the Lutheran confessional position. (3) There was need for mutual growth through sharing and fellowship with others. (4) The Lutheran Church could learn valuable lessons about God's mission in the Philippines by working together with groups with longer histories in the country. (5) Joining provided greater opportunities for community, national and even world involvement. The only reservations the Lutherans had about joining related

¹⁸⁶ Kretzmann, „Lutheranism,„ 128-130; Londenberg, *A Look*, 117-120.

¹⁸⁷ „The Church and Her Task,„ *Concordia Theological Monthly* 40 (November 1969), 702-704.

to communion. The Lutherans practiced a communion closed to other Protestants and preferred that the NCCP not hold communion services. After the Lutherans joined, the NCCP convention elected Alvaro Carino, then serving as President of the Lutheran Church of the Philippines, one of the three vice-chairmen.¹⁸⁸

While Lutherans expanded, UCCP-related missionary Peter Gowing rejoiced that most Protestant growth was “natural” rather than by proselytism from the Roman Catholics. This was “good news,” he believed, “for the future relationship between the two households.” The Roman Catholics would respect religious liberty more, said Gowing, if Protestants were less stridently anti-Roman Catholic. Gowing felt that the Vatican II decisions, which coincided with the birth of the NCCP, promised even more fruitful dialogue.¹⁸⁹ Likewise, Jose Yap was optimistic that “the time may come when instead of dissipating our energies and resources in quarreling with one another, the Christian forces in this land may join hands in combating the forces of error and evil which prevent men from enjoying the sweetness of redemption and keep our country from enjoying greatness and prosperity.” No longer, Yap noted, was almost every Protestant sermon in the Philippines devoted to criticisms of the Roman Catholics.¹⁹⁰

Rather than quarreling with the Roman Catholics, Protestants in the NCCP increasingly put their energies in social projects. The NCCP directly helped in community projects such as the construction of irrigation systems, public school buildings, bridges, barrio trails, and even airstrips. For instance, in 1966 the NCCP erected a Rural Center and Livestock

¹⁸⁸ David Schneider, „Lutheran Church in the Philippines Joins Council, *Concordia Theological Monthly* 41 (April 1970), 229-230. The Lutherans joined PCEC in 1999.

¹⁸⁹ Peter Gowing, „The Roman Catholic Church in the Philippines Today, *The Philippine Christian Advance* 16 (March 1964), 7-16.

¹⁹⁰ Jose Yap, „Report of the Administrative Secretary to the Second General Convention. NCCP, *The Philippine Ecumenical Review* (Special Issue) [1965]. See also Mariadel Rey, „Protestantism in the Philippines: Its Impact After 70 Years. I, *The Christian Century* 89 (October 18, 1972), 1047.

Cooperative in Dasmariñas; financed a swine project at Eveland Memorial Academy; organized farmers' cooperatives and self-help projects; and purchased farm tractors.¹⁹¹

The sense that missionaries of earlier decades had not been sufficiently attuned to social needs became a common theme among Protestant leaders. Some forgot that there had been a strong sense among early missionaries of responsibility toward society. Perhaps they were thinking more about the evangelical denominations that were entering the country in the post-war years, and assuming that the earlier missionaries had also carried the same aversions to the “social gospel.” The supposed “other-worldliness” of both pre-war Protestantism and contemporary evangelicalism in the country became a recurring theme of Protestants associated with the NCCP.¹⁹²

Leaders of the NCCP-related churches were unhappy with the role of American missionaries in the Philippines and the “colonial mentality” pervading the church as well as society. Missionaries still enjoyed prestige, and continued to live in and to impose American values, manners, and norms upon Filipino churches. American missionaries insisted on their own wishes, and ignored Filipino leaders. Their actions and relations reflected a continued colonial mentality. Often Filipino leaders made plans, only to be rebuffed by the mission boards, Artemio Guillermo wrote. Enrique Sobrepena agreed. Protestantism in the Philippines must draw its strength from Christians from within the country itself.¹⁹³ Arsenio Dominguez, who had worked with New Tribes before founding the Philippine Missionary Institute in 1961, felt that no matter how well meaning the missionary might

¹⁹¹ Jose Yap, .Report of the National Council of Churches in the Philippines,. [1966], mimeographed, 3 pp., Ferrer papers.

¹⁹² E.g., Montes, .Social Thinking,. 22-26, 33.

¹⁹³ Artemio Guillermo, .Stirrings for Self-Assertion,. *The Philippine Christian Advance* 11 (June 1959), 14-16; Enrique Sobrepena, .Missions Strategy for Our Day,. *The Philippine Christian Advance* 12 (August 1960), 2-3, 48. See also Juan Nabong, .Colonial Mentality,. *The Philippine Christian Advance* 11 (March 1959), 8-10; Sitoy, *Several Streams*, 2: 619-621.

be, Filipinos' leadership abilities were stifled so long as the missionary remained in the Philippines.¹⁹⁴

The addition of denominations in the late 1940s and 1950s upset the older denominations' leaders. With the demise of comity, Juan Nabong lamented, "a little religious civil war" was underway.¹⁹⁵ The older groups' leaders complained that the newly arriving churches did not go to unreached areas, but built up congregations made up of many former Methodists, Presbyterians, Disciples and Baptists. A study of theological education in the Philippines similarly lamented the proliferation of schools and the "fragmentation of the gospel."¹⁹⁶

This continued dependency upon American missionaries disturbed Frederick Dale Bruner, who taught for several years at Union Theological Seminary. Bruner voiced his opinion that American missionaries in the Philippines needed to go home. He believed that they impeded the "wholesome, natural growth of an indigenous and responsible Philippine Christianity." UTS itself, he found, was 95 percent financed with American funds. It made Filipinos seem destitute, and Americans benevolent, thus perpetuating colonial mentality. As Bruner put it, the Filipinos were "suffering under the bear-hug help of its American Samaritan," and were losing their self-respect and identity. Really, Bruner believed, there was not a lack of Filipino money. It was just unused because it seemed unneeded as long as money flowed in from the United States. The Americans had overstayed their usefulness and were in danger of "suffocating" the Filipino church, Bruner said. There was too much of an American point of view among Filipino Protestants. In the church as well as politically, Filipinos who chafed under this colonialism could not but be anti-American.¹⁹⁷

¹⁹⁴ Arsenio Dominguez, "The Evangel and Nationalism.. *Evangelical Missions Quarterly* 7 (Summer 1971), 211-222; Dominguez, *Theological Themes for the Philippine Church* (Quezon City: New Day, 1989), 79-80.

¹⁹⁵ Juan Nabong, "Why don't We Try Church Union.. *The Philippine Christian Advance* 13 (January 1961), 28-32, 53.

¹⁹⁶ Roberts, del Rosario and Dabuet, *Survey Report*, 33.

¹⁹⁷ Frederick Dale Bruner, "The American Missionary Problem: An Essay in Conscience.. *The Christian Century* 85 (June 5, 1968), 751-753.

There was a large degree of sympathy among NCCP-related missionaries for Bruner's stand. Ralph George, who served with the American Baptist Mission, wrote: "While older denominations are turning over more and more responsibility to national workers, the country is being flooded with more and more American missionaries, mostly from small sects and independent groups. Perhaps the strongest of these who have come since World War II are the Mormons, the Southern Baptists and the Assemblies of God—all of whom have numbers of missionaries." "There has developed," George continued, "overlapping and competition and much confusion and misunderstanding among the Filipinos."¹⁹⁸

Perhaps one half of the missionaries associated with the older churches went home between 1968 and 1975.¹⁹⁹

Though the NCCP represented a majority of the Protestants when it was organized, it represented only a fraction of the Protestant groups working in the Philippines. The trend was shifting away from many of the NCCP-affiliated older bodies. When the National Council of Churches was formed, there were already 260 denominations, both indigenous and of American origin, working in the Philippines. As Douglas Ellwood computed it in 1968, 84 percent of the 1,380 Protestant missionaries then in the Philippines represented "independent" mission agencies, compared to about 25 percent before the war. Those having more than 50 missionaries in the Philippines included the Overseas Missionary Fellowship (96); Far East Gospel Crusades (73); Wycliffe Bible Translators (115); Episcopal (60);

¹⁹⁸ Quoted in Raymond W. Beaver, *Partners in Mission: American Baptists and Philippine Baptists in Mission Together 1900-1985* (Iloilo: ABC, 1988), 175.

¹⁹⁹ See Bruner, "The American Missionary Problem in the Philippines," *Solidarity* (June 1968). See also Tye, *Journeying*, 241-242, 255-259. See a rebuttal to Bruner by William H. Scott, "Rethinking the American Missionary Presence in the Philippines," *International Review of Mission* 64 (April 1975), 177-184.

See also Scott, "Some Contrasts in Missionary Patterns," *Practical Anthropology* 15 (November-December 1968), 269-276.

Methodist Church (55); Philippine Interboard [Presbyterian, EUB and the American Board] (78); Association of Baptists for World Evangelism (78); and Southern Baptist (71).²⁰⁰

Members were simply changing denominations, and very little actual Protestant growth was taking place, older Protestants feared. They worried that the gospel itself was being fragmented by the entry into the country of so many sects; that the kind of Protestantism that was being imported to the Philippines was thoroughly American; and that their efforts toward indigenizing the leadership and character of Philippine Protestantism were going by the wayside with the heavy influx of American missionaries and money.²⁰¹

OUTSIDE THE FEDERATION AND COUNCIL: THE OLDER GROUPS

Several of the older denominations that stayed out of affiliation with the Federation and later the NCCP grew tremendously in the post-war years.

The Christian and Missionary Alliance benefited greatly from migrations of other Protestants to Western Mindanao, where it had stayed by comity arrangements. CMA workers, such as Anastacion Bulnes, himself a Baptist pastor before migrating to Mindanao, established congregations among new settlers. With the rapid growth of congregations, the CMA used lay pastors and deaconesses (the latter of who could serve as pastors if they had graduated from Ebenezer). In some locations, the churches formed a circuit in which the pastor would reside at the largest church in the area and visit others in the area. All of the churches on the circuit contributed to the pastor's support. As Cotabato and Davao were organized into separate districts, they established a plan whereby up to one half of the offerings in

²⁰⁰ Douglas Elwood, *Churches and Sects in the Philippines: A Descriptive Study of Contemporary Religious Group Movements* (Dumaguete City: Silliman U., 1968), 27, 41, 125-127, 154-164. See Gowing, *Islands Under the Cross*, 211.

²⁰¹ Anderson and Gowing, "Four Centuries of Christianity," 367.

the local congregations would go to the district office, which would then distribute the money as needed for church planting and other expenses.²⁰²

Meanwhile, Filipino leaders led the way toward a separation of the churches from the CMA Mission. Jeremias Dulaca, pastor of the Zamboanga City Church, called for an organizational meeting of all pastors and deaconesses from 13 self-supporting churches. They gathered in Cotabato in February 1947, and elected Dulaca chairman. The self-supporting churches would be under a National church, they advised, and those receiving funds from the American-based denomination, under the Mission. In 1952 the Christian and Missionary Alliance Church of the Philippines (CAMACOP) was formed and declared its independence from the mission. By 1958 there were 353 self-supporting congregations. Dulaca served as President of the National Church Conference from 1949 to 1957, and from 1960 until 200 Anderson and Gowing, *Four Centuries of Christianity*, 367. his death in 1962. In 1967 a clause in the church's constitution that declared its subordination to the Alliance was deleted, the last vestige of a formal tie with the parent church.²⁰³

As comity arrangements broke down after the war, the CMA began to expand to other parts of the Philippines. CMA parents and leaders were concerned over the spiritual condition of their young people attending universities in Manila, so the mission assigned workers to the city in 1953. They started Shepherd Alliance Youth Fellowship. Out of this fellowship the Capitol City Alliance Church began in 1956. Almost all of the original members were from Mindanao. The church took advantage, in this case, of the migration of CMA members from Mindanao to Manila. From this

²⁰² David L. Rambo, *The Christian and Missionary Alliance in the Philippines, 1901-1970*, PhD dissertation, New York University, 1974, 191-197.

²⁰³ Rambo, *The Christian and Missionary Alliance in the Philippines*, 176-186, 200. See also Tuggy and Toliver, *Seeing the Church*, 73-75; Thelma Naraval, *The Southern Cross: A History of the Christian and Missionary Alliance Churches of the Philippines, Inc. and the Ebenezer Bible College*, vol. 1 (Cagayan de Oro City: Bustamante, 1977), 14-17; Montgomery and McGavran, *Discipling a Nation*, 46-47; Metosalem Castillo, *Towards Greater Equivalence in the Christian and Missionary Alliance Church of the Philippines*, in *Readings in Dynamic Indigeneity*, eds. Charles Kraft and Tom Wisley (Pasadena: William Carey, 1979), 243; Ronald P. MacKinnon, *Alliance History and Beliefs*, rev. ed. (Pasig: Alliance Publishers, 1993), 71-73.

congregation and a merger with the Fundamental Churches of the Philippines developed the Luzon District, which was set up in 1964 with Bayani Mendoza as Superintendent.²⁰⁴

At the same time, CMA work progressed among tribal groups in Mindanao, including Margosatubig Subanos in the interior of the island. At Tuboy, a datu or chief became Christian. However, it was difficult to persuade Ebenezer graduates to work among the tribal people, in 1965 the church formed the Tribal Bible School (later named the Mikelson Memorial Bible School) at Malagupos, Cotabato. In 1967 the CMA opened the Lommasson Bible School, at Lapuyan.²⁰⁵

The CMA, like all other Christians, had limited success in evangelizing Moslems. For instance, Florentino de Jesus, an Alliance leader who pastored many years in Jolo in the Sulu islands saw a number of conversions among Moslems. But the CMA averaged about one Moslem convert per year.²⁰⁶

The CMA had begun work among the Chinese in Zamboanga in 1937, and in 1950 a missionary opened work among Chinese in Davao City. Organizationally, the Chinese work remained separate from the Filipino work in the Philippines.²⁰⁷

The Chinese churches had increasing ties and contacts with Filipinos, and helped to sponsor home missions and resettlement programs, but remained in their own organizations, particularly the United Evangelical Church of the Philippines. The Biblical Seminary of the Philippines began in 1957 in order to train pastors and Bible women for work in the Chinese

²⁰⁴ *Protestant Churches*, vol. 2, ed. Guillermo, 415-419; Naraval, *The Southern Cross*, 17; Rambo, *The Christian and Missionary Alliance*, 225-226, 280-281; Bayani Y. Mendoza, *The Philippine Christian Alliance: First Seventy-Eight Years* (N.p., 1985), 114-120. See also Sylvestre Gonzales, *Dr. Valmike Apuzen*, *Evangelicals Today* 21 (October 1994), 18-20.

²⁰⁵ Rambo, *The Christian and Missionary Alliance*, 202-214, 243-257. See Eunice Irwin, *A Religious Studies Approach to Understanding Alliance Religion Among the Subanen of Lapuyan, Zamboanga Del Sur*, PhD dissertation, University of Birmingham, 1993.

²⁰⁶ Gowing, *Mosque and Moro*, 100-101; Benjamin de Jesus and Deborah Cowles, *A Man Sent from God* (Pasig: CAMACOP, 1986), 22, 28-29, 85f.

²⁰⁷ Rambo, *The Christian and Missionary Alliance*, 228-232.

churches in the Philippines. Among the more prominent Chinese congregations were the Cebu Gospel Church, which had 800 members in 1970, and the Grace Christian Church in Manila.²⁰⁸

The fundamentalist and separatist Association Baptists (ABWE) reopened Doane Evangelistic Institute in Iloilo in 1946 and continued to expand geographically. By 1948 it had begun work in Laoag, Ilocos Norte, and Luba, Abra Province. The group grew strongly in Mindanao and Manila as well as Iloilo and Bacolod. On Palawan, ABWE took over a Presbyterian work. They called the churches they started “Fellowship Baptist Churches” to distinguish them from the other Baptists.²⁰⁹

Abstaining from relations with other Protestants, ABWE affiliated with the International Council of Christian Churches, led by American Fundamentalist Carl McIntire. Through this affiliation many missionaries entered the Philippines in order to work with ABWE. McIntire himself visited the Philippines in 1949. McIntire criticized Protestant work in the islands, especially the work of the Convention Baptists, Silliman University teachers, and Presbyterian missionaries. But he rejoiced in the faithfulness of Filipino pastors to right doctrines.²¹⁰

In 1961 ABWE formed the Philippine Association of Baptists for World Evangelism, separate from its parent organization. In the same year it sent Rev. and Mrs. Roberto Gequillana as missionaries to Thailand.²¹¹

²⁰⁸ Tuggy and Toliver, *Seeing the Church*, 142-147. See also Joseph Shao, .Heritage of the Chinese-Filipino Protestant Churches., paper presented at the Asia Graduate School of Theology Conference, February 28, 1998, and Shao, .A Channel of Blessings in God's Hands: Chinese Protestant Churches in the Philippines., in *Chapters in Philippine Church History*, ed. Kwantes, 413-428.

²⁰⁹ Paul Friederichsen and Kay Friederichsen, *Like Them That Dream* (N.p., 1972), 15-18; Posey, .A Historical Study., 123-129.

²¹⁰ Carl McIntire, *The Battle for Bangkok: Second Missionary Journey* (Collingswood, NJ: Christian Beacon Press, [1950]), 52-60. See *Philippine Christian Advance* 2 (June 1950), 5-6. Compare Sitoy, *Several Streams*, 2: 643. For background on these issues see Joel A. Carpenter, *Revive Us Again: The Reawakening of American Fundamentalism* (New York: Oxford U. Press, 1997), 204-206.

²¹¹ Posey, .A Historical Study., 137-138.

ABWE developed a hospital, an orphanage and Bible school at Talakog, Bukidnon, and maintained a Baptist Workers' Training School in Malaybalay. Naparete Dulag, a convert from Islam, became its director in 1966.²¹²

But ABWE experienced its own series of splits. In 1947, 23 churches left to form the Visayan Fellowship of Fundamental Baptist Churches. By 1969 this group had grown to 120 churches. Later other former ABWE churches formed the Association of Fundamental Baptist Churches, which developed six regional associations extending from Luzon to Davao. Yet another split in ABWE resulted in the Maranatha Gospel Fellowship.²¹³

Meanwhile, in Manila, the pastor of the First Baptist Church, Antonio Ormeo, left to form his own Association of Baptist Churches in Luzon, Visayas and Mindanao (ABCLVM). Like other Fundamentalist Baptists this group reacted strongly against World Council of Churches-affiliated movements, but leaders participated in the International Council of Christian Churches. ABCLVM leaders accused "neo-evangelicalism" of diluting the gospel and compromising with the world. The ABCLVM was a fully indigenous organization. Though it desired to spread the gospel "without the gimmicks and man-made socio-economic strings characteristic of the 'social gospellers,'" it promised that "in times of emergencies such as illness or extreme economic problems, or natural calamities, a member may seek assistance from the church by presenting the need to our Relief/Aid Committee."²¹⁴

Other splinter groups from the Convention Baptists remained separatist. The Independent Baptist Churches that had been started in

²¹² Posey, .A Historical Study, 130-132; John M. Terry, .An Analysis of Growth Among Southern Baptist Churches on Mindanao Philippines, 1951-1985, PhD dissertation, Southwestern Baptist Theological Seminary, 1986, 60.

²¹³ Tuggy and Toliver, *Seeing the Church*, 43, 48, 67, 69, 73.

²¹⁴ Ebenezer T. Nacita, *Church Ministry Manual for ABCLVM Pastors and Workers* (N.p.: Association of Baptist Churches in Luzon, Visayas and Mindanao, 2001), 155, 90, and throughout.

Davao by Juan Galicia in 1926 grew slowly. After the death of Galicia in 1967 his son Emmanuel became the church's chief administrator.²¹⁵

The conservative branch of the Christian Church, the Church of Christ, counted 150 churches in the Manila area in 1973, and 400 throughout the Philippines, with a total membership of 140,000.²¹⁶

The Seventh-day Adventists expanded through old and new means. SDA laypersons led evangelistic home Bible studies called "The Bible Says." The church began the "Manila Voice of Prophecy School," and established other evangelistic institutes and centers that both trained workers and reached out to non-SDA people.²¹⁷

But the main means of SDA evangelism remained selling literature. Within the SDA denomination, the Philippines remained the "colporteur capitol of the world."²¹⁸ Between 1947 and 1960 the SDA sold 1.36 million books in the Philippines. As earlier in the century, the literature's appearance as well as content, and the manner in which it was presented by the colporteurs appealed to rural Filipinos. In 1968 alone the church sold more than three million pesos worth of books. In addition, the SDA message of the "end times" had a sympathetic hearing in these years. The opposition it experienced from Protestants also contributed to its growth, since it contributed to the "movementlike" dynamic of the church, and forced members to know what they believed.²¹⁹

²¹⁵ *Protestant Churches and Missions in the Philippines*, vol. 2, ed. Merlyn Guillermo (N.p.: World Vision Philippines, 1983), 247-248.

²¹⁶ Maxey, *History of the Philippine Mission*, iv.

²¹⁷ W.P. Elliott, "The Luzon Institute," *The Advent Review and Sabbath Herald* 125 (November 11, 1948), 16; V.T. Armstrong, "The Far Eastern Division," *ARSH* 125 (December 2, 1948), 11-13; Andrew Nelson, "Philippine Union College," *ARSH* 127 (January 5, 1950), 24; H.A. Munson, "Nurses. Graduation at Manila Sanitarium," *ARSH* 127 (January 19, 1950), 17-18; E.E. Franklin, "Publishing Work in the Philippines," *ARSH* 127 (May 4, 1950), 24; J.O. Bautista, "Philippine Priest Endorses Bible Classes," *Review and Herald* 147 (September 17, 1970), 16.

²¹⁸ Reyes, *Breaking Through*, 194.

²¹⁹ E.M. Adams, "Home Again in Manila," *The Advent Review and Sabbath Herald* 127 (December 7, 1950), 16; "Mid-Century Ingathering in the Philippines," *ARSH* 127 (December 28, 1950), 19; C.M. Basconcillo, "Evangelism in the

As before the war, SDA growth was spread evenly throughout the Philippines. In 1951 the country had over 31,300 members and was divided into two districts or “Union Missions.” By 1960 membership had doubled. Indigenization of leadership came easier in the South than in the North, where the SDA operated more institutions. Missionaries retained the presidency of the Union in the North until 1972, while, in the South, Gilde Guzman served as President from 1951 to 1956, and other Filipinos thereafter. In 1964 the SDA opened a third Union Mission in Mindanao. In that year there were 89,095 SDA members scattered throughout the Philippines. By 1970 there were 119,356 members and 1,206 churches.²²⁰

One reason this conservative church was growing was that the SDA life style remained strict, especially in regards to keeping the Sabbath. On dietary matters, the SDA required a life style different from the surrounding society. Laypersons tithed, avoided pork, and kept the Sabbath. The SDA held temperance meetings, showed films and lectured on the evils of both alcohol and tobacco.²²¹

Provinces of Central Luzon, .*ARSH* 132 (January 6, 1955), 19; Ben Buck, .New Magazine Ministry in the Philippines, .*ARSH* 132 (April 21, 1955), 1; W.A. Higgins, .Philippine Literature Evangelists, .*ARSH* 134 (May 2, 1957), 26; J.T. Mason, .North Philippine Beginners. Institute, .*Review and Herald* 140 (January 24, 1963), 15; D.A. Delafield, .The Great Controversy Wins Souls in Philippines, .*Review and Herald* 142 (June 24, 1965), 32; Tuggy and Toliver, *Seeing the Church*, 58; Reyes, *Breaking Through*, 188-194.

²²⁰ *Yearbook of the Seventh-Day Adventist Denomination* (Washington, DC: Review and Herald Publishing, 1950), 120-125; A.L. Ham, .Fifty Thousand Believers in the Philippines, .*The Advent Review and Sabbath Herald* 132 (July 21, 1955), 19-20; *Yearbook of the Seventh-Day Adventist Denomination* (Washington, DC: Review and Herald Publishing, 1960), 103-106, 111-112; *Yearbook of the Seventh-Day Adventist Denomination* (Washington, DC: Review and Herald Publishing, 1970), 127-129, 137-141, 143-146; Montgomery and McGavran, *Discipling a Nation*, 48; Reyes, *Breaking Through*, 169-178, 181-182.

²²¹ T.C. Murdoch, .Weekend Soul Winners of Mountain View College, .*The Advent Review and Sabbath Herald* 137 (February 11, 1960), 23; James Scully, .Temperance Meetings in the Philippines, .*ARSH* 137 (December 1, 1960), 32; Tuggy and Toliver, *Seeing the Church*, 55-57.

Institutions remained a large part of the SDA work. SDA schools proliferated. The strongest school remained Philippine Union College, on 65 acres in Kalookan, Manila. Leadership of the school transferred to a Filipino, R. G. Manalaysay, in late 1952. In 1957 the school opened a graduate program, offering the master's degree in education. A master's program in religion began in 1964. By 1968 there were 196 SDA schools in the Philippines ranging from primary to college level. Because the churches were growing, and books were being sold, the educational institutions were not a heavy financial burden.²²²

Mountain View College, located on 2,560 acres in Malaybalay, Bukidnon, Mindanao, facilitated SDA growth among both tribal people and Moslems. The school operated a farm, sawmill (of Philippine mahogany timber), soybean factory, and cattle ranch, and offered secretarial courses and programs in agriculture, education, and science as well as religion. By 1963 it had built a hydroelectric plant. Students went out into surrounding barrios with small generators and projectors in order to show films and evangelize.²²³

The SDA also worked among the Manobo people in Mindanao, having reached them initially through intrepid colporteurs. One of their chiefs expressed his desire for the SDA to establish a school among them, and donated 125 acres for such.²²⁴

²²² W.P. Bradley, .Philippine Union College Leadership,. *The Advent Review and Sabbath Herald* 130 (January 1, 1953), 24; R.R. Figuhr, .Progress in the Philippines,. *ARSH* 137 (January 7, 1960), 18-19; V.M. Montalban, .Progress in the South Philippine Union,. *ARSH* 137 (December 1, 1960), 18-19; Neufeld, ed., *Seventh-Day Adventist Encyclopedia*, 985-986; W.J. Brown, .Around the World in 45 Days,. *Adventist Review* (January 31, 1980), 22; W.T. Clark, .Members of a Triumphant Movement,. *AR* (May 1, 1980), 10; Reyes, *Breaking Through*, 197.

²²³ A.Z. Roda, .Mountain View College,. *The Advent Review and Sabbath Herald* 140 (January 31, 1963), 19; C.L. Torrey, .Inspiration and Progress at Mountain View College,. *Review and Herald* 140 (February 21, 1963), 17-18; W.J. Brown, .Around the World in 45 Days,. *Adventist Review* (January 31, 1980), 21; Neufeld, ed., *Seventh-Day Adventist Encyclopedia*, 831-832.

²²⁴ T.C. Murdoch, .Mission Thrills Among the Hills of Mindanao,. *The Advent Review and Sabbath Herald* 134 (June 27, 1954), 16-17, 24-25; Irene Wakeham, .A Mission School for the Manobos,. *Review and Herald* 140 (April 25, 1963), 1, 8-9.

The SDA found that Moslems respected their dietary laws and responded to friendliness. They operated a “Lakeside Clinic” in Marawi (where the UCCP was strong) under Dr. R. T. Santos. Another way of attempting to convert Moslems was by adopting them as children, raising them as Christians, and educating them in SDA schools.²²⁵

The Sanitarium in Manila reopened in 1949, and soon began a nurses training course. The SDA medical work was largely self-supporting. Earnings from the Marawi clinic, for instance, helped to finance construction of the Mindanao Sanitarium and Hospital in Iligan City, which opened in 1953 under Dr. F. T. Geslani. Miller Sanitarium in Cebu City began in 1955, and a nursing school, an extension of the Mountain View Hospital, opened there in 1969. The Cagayan Valley Sanitarium and Hospital opened under Dr. Celedonio Fernando in 1959. Another sanitarium and hospital began in Bacolod City in 1962. The Adventists also operated a small hospital in Calbayog City, Samar. The staff and students of SDA hospitals contributed to the evangelization of surrounding towns and neighborhoods. Not only were patients frequently converted through medical work, but hospitals financed a large part the building of churches nearby.²²⁶

Rather than institutional work, the post-war emphasis in the Assemblies of God remained evangelism. The Fourth District Council meeting, held in Tarlac, December 1945, elected Rodrigo Esperanza Acting

²²⁵ Medical Work for Filipino Mohammedans, *The Advent Review and Sabbath Herald* 127 (April 6, 1950), 24.

²²⁶ W.P. Bradley, .Medical Work Among Moros of the South Philippine Union, *The Advent Review and Sabbath Herald* 130 (January 29, 1953), 24; G.G. Rojo, .Filipino Missionaries in Vietnam, *ARSH* 134 (June 6, 1957), 23; Laurentino Gonzaga, .Aid to Fire Victims in Manila, *ARSH* 137 (March 3, 1960), 20; Don F. Neufeld, ed., *Seventh-Day Adventist Encyclopedia* (Washington, DC: Review and Herald Publishing, 1966), 993; Winston Lim, .Philippines: Relief Teams Rush Aid to Disaster Refugees, *Review and Herald* 147 (January 15, 1970), 18; B.B. Alsaybar, .North Philippine Union, *RH* 147 (February 5, 1970), 19; F.M. Arrogante, .Philippines: Mountain View College Opens Nursing School, *RH* 147 (February 12, 1970), 17; Mario Bingcang, .Church Built at Bacolod, *RH* 152 (September 25, 1975), 16; J.H. Zachery, .Hospital in Philippines Has Clear Mission, *Adventist Review* (November 9, 1978), 22; J.H. Zachery, .Students Assist in Organizing New Church, *AR* (December 7, 1978), 22; W.J. Brown, .Around the World in 45 Days, *AR* (January 31, 1980), 21.

District Superintendent, and from that point leadership of the church in the Philippines passed to Filipinos. In April 1953, in order to allow for the creation of districts, the District Council became a General Council. After 1964 the election of a General Superintendent was no longer subject to approval at the denomination's headquarters in Springfield, Missouri. The United States General Council accepted the Philippine General Council as "autonomous and sovereign." The missionaries' authority was strictly limited to assignments designated by the Philippine Presbytery.²²⁷

In 1948 the denomination had seven missionaries, 32 national pastors, 35 churches and outstations, and 1,822 members. One missionary of an older denomination believed that the AOG drew many of its members from the UCCP. At the same time, the Assemblies of God denomination dramatically raised its expenditures in the Philippines. It spent \$71,200 in 1951; \$131,300 in 1956; and \$188,500 in 1959 (the fifth largest amount of any mission agency in the Philippines). By 1958 the number of missionaries had risen to 30, national workers to 202, organized churches and outstations to 386, and members to 18,000. By 1965 this had risen significantly to 523 national ministers and Christian workers, 912 churches and outstations and 35,000 members.²²⁸

The church successfully used a "mother" church plan to start other churches and emphasized miracles and healing. In Manila, Lester Sumrall began the "Glad Tidings Revival Center" in 1952. He brought national attention to the work in 1953 by seeming to cast demons out of a 17-year-old girl being held in the city jail. This began a "deliverance ministry." City councilmen gave him permission to hold nightly meetings in Roxas Park.

²²⁷ Esperanza, "The Assemblies of God," 53-57.

²²⁸ Foreign Missions Department, General Council of the Assemblies of God, *The Assemblies of God in Foreign Lands: A Survey of the Assemblies of God in Foreign Lands* (Springfield, MO: Foreign Missions Department, General Council of the Assemblies of God, 1948), 87-88; Serena M. Hodges, ed., *Look on the Fields: A Missionary Survey* (Springfield, MO: Gospel Publishing, 1956), 65-66; Irwin Winehouse, *The Assemblies of God: A Popular Survey* (New York: Vantage, 1959), 220; *The Philippine Christian Advance* 11 (March 1959), 29-30; Esperanza, "The Assemblies of God," 82-84. See Bush, "The Sectarian Challenge," 4; Tuggy and Toliver, *Seeing the Church*, 79, 132. For statistics on finances see various annual reports of the Division of Foreign Missions, National Council of Churches of Christ in the USA (New York: National Council of Churches).

Similarly, in 1954 Clifton Erickson held revivals in Roxas Park in front of Manila City Hall. Hundreds of people claimed miracles and the crusade was noted in Manila newspapers. In January 1959 the Assemblies held a 22-day evangelistic and healing crusade at Roxas Park with Morris Cerullo, who frequently returned to the Philippines for other crusades.²²⁹

With the help of Oriental Missionary Crusade, the Assemblies opened a Student Center amid three large universities in Manila in 1964. Eliseo Saddorna, the Assistant General Superintendent, served as Superintendent of the center, which included a library and recording equipment. Staff showed films on Fridays and Saturdays and conducted worship services on Sundays.²³⁰

The AOG's Bethel Bible Institute (later college) furnished student workers for the expanding ministry in Manila. The school, which had begun in Baguio, reopened in Pozorrubio under Esperanza in 1946. In August 1948 it moved to Malinta, Valenzuela, Bulacan. The Far East Advanced School of Theology (FEAST), intended not only for the Assemblies of God but other Pentecostals in Asia, opened in 1964. The school initially offered Bachelor or Religious Education and Bachelor of Theology degrees.²³¹

In northern Luzon, AOG missionary Elva Vanderbout worked among Kankaaeys in Baguio and Tuding, Benguet Province, and her ministry reached Bontoc, Sagada and Bugias in Mountain Province. Focusing on health needs, in 1953 she started the Bethesda Children's Home at Tuding for "undernourished, deformed, and sick children."²³² Healing services played a large part in her ministries. In 1963 she married a

²²⁹ Esperanza, .The Assemblies of God., 49, 66; Wee, .Developing Strategies., 125-132.

²³⁰ Esperanza, .The Assemblies of God., 67.

²³¹ Esperanza, .The Assemblies of God., 50, 61, 73-75; *Protestant Churches and Missions in the Philippines*, vol. 2, ed. Merlyn Guillermo (N.p.: World Vision Philippines, 1983), 497-498.

²³² Esperanza, .The Assemblies of God., 40; 37-41.

Filipino pastor, Juan Soriano, who pastored in Tuding. However, this marriage to a Filipino was not approved by the Assemblies' Foreign Missions Department and she and her husband left the denomination in 1966.²³³

The Assemblies work in Mindanao benefited from connections with the Oriental Missionary Crusade. Ernest Reb and Eliseo Sadorra, who was both the Philippine Director for OMC and the Assistant General Superintendent of the Assemblies of God work in the Philippines, established 90 churches in seven years of barrio evangelism.²³⁴

Other means of evangelism included broadcasts over the new Far Eastern Broadcasting Company station. There were also regional radio programs in local dialects. A correspondence course, "Sunday School of the Air" began in 1955. The church set up Evangel Press and bookrooms. By 1965 the press was producing 90,000 volumes per month.²³⁵

Meanwhile, the Assemblies attempted to find common ground with other Philippine Pentecostals. A United Pentecostal Fellowship was organized in 1946 and consisted of the Foursquare Church, the Church of God, the Philippine Assemblies of the First Born, the United Free Gospel and Missionary Society, and the Assemblies of God. But the Fellowship ended after a few years.²³⁶

The AOG and Pentecostalism in general grew in the Philippines at least in part because, unlike other Protestants, Pentecostals did not challenge the still common views of Filipinos about the influence of spirits and demons in the world. Pentecostals provided ways of controlling spiritual forces, and of defeating malevolent ones. Another important factor for its

²³³ Julie Ma, "Elva Vanderbout: A Woman Pioneer of Pentecostal Mission Among Igorots," *Journal of Asian Mission* 3 (March 2001), 121-140.

²³⁴ Esperanza, "The Assemblies of God," 51.

²³⁵ Esperanza, "The Assemblies of God," 70-72.

²³⁶ Esperanza, "The Assemblies of God," 61.

growth was that, from its beginning, Pentecostals encouraged and produced self-motivated local leaders. The impact of missionaries was less important for church growth.²³⁷

The growth of the Foursquare Church relied little upon missionaries. By the time Everette and Ruth Denison arrived as the first non-Filipino missionaries in 1949, there were already 13 congregations with 650 members. The Denisons opened a Bible college in Manila in 1955. The Foursquare work in Cebu started in 1957 under Al Chaves, who was noted for his debates. He began the Cebu Bible Institute. From the Institute, students and graduates spread the Foursquare Church around the Visayas.²³⁸

The church continued to grow across the Philippines by utilizing Filipino leaders. The church was divided into two districts in 1958. About one-third of the pastors were women, and, according to observers, they were “immensely successful,” and “accounted for much” of the church’s rapid growth. There was not a large separation between lay and full-time workers. Laypersons were expected to evangelize. In 1966 the first Filipino, Veronico Suan, was elected a District Superintendent. By 1967 there were 194 churches and 10,961 members throughout the Philippines. In 1975 leadership of the church was placed entirely in the hands of Filipinos. Ernesto Lagasca was elected President and Veronico Suan General

²³⁷ Tuggy and Toliver, *Seeing the Church*, 79-81; Julie Ma, “A Comparison of Two Worldviews: Kankaya-Ey and Pentecostal,” in *Pentecostalism in Context: Essays in Honor of William W. Menzies*, eds. Wonsuk Ma and Robert P. Menzies (Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1997), 265-290. Compare Rodney L. Henry, *Filipino Spirit World: A Challenge to the Church* (Manila: OMF, 1986); Charles H. Kraft, *Christianity with Power: Your Worldview and Your Experience of the Supernatural* (Ann Arbor: Servant, 1989); Harvey Roman Catholic priests. Cox, *Fire from Heaven: The Rise of Pentecostal Spirituality and the Reshaping of Religion in the Twenty-first Century* (Reading, MA: Addison-Wesley, 1995).

²³⁸ Montgomery, *New Testament Fire*, 25-30, 58-60.

Supervisor. At the time there were 279 churches. This had grown to 568 churches by 1983, and 616 churches by 1990.²³⁹

Though the Foursquare missionaries—what comparatively few there were—claimed not to have a strategy for working in the country, most of them stayed in the city and built large, effective urban congregations, with the goal of planting congregations in outlying communities. Most of the converts were from the lower classes. About 70 percent of the members were former Roman Catholics. Congregations drew many simply by being the closest Protestant or Pentecostal church. Some members were forced out of other denominations for speaking in tongues. As among other Pentecostals, the experience of speaking in tongues as evidence of the baptism of the Holy Spirit (which was necessary for church membership) gave members confidence and boldness to evangelize. Churches also frequently held healing services. In some instances churches were started by the dramatic healing of an individual. Theological education stressed practical skills for ministry and evangelism, but the denomination continued to raise the expectations and standards of its schools.²⁴⁰

A split in the Foursquare Church in 1965 resulted in the Evangelical Full-Gospel Church, led by Ashel Maurillo. His greatest success was in Eastern Mindanao. Like other Pentecostals, the EFGC approached evangelism through “power encounters,” including healing. The church grew by holding large rallies, broadcasting radio programs, and training tribal ministers.²⁴¹

²³⁹ Montgomery, *New Testament Fire*, 45, 52-56; 184-185; Skivington, *Mission to Mindanao*, 171- 172; Nathaniel M. Van Cleave, *The Vine and the Branches: A History of the International Church of the Foursquare Gospel* (Los Angeles: International Church of the Foursquare Gospel, 1992), 91-92; .Gintong Alay Sa Maykapal...Isang Pagdiriwang: The Foursquare Church Celebrates Golden Jubilee., *Evangelicals Today* (April . May 1999), 57-60.

²⁴⁰ Montgomery, *New Testament Fire*, 62-66, 88-96, 116-118, 130-131, 147, 160, 177, 187-188, 193-196; *Protestant Churches*, vol. 2, ed. Guillermo, 158.

²⁴¹ Skivington, *Mission to Mindanao*, 173-174.

By comparison, holiness churches grew slowly, but emphasized self-support. One successful plan was “God’s faithful hand rice offering.” Every time a meal was being prepared members were to separate one handful of rice for their pastors. Pilgrim Holiness leaders undertook a “sifting out” process in the early 1950s, dropping lapsed ministers and members from the rolls. As a result, membership in 1954 dropped from 1,000 to 300. Through this the church gained a greater sense of what it meant to be a “holiness” church, according to missionary Paul Thomas. In the north the church established work to the Igorots living in the mountains east of Sudipan. E. B. Albano returned from California to pioneer work in Tabuk, Isabela, in northeastern Luzon. Migrations took Pilgrim Holiness Church members to Mindanao. The first church outside of Luzon was established in Kiamba, South Cotabato, in 1947. Paul and Frances Thomas were assigned to Mindanao in 1952 and started a Bible school in Davao. The school transferred to Kabcan, North Catabato, in 1959. The Mindanao District became the first self-supporting non-North American district in the entire denomination.²⁴²

The Luzon district followed in 1962. By 1965 the denomination included 1,500 members. In 1966 Saturnino Garcia became Assistant District Superintendent. Three years later the Philippine National Council elected him District Superintendent.²⁴³

THE NEWER DENOMINATIONS

In addition to the Lutherans, other denominations came in the post-war years. During the war various American churches had accumulated hundreds of thousands of dollars for missions work, and had been unable to send missionaries to many parts of the world. Many groups were eager and able to enter new fields. They saw foreign missions as a way of stemming the tide of Communism, and with its Hukbalahap movements, the Philippines seemed in danger of succumbing to Communism. The

²⁴² Thomas, .The Philippines,. 535.

²⁴³ Thomas, .The Philippines,. 531, 539-544.

Philippines also drew Protestant missionaries who were forced to flee communist China in the late 1940s.²⁴⁴

Missionaries of the younger denominations asserted that there was not true evangelism going on in many of the older denominations, and that there were segments of the population still completely untouched by the gospel. To an extent, the older Protestants ministered to the more educated middle and upper classes. They had both attracted and built up these constituencies across the early decades through Protestant colleges and universities. Many of the younger denominations targeted the poor.²⁴⁵

The Wesleyan Methodist Church was one of the first to enter the Philippines after the war. It did so in 1947 through the efforts of Romeo Boronia, who had immigrated to the United States in the 1920s. In 1949 the Dakota District supported Boronia's return to the Philippines. The Wesleyan Methodist mission was incorporated under South Dakota laws. Thus, the work was not directly under denominational control. Boronia undertook work in Urdaneta, Pangasinan. A congregation in Villasis soon affiliated. In 1956 a Bible school began in Villasis. The church expanded to Isabela province in 1958, and also to Lanao Province and Cotabato in Mindanao as a result of the migration of members. Luis Ordonez succeeded Baronia in 1961 as Superintendent, and Baronia moved to Isabela to oversee the churches there. By 1965 the denomination had 1,058 members.²⁴⁶

The fact that the Wesleyan Methodist Church in the Philippines was separately incorporated delayed by four years merger with the Pilgrim Holiness Church, which occurred in the United States in 1968 to form the Wesleyan Church. The Wesleyan Methodist work was more heavily subsidized than the Pilgrim Holiness work, and there were philosophical differences between the two missions. After the merger, Saturnino became

²⁴⁴ Richard Pierard, *Pax Americana and the Evangelical Missionary Advance*, in *Earthen Vessels: American Evangelicals and Foreign Missions, 1880-1980*, eds. Joel A. Carpenter and Wilbert R. Shenck (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1990), 155-179. See Kerkvliet, *The Huk Rebellion*.

²⁴⁵ Richard Bush, 'The Sectarian Challenge', *The Philippine Christian Advance* 6 (January 1954), 4-5; Noe Akilit, 'Is Denominationalism the Genius of Protestantism', *The Philippine Christian Advance* 13 (September 1961), 18-25; Elwood, *Churches and Sects*, 50.

²⁴⁶ Thomas, 'The Philippines', 546-548.

General Superintendent and Ordonez Assistant General Superintendent. There were 3,577 members and 85 churches, with 56 ordained ministers. But soon Ordonez led seven churches out of the united church and, with encouragement of an American missionary, attempted to nullify the merger and regain Wesleyan property. In 1989 the Wesleyan Church Philippine General Conference was organized with Alfonso Pablo as General Superintendent.²⁴⁷

Another holiness church that entered the Philippines after the war was the Church of the Nazarene. A Nazarene chaplain found a former Nazarene member, Marciano Encarnacion, in Baguio. Encarnacion, a Methodist from Cabanatuan, Nueva Ecija, before going to America, had become a Nazarene while studying in Washington State. After returning to the Philippines in 1926, Encarnacion became a lay evangelist, and later affiliated with the Pilgrim Holiness Church. Nazarene Military Chaplain J. E. L. Moore organized a congregation in Cabanatuan in 1946 with Encarnacion as pastor.²⁴⁸

In 1948 the denomination sent Joseph Pitts as the first missionary. He established work in Baguio, and brought into the fold an independent congregation in Iloilo. Pitts emphasized strict living for converts. He was struck that “professing Christians and their priests have gone about smoking, drinking, gambling, and committing every form of sin that the pagans can commit.”²⁴⁹ In 1950 John and Lillian Pattee, who had served in China, arrived and soon began a Bible College in La Trinidad, near Baguio.

²⁴⁷ Thomas, .The Philippines., 548-552.

²⁴⁸ J. E. Moore, Jr. .The Philippines and the Islands., in *The Chaplains See World Missions*, ed. Lauriston J. Du Bois (Kansas City: Nazarene, 1946), 53-54; Ernesto N. Rulloda, .The Church of the Nazarene in the Philippines: Her Role in Nation Building. (Ed. D. dissertation, Baguio Central University, 1990); Floyd Cunningham, .The Early History of the Church of the Nazarene in the Philippines., *Philippine Studies* 41 (First Quarter 1993), 51-76.

²⁴⁹ Joseph Pitts, .Missionary Prospects in the Philippines., *Herald of Holiness* 37 (June 21, 1948), 5; Lillian Pattee to Mary Scott, May 20, 1955, Nazarene Archives, Kansas City; Church of the Nazarene Philippine Mission, *Third Annual Assembly Journal* (1957), 1, 44, 46.

It offered Bachelor of Theology level work. Pitts and Pattee drew in some older pastors who had been associated with the Pilgrim Holiness or other denominations, and recruited younger men for Bible College training. Some members came out of the IFI and IEMILIF churches. One convert, though he did not stay long in the church, was a former Roman Catholic priest.²⁵⁰

The only early leader from outside Luzon was Prisco Contado, who was from Samar. He had studied at Siliman and pastored United Church congregations in Samar. He joined in the evangelistic efforts of some American chaplains and servicemen after the war, and promised one, Adrian Rosa, that if he were to return to the Philippines as a missionary he would join him. Contado remained true to his word. In 1953 Contado took an indefinite leave of absence from the UCCP, and began working with the Nazarenes. He viewed the UCCP as diverging from its original evangelical moorings. Contado opened the work for the Church of the Nazarene in Bacolod and Iloilo, where he remained as pastor. Through contacts with relatives and others Contado also began churches in Samar, Leyte and Mindanao in the 1950s and 1960s.²⁵¹

Both Pattee and Pitts were strong evangelists, and planted churches in several of the towns along the road between Baguio and Manila, especially in Pangasinan. Pattee's method was the same as he had used as a missionary in China in the late 1930s, open-air preaching. Commonly he took students with him to either play an accordion and translate his messages. He secured permission from local city officials to preach in the town plaza, and showed slides. It was sufficient to attract 400-500 people. After a few days or weeks of such activities, there would be a small core of converts. Eventually a student or recent graduate would be sent to pastor in the place, a small parcel of land would be purchased, and a simple

²⁵⁰ Floyd Cunningham, 'The Early History of the Church of the Nazarene in the Philippines,' *Philippine Studies* 41 (First Quarter 1993), 51-76.

²⁵¹ Various issues of the Nazarene District Assembly *Journal*; Prisco G. Contado to Cunningham, October 28, 1991.

structure made of local materials such as bamboo would be put up. Later, usually with funds from the mission, a more substantial building would be erected.²⁵²

A split occurred in the Church of the Nazarene in 1958 when Pitts and Encarnacion left. They believed that the church was departing from its original emphasis upon strict laws and rules pertaining to dress. They did not like it that a recently arrived missionary refused to take off her wedding ring or to allow her hair to grow long. They believed, further, that the headquarters in Kansas City was too tightly regulating the Philippine church. Pitts and Encarnacion formed the Holiness Church of the Nazarene. In 1968, when Pitts retired, this group joined the Church of the Bible Covenant, which had recently split from the Church of the Nazarene in America over many of the same issues.²⁵³

After the split, the nationalization of the Church of the Nazarene proceeded slowly. In 1967 the mission allowed the election of an Assistant District Superintendent, and the next year the election of a Filipino District Superintendent, Andres Valenzuela. He became active in the Philippine Council of Evangelical Churches.²⁵⁴

One of the few denominations that appealed to comity arrangements before entering the Philippines was another holiness denomination, the Free Methodist Church. Bishop Navarro for the Philippine Federation of Churches, issued a letter of invitation for the Free Methodists to come. In 1949, Walter and Gertrude Groesbeck, missionaries to China since 1947, toured the islands, and in September of that year settled in the area to which

²⁵² C. Ellen Watts, *John Pattee of China and the Philippines* (Kansas City: Beacon Hill, 1984), 92- 101; interviews with Carlino Fontanilla, Nov. 3, 1991, and Castillo Ongogan, December 2, 1991.

²⁵³ Paul Pitts, *Pentecost Rejected* (N.p., [1956]), mimeographed, 24; Joseph Pitts, .Report., *Journal* (1957), 35-36 (see also Copelin.s .Report., p. 49); Pitts, *Voices From the Philippines* (N.p., 1958); [Pitts, ed.], *Echoes from the Philippines* (May 1961); *Echoes from the Philippines* (September 4, 1961).

²⁵⁴ Cunningham, .The Early History of the Church of the Nazarene.. See also Montgomery and McGavran, *Discipling a Nation*, 121-123; W[ilfredo] Manaois, .Church Growth in the Philippines: The Visayan District., ms.

the PFEC assigned them, in Agusan Valley in the northeastern part of Mindanao, where there were 100,000 unevangelized people. Abundancio and Rose Bureos, who had been pastoring in the United Church, secured the consent of their church to join the Free Methodists.

John and Ruby Schlosser, who also had served in China, opened the Free Methodist work at Lianga on the Surigao coast. By 1953 the missionaries had decided that the Agusan Valley was too remote to serve as the center of the mission, and they established headquarters in Butuan City. This decision did not sit well with the UCCP, however. The Light and Life Bible School, which had been located in Bunawan from 1953 to 1957, transferred to Butuan City.²⁵⁵

The Free Methodists evangelized through tracts, radio, phonographs, projectors, and public address systems. In addition, the church helped to facilitate a health and nutrition program. Nurse Naomi Thorsen served as a mid-wife, inoculated children, opened a dispensary, and traveled to remote regions providing medical care. In these areas, especially, the missionaries encountered belief in evil spirits, which the presence of medicine helped to dispel. Some pastors, including Manuel Kintinar and Fortunio Montenegro, joined from other denominations. By 1955 there were eight organized churches, but only 123 full members. The denomination spent about \$21,000 per year on the field in the 1960s. There were 25 churches and 1,050 members in 1970.²⁵⁶

²⁵⁵ Schlosser and Groesbeck, eds., *Lighting the Philippine Frontier*, 32, 87-91. Compare Sitoy, *Several Springs*, 2: 646-647. See also Robert Cranston and Carolyn Cranston, *Stars for the Baliti Tree: The Story of Free Methodist Missions in the Philippines* (Winona Lake, IN: Light and Life, 1983).

²⁵⁶ *Supplement to the Year Book, 1956, Free Methodist Church of North America*, 29-35; (ed.), .Free Methodist Church in the Philippines., *The Philippine Christian Advocate* 13 (December 1961), 52-53; *Supplement to the 1961 Yearbook of the Free Methodist Church* (N.p., [1961]), 35, 41; *Yearbook 1966 of the Free Methodist Church* (Winona Lake, IN: Free Methodist Publishing, [1966]), 515, 520; Elwood, *Churches and Sects*; Montgomery and McGavran, *Discipling a Nation*, 108-110; Skivington, *Mission to Mindanao*, 183- 184; Schlosser and Groesbeck, eds., *Lighting the Philippine Frontier*, 25, 31-32, 46, 64, 67; Terry, .An Analysis of Growth., 83-86.

A holiness denomination that depended on the leadership of Filipino leaders from the beginning was the Church of God, headquartered in Anderson, Indiana. This group began in October 1959 with the arrival of Rolando and Bernie Bacani, who had completed studies at the denomination's Gulf Coast Bible College in Houston. Bacani began holding Bible studies in Valenzuela, a suburb of Manila, and a congregation was organized in 1960. The congregation began a day school and the Pacific Bible Institute. Eduardo Viray, the first graduate of PBI, started a church in Tondo in 1965. The Church of God never stationed a long-term missionary in the Philippines, but sent money to support the work.²⁵⁷

In 1953 the Church of God with headquarters in Cleveland, Tennessee, established work in the Philippines, where it called itself the New Testament Church of God. As with other Pentecostal denominations its beginning was more the result of indigenous leadership than missionaries. Fulgencio Cortez, the pioneering minister, became National Overseer. He helped to establish a Bible institute in 1954 in Cauayan, Isabela. Davao Bible College opened in 1957. The Church of God Bible Academy opened in Pasay City, Metro Manila, in 1973.²⁵⁸

Several Baptist groups also entered the Philippines after the war. The largest was the Southern Baptist, which did so because of closed doors in China. The first intention of the Southern Baptists, since there were other Baptists at work in the islands, was to minister solely to the Chinese in the Philippines. They perceived that none of the other denominations had established a strong work among the Chinese. A Sunday School for Chinese began in Baguio in May 1949, and a Chinese Baptist church was organized a year later. It was made up of prominent business families who contributed

²⁵⁷ *Nineteen Eighty Yearbook of the Church of God: Centennial Issue*, ed. Rosco Snowden (Anderson, IN: Executive Council of the Church of God, 1980), 125; Lester A Cross, *Passport for a Reformation* (Anderson, IN: Warner, 1981), 179, 239.

²⁵⁸ Wee, .Developing Strategies., 132-138; *Protestant Churches*, vol. 2, ed. Guillermo, 257-283; Emerito N. Paulate, .Pastoral Care Through Ministry Development: Discipleship Through Caring., paper presented to the Philippine Association of Bible and Theological Schools, 1990; .Asian Seminary of Christian Ministries Student Handbook. (June 1998), 4-7.

much financially. Philippine Baptist Theological Seminary began in Baguio in 1950 as a bilingual, Chinese and English school.²⁵⁹

Even though Southern Baptist work targeted a specific group at first, missionaries soon took up an extensive rather than intensive policy of evangelizing the Philippines. Filipino work began in the homes of missionaries in Baguio. An evangelistic crusade in Dagupan City began outreach beyond Baguio. In 1953 the Filipino Department of the Seminary enrolled eight students.²⁶⁰

Frank Lide, the President of the school in Baguio, pressed for the Philippines to be the center of Southern Baptist theological education in Asia region. The Asia Baptist Graduate Theological Seminary resulted from a conference held in Hong Kong in 1959 among Southern Baptists working in Korea, Japan, Taiwan, Hong Kong, Malaysia, Indonesia and Thailand as well as the Philippines.²⁶¹

Mindanao became a strong center of Southern Baptist work. Southern Baptists expanded to Davao in 1950, apparently upon the suggestion of the Convention Baptists, who had refrained from entering

²⁵⁹ Ferrer, .Southern Baptist Churches,. 13; Jewell Abernathy, .China Calls from the Philippines,. *The Commission: A Baptist World Journal* 14 (February 1951), 68-69; *Minutes of the Philippine Mission of the Southern Baptist Convention 1953-54* (N.p., 1954), 20; Cal Guy, .Some Historical Dimensions of Evangelism in the Philippines,. *Baptist History and Heritage* 13 (October 1978), 41; Charles L. Cheng and Katherine Bersamira, *The Ethnic Chinese in Baguio and in the Cordillera Philippines: The Untold Story of the Pioneers* (Baguio City: Unique Printing, 1997), 254-255; *Fiftieth Year of Southern Baptist Work in the Philippines Under God National Celebration* (N.p., 1998), 34-35.

²⁶⁰ Mary L. Saunders, .Church in the Making,. *The Commission: A Baptist World Journal* 17 (July 1954), 208-209; Ted Badger, .Overshadowing Death with Life,. *The Commission: A Baptist World Journal* 18 (November 1955), 313,315; Zelma Foster, .Dedicated to Training,. *The Commission* 19 (January 1956), 11; John M. Terry, .An Analysis of Growth Among Southern Baptist Churches on Mindanao Philippines 1951- 1985,. PhD dissertation, Southwestern Baptist Theological Seminary, 1986, 72-73.

²⁶¹ Five Filipino Graduates Enter Gateway to Future,. *The Commission* 19 (May 1956), 131, 156; *Minutes of the Philippine Mission of the Southern Baptist Convention 1956-1957* (N.p., 1957), 67; W. Bryant Hicks, .Loyalty Lag, More Concern Both Mark Transition Time,. *The Commission* 26 (May 1963), 21-22; .Seminary Installs Tyner,. *The Commission* 30 (July 1967), 31.

Mindanao because of the old comity arrangements. The Southern Baptists were able to build upon the migrations of Baptists from the Visayas to Mindanao. In Davao the Baptists organized both the organization of the Immanuel Baptist Church and the Davao Chinese Baptist Church in 1952. A Baptist Student Union began at the Immanuel church in 1960. In Carmen there was already an independent Baptist congregation pastored by Rev. Cabunoc, who had formerly been a Convention Baptist. Similarly, in Marbel, Rev. Dorillo had been trained by and had served the Convention Baptists, and then had joined the CMA. However, he and his congregation of 75 members were not happy with the CMA and so requested affiliation with the Southern Baptists in 1954. The general sense of uprootedness and unsettledness provided an atmosphere in which people were receptive to evangelistic thrusts and home Bible studies. Lay people planned, promoted, visited, witnessed, followed-up—and built new communities of faith.²⁶²

The Southern Baptists established the Baptist Hospital at Mati in southeastern Mindanao, in 1954. The Southern Baptist missionaries had surveyed the area and found not only no hospitals or clinics on the whole coast of eastern Mindanao, but little sign of Protestant work in the area. The hospital was purposely put in an area where resistance to the gospel seemed greatest, as a means of “softening” the people. The Roman Catholic priest warned the people not to patronize the hospital. By 1964 it was considered one of the best hospitals in Mindanao, and those working at the hospital had to defend it for not producing a certain number of baptisms. The

²⁶² *Minutes of the Philippine Mission of the Southern Baptist Convention 1952-1953* (N.p., 1953), 15, 24; *Minutes of the Philippine Mission of the Southern Baptist Convention 1953-1954*, 30-31; J. Winston Crawley, .The Philippines., *The Commission* 18 (February 1955), 61; James Foster, .Seven Thousand Pieces of Land., *The Commission* 20 (March 1957), 102; .Building Life and Peace., *The Commission* 21 (July 1958), 45; Margaret Johnston, .Island Bible School., *The Commission* 22 (November 1959), 330, 331; Cornelio Ferrer, .Growth of the Rural Church., *The Philippine Christian Advance* 12 (September 1960), 32-33; Jesse E. Posey, .A Historical Study of Baptist Missions in the Philippines 1900-1967.; Terry, .An Analysis of Growth., 74-77, 86. James B. Slack, .Gospel Boom on Mindanao., *The Commission* 40 (February 1977), 26-27; Skivington, *Mission to Mindanao*, 189-215.

hospital received equipment through the US Navy's "Operation Handclasp." From Mati, Baptist pastors began work at Tagupo among the mountainous Mindayan tribe.²⁶³

The denomination also established the Southern Baptist College in M'Lang, North Cotabato. It had been a private high school locally sponsored by a church of 147 members made up mostly of former Convention Baptists who had migrated to the town. They petitioned the Southern Baptists for support and sponsorship. The school emphasized agricultural training as well as ministerial education. It included ten acres acquired for agricultural use. Students raised beans and other vegetables, poultry, and pigs. The produce paid the tuition costs of students. A Baptist Bookstore was set up. A priest in 1960 purchased all of the Bibles and New Testaments in the Baptist Bookstore so that his people could not. The church in M'lang served as a mother church for the Southern Baptist work in the area.²⁶⁴

Baptist work in Manila began with a Baptist Center that opened in 1955. Early work consisted of showing Bible films on vacant lots in the city. In 1959 an English-speaking church began in Pasay City. At first called Emmanuel Church, the name was changed to International Baptist Church in 1964.²⁶⁵

²⁶³ *Minutes of the Philippine Mission of the Southern Baptist Convention 1951-1952* (N.p., 1952), 28- 31; *Minutes of the Philippine Mission of the Southern Baptist Convention 1953-1955* (N.p., 1954), 35; *Minutes of the Philippine Mission 1960-1961* (N.p., 1961), 88; *Minutes of the Philippine Mission 1963-1964* (N.p., 1964), Robert Stanley, .Mati Meets Dr. Davis, *The Commission* 35 (August 1972), 25; Cal Guy, .Some Historical Dimensions, . 41.

²⁶⁴ *Minutes of the Philippine Mission of the Southern Baptist Convention 1953-1954* (N.p., 1954), 29; *Minutes of the Philippine Mission 1962-1963* (N.p., 1963), 40; Posey, .A Historical Study, 156, 168; Terry, .An Analysis of Growth, . 68, 132.

²⁶⁵ *Minutes of the Philippine Mission of the Southern Baptist Convention 1954-1955 and 1955-1956* (N.p., 1956), 45; Mary Saunders, .An Adventure in Publication, . *The Commission* 20 (March 1957), 83; *Philippine Mission of the Foreign Mission Board--Southern Baptist Convention 1959-1960* (N.p., 1960), 20; *Philippine Mission Annual Textual Reports 1961-62*, mimeographed, 14-15; William Wakefield, .English- Speaking Churches Serve Displaced Americans, . *The Commission* 26 (March 1963), 19; *Minutes of the*

In 1964 the denomination purchased property across from Far Eastern University, in Manila's university belt, for a Baptist Student Union Center. By 1967 the Center was reaching 2,722 students yearly, 80 percent of whom were Roman Catholic. It included reading and game rooms, a snack bar and a recreation center. It weathered strong anti-American sentiments and demonstrations, and saw some pro-Marxist students converted. Those who frequented the Center were expected to undergo "interviews" in which the gospel was presented. Of those who underwent these counseling sessions, over three-fourths were converted. Converted students were encouraged to attend Bible studies, and some took further training to reach their peers for Christ and became counselors themselves. Though Baptists suggested that their work was not anti-Catholic, they realized that conversion and baptism often meant cutting off a student from his or her family. In connection with the Student Center was University Church, pastored by Enrique Cabalang.²⁶⁶

Outside of Manila, the Southern Baptists entered Cabanatuan, Nueva Ecija, in 1963 through the efforts of former ABWE-affiliates.²⁶⁷

Although the Convention Baptists had invited the Southern Baptists to enter Mindanao, they were not happy when the Southern Baptists entered the Visayas also. Southern Baptists began work in Cebu City in 1963, with missionaries being aided by two Filipino families who had been Baptists elsewhere.²⁶⁸

In various places the Southern Baptists used radio programs to advance their ministry. By 1965, 15 radio stations in 12 cities carried the "Philippine Baptist Home," a 30-minute program that offered a

Philippine Mission 1963-1964 (N.p., 1964), 57-58; Delcie Wakefield, .Site for Student Ministry, *The Commission* 27 (December 1964), 17; *Philippine Mission 1966-1967 Reports*, mimeographed, 1967, 32.

²⁶⁶ Robert Stanley, .A Place to Find Help, 1-5, and .Center for Students, 6-9, *The Commission* 35 (September 1972); Leland Webb, .At the Center, *The Commission* 39 (October 1976), 18-21; Martha Skelton, .Every Student Hears, *The Commission* 43 (January 1980), 22-23.

²⁶⁷ *Philippine Mission Statistical Report*, mimeographed, 1964, 17.

²⁶⁸ Garvin Martin, .In the Cradle of Catholicism, *The Commission* 31 (January 1968), 18-19.

correspondence course in English and six dialects. In addition, the denomination sponsored the “Voice of Hope” in Chinese on five stations.²⁶⁹

The Southern Baptists had a large budget devoted to the Philippines. In 1950s the annual budget of the Southern Baptists for the Philippines was consistently well over \$200,000. In 1961 the Southern Baptist yearly budget for the Philippines skyrocketed to \$788,000. The mission reduced subsidies to local churches so that the money was not tied up in existing churches and could be used for expansion.²⁷⁰

Not only did the mission invest heavily in dollars, but also in personnel. Various reports found the Southern Baptist churches heavily involved in “men, methods, and money.” This strategy was set by Baker Cauthen, who served as the Executive Director of the Southern Baptist Foreign Missions Board from 1953 to 1979. The Southern Baptists held frequent evangelistic campaigns, targeting several cities simultaneously. One particularly effective occasion was the “New Life” push of 1962-63. It began with meetings conducted by members of the Billy Graham crusade in Manila, Davao, Cebu and Iloilo, which were followed by 64 revivals held in various places throughout the country conducted by 69 ministers, laypersons and musicians from the United States (mostly from Texas). It resulted in over 8,200 “decisions” or professions of faith in the Philippines, and increased church membership. Another “New Life” campaign in 1968 was almost as successful. These efforts bore fruit. In 1954 the Southern

²⁶⁹ Philippine Broadcasting Expands, *The Commission* 28 (May 1965), 29; Howard Olive, .Bible Teaching on the Air, *The Commission* 42 (March 1979), 26-27.

²⁷⁰ *Minutes of the Philippine Mission of the Southern Baptist Convention 1952-53* (N.p., 1953), 32, 43; *Annual of the Southern Baptist Convention* (Nashville: Southern Baptist Convention, 1955), ed. James W. Merritt, 182-183; *Annual of the Southern Baptist Convention* (Nashville: Southern Baptist Convention, 1960), ed. James W. Merritt, 144-145; *Annual of the Southern Baptist Convention* (Nashville: Southern Baptist Convention, 1965), ed. Joe W. Burton, 150-153; *The Commission* 29 (January 1966), 13; *Annual of the Southern Baptist Convention* (Nashville: Southern Baptist Convention, 1970), ed. Clifton J. Allen, 127-129; *Annual of the Southern Baptist Convention* (Nashville: Southern Baptist Convention, 1975), , ed. Clifton J. Allen, 123, 125; Cal Guy, .Some Historical Dimensions, 41; *The Commission* 42 (June 1979), 23; Montgomery and McGavran, *Discipling a Nation*, 71-79; Terry, .An Analysis of Growth, 141-143.

Baptists had 30 missionaries; in 1969, 96; in 1954 there were 23 Filipino workers, in 1969, 140; in 1954 there were 14 churches, in 1969, 145; in 1954 there were 228 baptisms, in 1969, 1,274; in 1954 there were 957 members; in 1969, 12,909; in 1954 the Filipino church raised \$5,000; in 1969, \$150,000.²⁷¹

About one-third of the Southern Baptist missionaries in the late 1960s served as evangelists and church planters, in contrast to involvement in institutional work. But, as missionaries themselves saw, it was difficult for the church to make a transition from heavily involved missionaries to Filipino leaders. Observers noted the American character of the churches.²⁷²

Organizationally, the Southern Baptists first established associations of churches, such as the Cotabato Association of Southern Baptist Churches (1954), the Chinese Baptist Convention (1957) and the Luzon Association of Southern Baptist Churches (1959). The next step was the organization of Conventions, as the Luzon Southern Baptists did in 1962. The Philippine Chinese Baptist Convention was organized in 1963, and Mindanao Convention of Southern Baptist Churches in 1969.²⁷³

Another Baptist group, the Baptist General Conference, with headquarters in Chicago, entered the Philippines in 1949 as the result of an invitation from Ramon Cenit, then pastor of a UCCP church in Cebu. The Baptist General Conference attempted to work within old comity arrangements. They set up work in Bogo, in northern Cebu, and centered

²⁷¹ *The Commission* 24 (April 1961), 121; Baker Cauthen, .Power Was There!. *The Commission* 26 (May 1963), 19; *The Commission* 26 (May 1963), 32; William Wakefield, .Prayers and Plans Fulfilled for New Life Movement., *The Commission* 26 (July 1963), 11; *Minutes of the Philippine Mission 1962-1963* (N.p., 1963), 41-42; Cal Guy, .Some Historical Dimensions., 41; .Follow-Up in Philippines Seeks Membership., *The Commission* 32 (February 1969), 30.

²⁷² C.M. Ferrer, .Southern Baptist Churches .Nationalized., *The Philippine Christian Advance* 13 (September 1961), 12-13, 15; W. Bryant Hicks, .Loyalty Lag, More Concern Both Mark Transition Time., *The Commission* 26 (May 1963), 21-22; William Wakefield, .The Philippines: Compelling Challenge., *The Commission* 32 (August 1969), 20; Tuggy and Toliver, *Seeing the Philippines*, 60; Montgomery and McGavran, *Discipling a Nation*, 73; Orr, .Social Change., 103.

²⁷³ Posey, .A Historical Study., 148; Robert A. Orr, .Social Change Among Religious Change Agents.. PhD dissertation, Columbia University, 1988, 105.

on barrio evangelism, often using tent meetings. They were rurally-oriented, and sought to avoid competition with other Protestants, including the UCCP. Nonetheless, inevitably, the General Baptists started work in places such as Cebu City where other Protestants were already at work. Many of its Filipino workers, including the first national pastor, Narciso Mondejar, and his successor, Andres Pepito, had attended ABWE's Doane Institute in Iloilo. In 1958 the General Baptists started their own Bible college in San Remigio (near Bogu). The school included an agriculture program that encouraged self-support. The Baptist Theological College, as it was renamed in 1966, began offering bachelors programs in 1967. Until 1959 the General Baptists called themselves the Cebu Baptist Association and, afterward, the Baptist General Conference of the Philippines. But growth was slow. There were 29 missionaries but only 600 members in 1967, and 12 organized churches in 1970.²⁷⁴

Another Baptist group, the General Baptists, began work in Mindanao through the efforts of Vicente Silencino. A relative of Silencino, Manuel Bacera, a UCCP pastor, soon joined. Other pastors in Davao and Agusan Provinces also were recruited before the arrival of the first General Baptist missionaries in 1961. A Bible school was established in Davao City. Work expanded to Cotabato. By 1968 there were 40 churches. A split occurred in 1970. The group remaining loyal to the American denomination called itself the General Baptist Church of the Philippines, while those who left called themselves the Association of General Baptist Churches of Davao, Cotabato, Philippines.²⁷⁵

The Conservative Baptists had split with the Northern Baptists in the United States during the Modernist-Fundamentalist controversies of the 1920s. A Conservative Baptist missionary, Beulah Heaton, taught at FEBIAS. The William Simonses, formerly in China, arrived in Manila in

²⁷⁴Posey, .A Historical Study,. 183-195; Tuggy and Toliver, *Seeing the Church*, 93-96; *Protestant Churches*, vol. 2, ed. Guillermo, 41-61. See also Sitoy, *Several Springs*, 2: 644.

²⁷⁵ Catalino Pamplona, *Baptist History for Church Leaders* (Makati: Church Strengthening Ministry, 1992), 329-335.

November 1951, and associated with Grace Christian High School, which had been organized by Philippine- Chinese evangelicals. The Conservative Baptist Board officially decided to enter the Philippines in 1952.²⁷⁶

Simons came into contact with Filipinos trained in the ABWE's Manila Evangelistic Institute who were interested in evangelizing in Laguna Province, south of Manila. An evangelistic campaign in the province in 1955 resulted in five churches by 1958. In the same year, under Leonard Tuggy, the Conservative Baptists opened work to the east in Quezon Province. The strategy was to begin by entering a leading town, then move to surrounding barrios. In Manila itself, in 1959 the Conservative Baptists began Capital City Baptist Church in Quezon City to serve as a mother church to others. The missionaries coordinated with the Filipino leaders who had joined them at the beginning. They organized the Conservative Baptist Association of the Philippines in 1961. Especially prominent, Fred Magbanua became the "co-chairman" of the mission. By 1970 there were 1,534 members and 21 local churches.²⁷⁷

The Conservative Baptists decided to cooperate with other denominations in the theological education of their pastors rather than establishing their own schools. They commonly sent students to study at Far Eastern Bible Institute (FEBIAS) or the Philippine Missionary Institute. In 1969 the denomination's missionaries became active in founding the Asian Theological Seminary, which the Conservative Baptists supported financially.²⁷⁸

Another Baptist group to work in the Philippines was the Baptist Bible Fellowship, which had been organized in the United States in 1950.

²⁷⁶ Tuggy and Toliver, *Seeing the Church*, 88; *Protestant Churches*, vol. 2, ed. Guillermo, 213-236. See also Carpenter, *Revive Us Again*, 28, 43, 205.

²⁷⁷ Arthur Tuggy, *The Philippine Church: Growth in a Changing Society* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1971, 152-156; Tuggy and Toliver, *Seeing the Church*, 87-92; Montgomery and McGavran, *Discipling a Nation*, 81-82.

²⁷⁸ Posey, .A Historical Study, 178-179; Athena Gorospe, .The Simonses. Investing in People.s Lives., *In Touch* (1989), 8.

Frank Hooge had arrived in the Philippines in 1948, working independently, and affiliated with the BBF in 1950. A center of the work was Cavite, where Ernesto Cruz, a convert through Hooge, pastored. The group expanded to Leyte and Mindanao. The Pines City Baptist Church became the mother church of several started in the Baguio area. In 1960 these churches began the Ilocano Baptist Bible Institute at the Pines City Church.²⁷⁹

The Evangelical Free Church started in 1952 in Cebu City. Rev. and Mrs. Gordon Gustafson came in 1952 and settled in Cebu, which became the location of the EFC headquarters, a Bible school, and a Student Center, which the EFC started in 1966. The work spread in the southern parts of Cebu. In 1969 Ismael Manego was elected the first chairman of the EFC Philippines Board. At the time the church had 15 missionaries and only 100 members.²⁸⁰

PARACHURCH AND COOPERATIVE VENTURES

Although the evangelicals berated the ecumenism of the older denominations, they often cooperated among themselves. Perhaps the most inclusive organization of Protestants in the Philippines was the Bible Society. It included groups such as the Southern Baptists that did not participate in other interdenominational activities. By the early 1950s, after the Bible began to be used as a text in Roman Catholic schools, the Philippines saw an increase in the number of Roman Catholics using the Bible. By then the Society no longer employed full-time colporteurs, but sold Bibles in conferences and institutes, and relied on denominational leaders. The Bible Society worked on revising existing translations. In 1957 the first Filipino, Angel Tagluco, became Agency Secretary of the Bible

²⁷⁹ Posey, .A Historical Study, 195-202.

²⁸⁰ Tuggy and Toliver, *Seeing the Church*, 97; *Protestant Churches*, vol. 2, ed. Guillermo, 237, 239.

Society. He took over from a retiring missionary, W. Harry Fonger, who had served since 1933.²⁸¹

In the days right after the war, servicemen and military chaplains sensed resistance within the older denominations to their efforts to evangelize the people. Some of them got together in St. Paul, Minnesota, in February 1947, to organize the Far Eastern Gospel Crusade (now SEND). It was to serve as an interdenominational missionary agency. In the same year it sent its first missionaries to the Philippines. One of their prime endeavors was to sponsor what they hoped would be an interdenominational Bible college and seminary, the Far Eastern Bible Institute and Seminary (FEBIAS). FEGC purchased property for the school in Valenzuela, and began classes in July 1948.²⁸²

FEGC started work in Mindoro in 1951, and spread to other islands, including Marinduque, Boac, and Gasan. It sponsored the Good News Clinic and Hospital in Banawe, site of the famous rice terraces. The Crusade emphasized student work. In 1956 it took over sponsorship of the Back to the Bible Broadcast, which had begun in 1948. Mike Lacanilao served as Managing Director of the broadcast for many years. In rural areas those associated with FEGC organized “Gospel Fellowships.” What started as an interdenominational association became a denomination.²⁸³

The work of the Far East Broadcasting Company (FEBC) was not originally aimed at the Philippines itself when it began in Manila in July

²⁸¹ W. H. Fonger, .Philippines., in *One Hundred and Thirty-Fifth Annual Report of the American Bible Society* (New York: American Bible Society, 1951), 255-256; Fonger, .Philippines., in *One Hundred and Fortieth Annual Report of the American Bible Society* (New York: American Bible Society, 1956), 257-264; Onofre Fonceca, .American Bible Agency Filipinized., *The Philippine Christian Advance* 9 (August 1957), 17; Division of Foreign Missions, National Council of Churches of Christ in the USA, *Report[s] of the Division of Foreign Missions* (New York: Division of Foreign Missions, National Council of Churches in the USA, 1952- 1962). See Anne C. Kwantes, .The Bible Society in the Philippines: The Story of Bible Society Work., in *Chapters in Philippine Church History*, ed. Anne C. Kwantes (Manila: OMF, 2001), 463-481.

²⁸² Tuggy and Toliver, *Seeing the Church*, 21-22, 102-103.

²⁸³ Tuggy and Toliver, *Seeing the Church*, 101-108; *Protestant Churches*, vol. 2, ed. Guillermo, 479.

1949. The goal of its founders, Bob Bowman and John Broger, was to reach into communist China by radio. The daily programs quickly expanded to include, by 1951, almost all of East Asia. By the mid-1950s the station had seven transmitters and was broadcasting in 34 languages and dialects, including a half-hour program in Russian beamed toward Siberia and eastern Russia. FEBC leaders realized that its goals were consistent with US foreign policy. Both aimed to contain “atheistic” communism. Throughout the cold war years the FEBC praised the governments of East Asia that were supported by the United States, including the regime of Ferdinand Marcos in the Philippines.²⁸⁴

The Gospel Recordings ministry arrived in 1949, with Joy Ridderhof and Ann Sherwood. Their intention was to provide the gospel in languages where it was not yet known. They met with H. Otley Beyer, the noted anthropologist, who talked with them about Filipino dialects. They decided to go to the Mountain Province. Apoloo Balonday of Vigan served as both translator and guide to an area where the language was Isung. Balonday prepared scripts for the recordings and also made hymn translations. Once the recordings were made, they were mailed to Los Angeles in order to be made into records. Later Gospel Recordings also worked in the Ibanog and Palanan dialects.²⁸⁵

Very similar to the FEGC, the Overseas Missionary Fellowship (formerly called the China Inland Mission) developed from a non-denominational mission into a denomination. Like several other groups, the OMF came to the Philippines after the close of China, in 1953 and by 1970 had 103 missionaries, from a variety of countries and denominations, in the Philippines. Missionaries sometimes served as teachers in interdenominational schools, or in literature development, but their primary

²⁸⁴ Maribel Villanueva, .Three Men and a Vision., *Evangelicals Today* (July-August 1988), 34-35; Sara Diamond, *Spiritual Warfare: The Politics of the Christian Right* (Boston: South End, 1989), 6-8; Don Smith, .Life at a Missionary Radio Station., manuscript, 1996, 6-7. See also Darlene Sala, *Bugs, Floods, and Fried Rice* (Grand Rapids: Baker, 1978).

²⁸⁵ Susanna M. Barlow, *Mountains Singing: The Story of Gospel Recordings in the Philippines* (Chicago: Moody, 1960), 29, 31, 40, 47, 50, 67-75, 105.

goal was church planting. They stressed lay leadership. Mindoro was their chief area of ministry and set up headquarters at Calapan, on the northern coast, where the OMF missionaries, mostly women, worked among the mountain Buhid tribe. The OMF established the Mangyan Bible School at Mayabig Do, Boco, Oriental Mindoro. With local congregations from other nearby tribal groups in the area, the OMF helped to establish the Inter-Tribal Church Association. By 1970 there were about 1,200 converts.²⁸⁶

One of the OMF missionaries in Mindoro Occidental who worked among the Mangyan tribal people was May Roy, a native of New Zealand, who had served in Kashmir until political situations made it impossible to continue there. She arrived in the Philippines in 1955. At first she did medical work in Mindoro, then discovered that to these people Christianity meant nothing but hand-outs, so, as her biographer wrote, “she steeled herself against the natural desire to attend to their physical requirements, lest by so doing she lost the opportunity to minister to their souls.”²⁸⁷

Nevertheless, she did become involved in a town anti-rat campaign, and helped the villagers to secure better agricultural methods. Roy did extensive evangelism in several villages, and helped to train twenty younger OMF missionaries stationed in Abra de Ilog. She died in an auto accident in 1963.²⁸⁸

One of the original ministries of OMF was literature, and the group established a publishing house and operated bookstores, beginning with one in Manila in 1957. This ministry grew, until leaders decided it was best to

²⁸⁶ Marie Barham, *Onak and the Talking Box* (Chicago: Moody, 1957), 11-14; Tuggy and Toliver, *Seeing the Church*, 109-112; *Protestant Churches*, vol. 2, ed. Guillermo, 561. For OMF work among the Mangyan people see Barbara F. Reed, *Beyond the Great Darkness: Modern Missionary Pioneering in the Jungles of the Philippines* (Singapore: OMF, 1987). See also Franklin W. Allen, *Breaking the Barriers: A History and Model of Church/Mission Relationships* (Singapore: OMF, 1990).

²⁸⁷ Amy McIntosh, *May Roy: Missionary to Kashmir and the Philippines* (London: Oliphants, 1966), 67.

²⁸⁸ McIntosh, *May Roy*, 57-77, 109, 125.

separate the bookstores from the OMF, and Philippine Christian Literature began.²⁸⁹

One of the Filipino leaders active in the founding of both FEBIAS and early OMF work was Ramon Cenit. His life may represent the path that other Filipinos who had been leaders in the older denominations took in the post-war era. Cenit was born in 1903 of Roman Catholic background, and studied for the priesthood at San Carlos in Cebu City. When he transferred from San Carlos to a provincial high school, he came into contact with Protestants. He was “saved” in a crusade in Cebu City undertaken by noted American evangelists William Biederwolf and Homer Rodeheaver. He became active in the YMCA and in the United Evangelical Church and entered full-time ministry. Ordained in 1935, Cenit served the United Church as a church planter. He became Moderator of the Presbytery of Cebu when the UCCP was formed in 1948. He pastored the Bradford Memorial Church in Cebu from 1947 to 1951. The OMF also used Cenit as an evangelist and as a translator of materials into Cebuano, and, in 1961, assigned him to open the Central Bible Training Institute in Cebu.²⁹⁰

In the meantime, Cenit had become acquainted with Russell Honeywell, a missionary working with Youth for Christ. Honeywell was one of those active in the founding of FEBIAS, and Cenit was elected to its Board of Trustees. Honeywell began teaching at FEBIAS in 1951, and began working for the Far Eastern Gospel Crusade in 1954. Honeywell felt that Filipinos should be more active in taking the gospel to the remoter regions of the Philippines. He presented plans for a Philippine mission agency to the staff and students of FEBIAS. As a result, Honeywell formed and became chairman of the Philippine Missionary Fellowship, which other missions as well as denominational organizations welcomed. The first successful PMF-sponsored work was on the island of Romblon. Then it sent missionaries to work among the Mamanwa tribe in Surigao. Within ten years the PMF was sponsoring 30 Filipino missionaries, and had established

²⁸⁹ *Protestant Churches*, vol. 2, ed. Guillermo, 577.

²⁹⁰ Ramon Cenit, as told to Ralph Toliver, *Smuggler's Story* (London: Overseas Missionary Fellowship, 1966), 10-22, 49-51.

18 churches or stations. In 1961 the PMF opened the Philippine Missionary Institute in Silang, Cavite, which used Tagalog as the medium of instruction.²⁹¹

The New Tribes Mission included both Western and Filipino missionaries. It was led by Sigfried Sandstrom and Arsenio Dominguez, who entered Palawan in 1954. Their approach allowed as much of the outward form of the people's previous religious customs to remain after their conversion to Christianity. It operated a missionary training center in Mandaluyong, Metro Manila.²⁹²

President Magsaysay invited the Wycliffe Bible missionaries into the Philippines with the idea of their helping to curtail the spread of grass-roots communist movements in remote regions of the country.²⁹³ The Wycliffe-sponsored Summer Institute of Linguistics had more missionaries than any other Protestant group in the country by 1970. Although the primary work of the SIL was Bible translation, its missionaries pioneered work among the Monobo tribes in 1955 and began independent churches in various localities. For instance, work among the Balongao people in Mindanao began in 1962 and led to explosive church growth.²⁹⁴

Several other missions targeted cultural minorities. One was Philippine Evangelical Enterprises, Incorporated (PEEI), founded by John Sycip. One missionary working with PEEI was Jared Barker, who was typical of some of the missionaries working in para-church organizations. A graduate of fundamentalist Bob Jones University, and sent off by a Baptist church, Barker reached the Philippines in early 1954. He became

²⁹¹ Cenit, *Smuggler.s Story*, 33-44.

²⁹² *Protestant Churches*, vol. 2, ed. Guillermo, 557.

²⁹³ Sara Diamond, *Spiritual Warfare: The Politics of the Christian Right* (Boston: South End, 1989), 183.

²⁹⁴ Joanne Shetler, *And the Word Came with Power: How God Met and Changed a People Forever* (Portland, OR: Multnomah, 1992), 31-32, 123, 145, 150, 155.

involved in a ministry to lepers in Balintawak, near Manila. The ministry involved a rehabilitation program, and taught the lepers to raise their own food. Barker helped to resettle them on government land.²⁹⁵

However, Barker soon came to feel that this ministry was not fulfilling the primary purpose of his being in the Philippines, evangelism. He became acquainted with Anacleto Lacanilao of FEBC, and became involved in evangelistic film showings. He soon became aware of John Sycip and Philippine Evangelical Enterprises. After returning from a furlough in 1958, without the support of an American mission agency, Barker worked under the PEEI to establish King's Institute in Marabel, Cotabato, Mindanao. The Institute taught farmers better methods, and later expanded to include a high school and other ministries among the T'Boli, a tribal people living around Lake Sebu. In the mid-1960s was a church established among the T'Boli.²⁹⁶

Because of organizations such as New Tribes, Wycliffe, PEEI, and others, by 1970, 22 percent of all Protestant missionaries in the Philippines were working among tribal groups, which made up only two percent of the Filipino population. These tribes had been neglected by the older denominations and even the Roman Catholics. The evangelicals figured that bringing the gospel to tribal people fit the Philippine government's aim of their integration into the mainstream of society.²⁹⁷

The Inter Varsity Christian Fellowship began work in the Philippines in 1953 with the arrival of Gwen Wong, who led the work in the country until 1959. Its aim, as elsewhere, was to work with high school, college and university students. By 1959 students who had been reached through Inter

²⁹⁵ Jared Barker, as told to Marti Hefley, *Assignment in the Philippines* (Chicago: Moody, 1984), 24- 29, 32-33, 110.

²⁹⁶ Barker, *Assignment*, 44-60, 82, 100, 113-116, 143, 153.

²⁹⁷ Tuggy and Toliver, *Seeing the Church*, 116-129.

Varsity already were organizing their own programs in various schools. In 1959 Ephraim Orteza became General Secretary.²⁹⁸

In the same year, and with a similar mission, the Navigators began in the Philippines, although it did not officially open work in the country until 1961.²⁹⁹

An evangelical organization that from its inception attempted to be holistic in scope was Christ for Greater Manila (CGF), which began in 1961. Its ministries included evangelism, discipleship, and development, and the group operated a Children's Rescue Home for street children.³⁰⁰

Independent evangelical churches flourished. In 1962 several FEBIAS students and connected missionaries organized the Fellowship of Indigenous Fundamental Churches of the Philippines (FILCOP). It included congregations in Pangasinan, Bulacan and Tarlac Provinces, and opened a school in Munoz, Nueva Ecija.³⁰¹

The Association of Bible Churches of the Philippines (ABCOP) was organized in Tagaytay, Cavite, in 1967. It was the result of the growth and development of local churches founded by FEGC, PMF and OMF workers. An Inter-Fellowship Coordinating Committee chaired by Antonio Reyes led expansion efforts in the provinces south of Manila, and extended to Bicol.³⁰²

A product of FEBIAS was the Philippine Association of Christian Education, which began in 1966. It aimed to train Christian education workers through conducting national consultations, conducting teachers'

²⁹⁸ *Protestant Churches*, vol. 2, ed. Guillermo, 535-536.

²⁹⁹ *Protestant Churches*, vol. 2, ed. Guillermo, 553-554.

³⁰⁰ *Protestant Churches*, vol. 2, ed. Guillermo, 483-484.

³⁰¹ *Protestant Churches*, vol. 2, ed. Guillermo, 527-529.

³⁰² *Protestant Churches*, vol. 2, ed. Guillermo, 27-40.

training camps, and holding national conventions. Its chief motivator was Betty Javalera.³⁰³

FEBIAS did not develop into a graduate-level, interdenominational seminary, however, and some mission leaders began to feel that such was needed for the development of Filipino leaders. To meet this need, in 1969 Asian Theological Seminary began in Quezon City. Various missions that preferred to cooperate together rather than establishing their own seminaries, joined the effort. ATS represented a significant cooperative evangelical venture, and in some ways took the place vacated by Union Theological Seminary when it moved out of Manila to Cavite and failed to attract students or the support of the post-war denominations.³⁰⁴

In the 1960s many of the newer denominations and para-church organizations began to coordinate among themselves and to work together to better evangelize the Philippines. One sign of cooperation was the building of Faith Academy, a school mostly for missionary children, on the outskirts of Manila.³⁰⁵

Another was the formation in 1965 of the Philippine Council of Evangelical Churches. It came as a result of Christian leaders meeting at the First Baptist Church in Manila. They created a Constitutional Committee that met November 23, 1964 at the Fellowship Center Church in Sampaloc. Gadiel Isidro was presiding chairman. They decided on the name Philippine Council of Fundamental Evangelical Churches and called for a National

³⁰³ *Protestant Churches*, vol. 2, ed. Guillermo, 571-574.

³⁰⁴ *Protestant Churches*, vol. 2, ed. Guillermo, 473; Zenet Maramara, 'The First Asian President,' *In Touch* (1989), 12.

³⁰⁵ Elwood, *Churches and Sects*, 37; Averell Aragon, 'Evangelical Unity and Cooperation in the Philippines,' paper presented at the Asia Graduate School of Theology Conference, February 28, 1998. See also Aragon, 'A Study of the History and Development of the Philippine Council of Evangelical Churches and Its Contribution to the Growth of Protestantism in the Philippines,' ThM thesis, Asia Graduate School of Theology, 1999, and Aragon, 'The Philippine Council of Evangelical Churches,' in *Chapters in Philippine Church History*, ed. Kwantes, 369-389.

Assembly, which was held July 9-10 at the Capital City Alliance Church. There were 73 delegates. They approved the constitution and by-laws and set up a 15-person Executive Committee. Conservative Baptist Fred Magbanua was elected Chairman of this committee and President of the Assembly.

The Second Assembly, which met in May 1968, debated whether to drop either the term “Fundamental” or “Evangelical” from the organization’s title. This debate represented differences of theological opinion among the delegates. The issue, as Magbanua expressed it, was whether the Council would be separatist or ecumenical. The evangelical position had been influenced by the 1966 Wheaton Congress and the progress of the evangelical movement abroad. The fundamentalist position was held by Antonio Ormeo. When the delegates opted for an emphasis upon “evangelical” Ormeo and others bolted. In 1969 the name of the organization was officially changed and was incorporated as such in 1971. Florentino de Jesus, a Christian and Missionary Alliance leader, became Executive Director in 1970 and served until 1976.³⁰⁶

The Articles of Incorporation gave five reasons for the PCEC: (1) to provide fellowship among evangelicals; (2) to provide a means of united action; (3) to maintain and defend the purity of the gospel; (4) to provide a representative evangelical voice before the government and the public; and, (5) to encourage member bodies in evangelism, church planting and church growth. In addition, they intended to “engage in holistic ministries by helping the needy and poor in the Philippines to become economically self-reliant and rightly related with God in Christ.” To a large degree these positions were taken in response to the perceived positions of the National Council of Churches in the Philippines. PCEC members believed that the National Council of Philippine Churches had taken Protestantism in the country down a liberal theological path, and the Bible’s inerrancy was central to evangelicals in order to maintain right theological positions. They could

³⁰⁶ Benjamin de Jesus and Deborah Cowles, *A Man Sent from God*, 79-80.

not stand united with Christians who seemed to deny the basis for the authority of Scripture. The Statement of Faith of the PCEC declared the Bible's authority to rest in its "divine, verbal inspiration and its inerrancy and infallibility as originally written; and its supreme and final authority in faith and life."³⁰⁷

Many of these denominations participated in the National Evangelical Association in the United States. That is to say, "evangelicals," as they now described themselves in order to distinguish themselves from denominations associated with the World Council of Churches, or with the National Council of Churches in the Philippines, were "ecumenical" in the sense of desiring spiritual fellowship and cooperation in revivals, evangelism, and prayer. Christian unity, they said, need not be organizational. The designation "evangelical," in their minds, distinguished them from separatist fundamentalists on the right.³⁰⁸

The largest group to join the PCEC was the Christian and Missionary Alliance, which had refrained for decades from joining the older denominations. Others joining the PCEC represented a mixture of Baptist, holiness, Pentecostal and other evangelicals, and included, among others: the Association of Bible Churches in the Philippines (ABCOP), the Conservative Baptists, the General Baptists, the Independent Baptists, the Church of the Nazarene, Free Methodists, the Wesleyan Church, the Assemblies of God, the New Testament Church of God, the Foursquare Church, and the Evangelical Free Church. Non-denominational organizations joining the PCEC included the Far East Gospel Crusade; the Far East Broadcasting Company; Philippine Missionary Fellowship; OMF;

³⁰⁷ Jun Vencer, "The Evangelicals in the Philippines: A Brief History of the Philippine Council of Evangelical Churches (PCEC)," *Evangelicals Today* 21 (October 1994), 25-26.

³⁰⁸ *Protestant Churches*, vol. 2, ed. Guillermo, 1-4; Jun Vencer, "PCEC: The Beautiful Spirit of Being One," *Evangelicals Today* 21 (August 1994), 14-17. Cf. Clyde W. Taylor, *A Glimpse of World Missions: An Evangelical View* (Chicago: Moody, 1960), 22, 118-119.

and Inter-Varsity. For a time, the IEMELIF had membership in both the NCCP and the PCEC, as did the Salvation Army.³⁰⁹

While the moderate evangelicals were organizing the PCEC, another cooperative agency arose among other the more conservative. Organizations related to the Associated Missions of the International Council of Christian Churches, a Fundamentalist group founded by Carl McIntire, rejected the PCEC because it included Pentecostals. Its constituent members included the Association of Fundamental Baptist Churches; the Baptist Bible Fellowship; the Independent Bible Baptist Missionary Board; the World Baptist Fellowship Mission Council; and Bible Protestant Missions. ABWE was the largest group in this organization.³¹⁰

The Southern Baptists and other groups and boards remained unaffiliated with any outside organization.

Evangelicals found additional ways of cooperating for the sake of evangelizing the Philippines and became more intentional in their approaches. The Church Growth Institute of Fuller Theological Seminary organized a seminar on the Philippines that convened in Winona Lake, Indiana, in 1966. Five missions sent representatives: the Baptist General Conference; the Evangelical Free Church; the Conservative Baptists; the Far Eastern Gospel Crusade; and Overseas Missionary Fellowship. A research project followed under Ralph Toliver, Leonard Tuggy, and Gordon Swanson.³¹¹

Another pivotal event was an eight-day All Philippines Congress on Evangelism that met in May 1970 at Faith Academy. It included 300 delegates and observers from 56 denominations —arguably the most ecumenical gathering of Philippine Protestants in the history of the country

³⁰⁹ Elwood, *Churches and Sects*, 37; Elwood, 'Varieties of Christianity in the Philippines,' in *Studies in Philippine Church History*, ed. Anderson, 375-377; *Protestant Churches*, vol. 2, ed. Guillermo, 7f.; Montgomery and McGavran, *Disciplining a Nation*, 117-119.

³¹⁰ Elwood, 'Varieties of Christianity,' 378-379.

³¹¹ Tuggy and Toliver, *Seeing the Church*, i-iii.

to that point. Many of the denominations that sent representatives to the Congress took workable strategies with them back to their areas of responsibility. Philippine Crusades coordinated the Congress under the direction of Eustaquio Ramientos, a UCCP minister. Most of the interested parties had participated in either the 1966 Berlin World Congress on Evangelism or the 1968 Asia-South Pacific Congress on Evangelism, which had been held in Singapore. The Philippine Congress issued a four-page declaration stating that evangelism was the primary task of the church, that the Word of God was central, and that social concern was necessary. Though the delegates expressed their continued gratitude for foreign missionaries, they stressed that Filipinos themselves must assume leadership roles: “We are convinced that the time has come when we as nationals must lead our own people in the task which God has given to the Church in this our land.”³¹²

Out of the Philippine congress, and, in particular, a paper presented by Jim Montgomery of Philippine Crusades, came the “Christ the Only Way Movement” (COWM). Ramientos became the COWM National Coordinating Director, and Philippine Crusades remained a strong player in the program as it developed. It stressed “abundant sowing.” COWM flourished for about five years, and gave way to the “Disciple a Whole Nation” (DAWN) movement.³¹³

Another cooperative venture among evangelicals—initially including several groups outside PCEC such as the ABWE and Southern Baptists—was the Theological Education by Extension movement, which was initiated in January 1973 with the organization of the Philippine Association for Theological Education by Extension. Conservative Baptists were in the lead on this, and Philippine Crusades missionaries took the major responsibility for organizing the Association. Various groups

³¹² Nene Ramientos, “Manila Crusade: Bold New Program,” *Christianity Today* 14 (June 19, 1970), 37.

³¹³ Jun Vencer, “DAWN in the Philippines,” paper presented at Philippine Association of Bible and Theological School, September 12, 1989; *Philippine Church Growth News* 12 (First Quarter 1990), 6.

launched TEE programs, published TEE-oriented textbooks, set up extension centers and appointed national directors. But by 1982, enthusiasm for TEE had dwindled in the Philippines.³¹⁴

CONCLUSION

James Montgomery of Philippine Crusades estimated that two-thirds of all Philippine Protestants were in the “evangelical” (as opposed to “conciliar”) churches by 1980.³¹⁵

To what may one contribute this change of momentum from ecumenical and conciliar groups toward evangelicalism during the last half of the twentieth century?

In the 1960s Douglas Elwood observed that while the older groups were trying to wean themselves away from things American, the younger denominations were finding that many of the common people still were easily attracted to American missionaries. The post-war Protestant groups obviously provided them something older denominations did not. The churches they found gave them a sense of self-worth and belongingness. While the older denominations attempted to minister to families, the evangelistic methods of the newer groups were focusing on individuals, and, Elwood feared, were splitting families apart. While the leadership and organizational patterns of the older churches had become democratic and routinized, the newer groups lured crowds with charismatic and autocratic methods.³¹⁶

Elwood concluded that there were many reasons for evangelicals’ growth: (1) the freedom of religious expression in the country; (2) nationalism; (3) regionalism and isolation; (4) cultural uncertainty, a lack of

³¹⁴ Robert Ferris, .TEE at Ten: Assessing the First Decade of Theological Education by Extension in the Philippines,. keynote address delivered at the 1982 PAFTEE Annual Meeting, February 23-26, 1982.

³¹⁵ Montgomery and McGavran, *Discipling a Nation*, 92. See also DAWN 2000: Kapit-Kamay Hanggang Sa Huling Barangay: A Report of the DAWN Research Committee, 6th National Dawn Congress, 1998.

³¹⁶ Elwood, *Churches and Sects*, 67-74.

power in culture and a search for identity; (5) extreme poverty; (6) an uncritical acceptance of American cultural patterns; (7) the hypersensitivity of Philippine character, which easily led to personality clashes; (8) the non-moral character of folk Catholicism, and a search for standards in living; (9) the spiritual vacuum of the post-war era; (10) the breakdown of Protestant comity in the late 1940s; (11) North American leadership; (12) the expansion of “faith mission” movements independent of regular boards, which maintained the zeal and methods of the older evangelicalism; (13) the transfers of Chinese missionaries to the Philippines; and (14) the presence of US servicemen in the Philippines.³¹⁷

Try as older church leaders might to build cooperation, unity and a spirit of oneness in Philippine Protestantism, Ellwood assessed, Filipinos themselves tended to be schismatic. Pastors were prone to lead splinter groups out or join newer denominations. The very principle of religious freedom in the Philippines, coupled with social patterns, tended to rip Protestants apart from one another.³¹⁸

The Federation-related denominations increasingly emphasized social transformation by political means. The newer denominations remained aloof from politics, but placed the World Council of Churches and its constituents under suspicion for having ties to Communism. The newer groups were not reticent to evangelize Roman Catholics.

Rather than establishing liberal arts colleges, as had many of the older denominations, the younger groups typically established Bible schools and colleges. By 1962 there were at least 65 Protestant seminaries, colleges of theology and Bible colleges in the Philippines. One of the reasons that the older denominations, including the SDA, had been able to produce self-governing, self-supporting and self-propagating churches was that it had allowed its converts to enter the middle and upper classes by providing liberal arts education in a number of fields. Though there were some

³¹⁷ Elwood, *Varieties of Christianity*, 370-373.

³¹⁸ Elwood, *Churches and Sects*, 67-74.

exceptions, including the Southern Baptist College in M'Lang, and FEBIAS, which developed into a liberal arts school, many post-war groups lacked interest in establishing anything but Bible colleges. Among factors was the thought that since Jesus is coming again soon, there was no time for education, and emphasis must be placed on evangelism. Some may have feared the intervention of the government in college education. Meanwhile, unlike the period earlier in the century, the Philippines had developed a number of secular and private universities. This meant that while the younger denominations identified greatly with the poor in the later half of the century, they did little in the matter of education that would enable their constituents to rise above poverty.³¹⁹

Theology remained important. Though the groups that identified with the UCCP deemphasized their theological distinctives, and promoted a Filipino theology not based on Western issues, theological differences remained. Filipinos themselves perceived the Modernist drift of the older denominations. Some of the younger denominations to which they affiliated had been born during the Modernist-Fundamentalist debates. In some cases Filipino leaders sensed a difference in the evangelical positions of pre-war missionaries representing the older denominations and their more liberal post-war successors. They feared a declension in the evangelical message promulgated by Protestant pioneers and saw the younger groups as being closer in theology and in revivalist style to the churches of their childhoods.

Protestantism began in the Philippines as a movement opposed to Roman Catholicism. The dynamics of a "movement" include the fact that it spreads in opposition to the established order within which it originated. A movement requires personal commitment and loyalty to certain beliefs. Members of a movement are zealous face-to-face recruiters of new members.³²⁰ When older Protestants became more a part of the

³¹⁹ Roberts, del Rosario and Dabnet, *Survey Report*, 165-184.

³²⁰ Luther P. Gerlach and Virginia H. Hine, *People, Power, Change: Movements of Social Transformation* (Indianapolis: Bobbs-Merrill, 1970), xvi-xvii.

establishment than opposed to it; when they sensed no great divide between themselves and Roman Catholics; when they could not articulate why they were Protestants apart from being born a Protestant; when they saw no great necessity to convert their Roman Catholic neighbors, Protestantism ceased to be a revitalization movement within the church. Indeed many such Protestants refocused their attention upon the reform of society rather than upon reform of the Roman Catholic Church. This left room for little cooperation between themselves and Protestants convinced that the Roman Catholic Church could not be saved and that true Christians would and should leave it.

The growing older and newer Protestants maintained a separation between themselves and Philippine culture. Members of the evangelical groups were more easily demarcated from the rest of society by how they lived and by what vices they avoided. Far from being a hindrance to growth, such strictness (noticeably seen in such sects as the Iglesia ni Cristo) lured people who sensed their need for behavioral boundaries.³²¹

Almost all older and younger Protestant denominations, including evangelical ones, are holistic in their approach to ministry in the Philippines. They have built and maintained hospitals and clinics, and have set up rural centers. If not, on other levels, they have set up self-help projects and contributed to the poor. At the same time, the denominations with greater missionary leadership have been slow to address larger social and political issues. This has something to do with the vows that missionaries take not to become involved in politics. By their silence, sometimes there is the unwarranted assumption that the missionaries favored United States foreign policy in the Philippines on such as issues as the bases retention. At the

³²¹ As concluded by Robert Kelley, *Why Conservative Churches are Growing: A Study in Sociology of Religion* (New York: Harper and Row, 1972), 78-83, 97-102, 119-125.

same time, Filipino leaders in evangelical as well as NCCP-related denominations have spoken out on various issues.³²² What Filipinos bring to gatherings of evangelicals in Asia is a holistic approach to evangelism. Although NCCP-related denominations have been more prone to address social issues, even among them there has not been unanimity on how the churches should respond.³²³

All Protestants are marginal in the Philippines. On a local level, it is important that the local congregation offers friendship and a sense of belongingness. Whether a member of an “evangelical” or NCCP-related denomination, Protestant churches in the Philippines tend to offer a small group of closely related families and kinship networks existing as enclaves amid the Roman Catholic majority. While there are some economic and educational distinctions between the members of the older and younger Protestant group, family and ethnic relations are crucial.³²⁴

In spite of its marginal character in an overwhelmingly Roman Catholic culture, Protestants in the Philippines remain closer to each other than they realize in emphasizing a Christ-centered gospel, and in their evangelistic, educational, and compassionate enterprises, and yet severely divided. What are the reasons for this perpetuation of division? Theological distinctions, imported through American denominations, remain important. American missionaries created and nourished loyalty to denominations. Though this loyalty often remained based on personal relationships, it helped Filipino individuals and groups to identify themselves in comparison

³²² For example, David Lim, Bel Magalit and Jun Vencer, .Responding to Philippine Realities Today, . *Encounter* 1 (July-September 1984): 6-10.

³²³ Suarez, *Protestantism and Authoritarian Politics*, demonstrates this.

³²⁴ Raul Pertierra, *Religion, Politics, and Rationality in a Philippine Community* (Quezon City: Ateneo de Manila Press, 1988), 153-159.

to each other. Furthermore, there was something fractious in the multi-ethnic Philippine culture itself that lent itself to denominationalism among those who tended to split from the dominant Roman Catholicism.